

TOOL 10 Appraisal Criteria for HIV and AIDS and SRH teaching and learning materials

Guidelines for using the criteria table

Introduction

This guideline will help you to apply the appraisal criteria to assess materials on SRH and HIV & AIDS education.

If the material is part of a set, and is accompanied by a teachers' manual, it is useful to appraise the teacher's manual (using the set for the appraisal of teacher's material) to verify if the two coherently complement each other. In this case, for instance, a learner activity book does not need to include (detailed) instructions if these are included in the teacher manual.

The purpose of the criteria is explained in the following guideline.

IBE uses these criteria to appraise key material included in the HIV & AIDS Curriculum Databank. Completed appraisals are available through the IBE HIV & AIDS website <http://www.ibe.unesco.org/HIVAids.htm> and can serve as examples of how to use this appraisal tool.

Tool 5 of this manual also provides guidelines and work sheets on several aspects addressed by the appraisal criteria (core content and its organisation, teaching methodologies, assessment of learning outcomes, etc.).

How to do the rating?

The rating and the comments you have made, will serve to guide you and other users on the potential use of the material.

The rating system is **from 0** (not at all, or very badly done), **to 5** (very good, very well done).

Please use "**n.a.**", when the item is not applicable or not relevant for this material.

At the end of each criterion assessment, there is a space, in which you should **specify strengths and weaknesses** of the material (in relation to the items with higher and lower ratings). This will help you to fill in the overall evaluation at the end of the process.

The total score and mean score for each criterion will help you to identify the main strengths and weaknesses of the document, and to fill in the overall evaluation.

It is important to note that one will get a better understanding of the quality of the document when looking at the **overall evaluation**.

Basic description of material

- **Country of implementation** For which country was the material developed?
- **Type of material** Please clarify whether the material is designed for use in a formal, non-formal programme, both or not specified.
- **Target group** Please specify the age and level/grade or class of the target group. Mention if this is not specified.
- **Implementation mode** Is the material for HIV & AIDS education included in the official curriculum:
- a) As a stand-alone subject,
 - b) In one main carrier subject (e.g. as part of social studies or biology),
 - c) As a cross-curricular issue (i.e. integrated in a coherent way in limited number of subjects),
 - d) Infused throughout the curriculum (i.e. integrated in most/all subjects included in the curriculum),
 - e) As extra-curricular activities
 - f) Not specified

Implementation mode

There are four main approaches for the inclusion of HIV and AIDS education in the curriculum:

- HIV & AIDS as a **stand-alone subject**, clearly labelled and including all core aspects of HIV & AIDS education
- HIV & AIDS as integrated in **one main carrier subject** containing most of core aspects of HIV & AIDS education
- HIV & AIDS as a **cross-curricular issue**, integrated in a few subjects clearly defined and containing most of core aspects of HIV & AIDS education, in a complementary and coordinated approach
- HIV & AIDS **infused throughout the curriculum**, integrated in most/all subjects included in the curriculum, with, or without any specific mention of HIV & AIDS in subject areas

Extra-curricular activities may in certain countries replace altogether the formal curriculum approach, or they may complement an existing school based program defined by the official curriculum

Overall evaluation - synthesis

This section should be completed once **you have answered all the items raised under the 10 individual criteria**.

In the overall evaluation, you should summarise:

- a) Main strengths, referring to the criteria with higher ratings
- b) Main weaknesses, referring to the criteria with lower ratings
- c) Internal consistency, for example:
 - Did you find *both* language and images to be gender sensitive?
 - Are the contents in line with the learning objectives?
 - Is the students' assessment in line with the contents? etc.
- d) Transferability and/or usefulness for developing/improving one's own material, i.e. can the material be used with other target groups or in other settings. For example, a non-formal education publication can be useful and easily applicable in a formal education setting. Indicate which other target group could use the material and which adaptations are necessary.

It would also be very interesting to consider, in particular when the evaluation is very positive, whether the material could be used (adapted) in another country and should therefore be actively shared
- e) Special features/additional comments: if the material contains special features, original elements or if you want to add any additional comment, you can write them here.

Please also clarify whether the material is useful for your work. Should you be able to make use of the material, please specify briefly which sections or aspects you consider most useful for your work.

Criterion I – Material development

This criterion is not always easy to appraise, because it is not often clearly stated how the material was developed. Ideally it should be explained in the introduction. It is however, an important criterion to assess the quality of a material.

- Material is part of prescribed wider framework: was the material designed to be used as part of a wider (non) formal curriculum/programme?
- Material was developed by a multi-sectorial team: during the development of the material, a variety of perspectives of different actors/fields was taken into account.
- Material was developed in consultation with parents and representatives of the wider community; as mentioned previously influence of the wider community and society affects both (young) people's behaviour and the impact of education programmes.

Education needs to be culturally acceptable whilst also challenging misconceptions and addressing power inequities. As much as possible, a balance should be found between what are crucial skills and knowledge for young

people living in a world with HIV to protect themselves and what is acceptable to the community.

- Material was developed based on theoretical framework for behaviour change; programmes and educational materials on HIV & AIDS and SRH should be developed using a sound theoretical approach, focusing on life skills aimed at reducing risk-taking and building self-protective behaviour.

Criterion II – Inclusion in the prescribed curriculum, time frame and assessment

- Is the material part of the prescribed curriculum: is the program included in the official curriculum? If the program is not mentioned in the curriculum, it will be very difficult for teachers to find time to effectively teach HIV & AIDS education.
- Is the time frame allocated for each lesson or exercise indicated and realistic?
- The topics should be covered in a logical sequence. For example:
 - basic information about HIV and AIDS and health
 - vulnerability factors and the behaviours to reduce them
 - knowledge, values, attitudes and gender aspects leading to these behaviours
 - skills needed to adopt and appropriate these behaviours
- Does the material provide means to assess the knowledge, skills, attitudes and behaviours before and after the lessons?

Criterion III – Goal, objectives and target group

Are the goals, objectives in line with the needs and characteristics of the learners targeted by the material?

Ideally, goals, objectives and the target group of the publication are all clarified in the introductory section of the publication.

Goals

The goal of the material should provide a description of the general purpose and scope of the publication. The goal should also describe in general terms what knowledge, skills and attitudes the material is meant to address.

Objectives

The description of the objectives should give a concrete idea of the intended impact of the material in terms of behaviour, attitude, and knowledge etc. The objectives must help to reach the goal.

The learning objectives should be “SMART”

- a) **Specific:** Linking an objective to a frequency or stating the level of acceptable performance makes the objective more specific. An example of specific objective: “The learner is able to describe 3 ways to prevent HIV transmission”. The objective: “The learner is able to correctly describe ways of preventing HIV transmission” is not specific.
- b) **Measurable:** it should be possible to measure progress towards achievement of the objective.
- c) **Achievable:** the objectives should be achievable with a reasonable amount of effort, time and resources.
- d) **Relevant:** objectives should be relevant to the setting, the target group and the time allocated.
- e) **Time-bound:** the time span in which the objectives are to be achieved should be clear.

Target group

The target group should be clearly defined. If the material is made for a broad group of learners (wide age range for example), it should be stated which part is designed for which target subset.

It is also important to consider the socio-cultural context and the status regarding the probable sexual experience. You do not address the same issues and you do not use the same words if learners are virgins or sexually active.

Criterion IV – Basic information for protecting and promoting health

The information provided in schools (and everywhere!) should be clear, accurate and up to date. Furthermore, it should be appropriate for the age and literacy level of the target group.

The material should not only address the physical and scientific facts. HIV and AIDS education should also deal, in a non judgmental way, with psycho-social aspects of the pandemic, the help and support that people affected or infected may need and the impact HIV and AIDS may have in everyday life.

Besides overall and precise knowledge about HIV and AIDS, it is also important to provide comprehensive and clear information on sexual health and related issues, such as contraception and pregnancy.

It is important to know that several studies have proved the provision of school programs addressing sexual health and sexuality does not encourage (early) sexual initiation nor increase sexual activity. Comprehensive and clear information has been proven crucial to helping learners to adopt protective behaviours.

The material should also address issues on drug use and prevention, because using drugs may increase the risk of HIV transmission.

Injecting drug use presents an important risk when needles or syringes are shared, as blood is a vector of transmission.

Drug use also increases the vulnerability to the virus. The effects of drugs, such as diminution of physical and mental control, impaired judgment and loss of willingness may affect the ability to adopt protective and responsible behavior.

In addition, most drugs being expensive, many people are forced to sell sex, often without protection.

Learners should be informed about the different drugs that exist, the reasons why people use them, and the various psychological, physical and social effects & consequences of drug use. Teachers should be able to recognize the possible warning signs that a learner is taking drugs, and be able to refer her/him to the right services.

The existence of Antiretroviral (ARV) treatment has changed the approach of HIV and AIDS education. Now, it is not enough to only talk about prevention. Access to ARV treatment has increased and raised hopes, high expectations and sometimes misconceptions of their effects. It is therefore crucial to include this aspect in HIV and AIDS education. Treatment education consists of developing knowledge and skills about treatment, so that learners can understand this new issue.

Some practical information should be given about the places where young people can find help and listening, voluntary counselling and testing (VCT), condoms and information on how to use them.

A lot of myths and misconceptions are transmitted about HIV and AIDS. The material should address the most common ones and explain what is true. It is a key element to fight stigma, discrimination and the spread of HIV. For example, some people say that having sex with a virgin girl can cure AIDS. These kinds of rumours are very dangerous and it is crucial to correct them.

Criterion V – Me, my emotions and my relations with others

Children and youth must be prepared to live in a world with HIV and AIDS. Therefore, they should acquire the behaviours, attitudes and skills that are necessary to deal with HIV and AIDS as active and responsible citizens.

They need to know themselves, how to deal with their emotions and to communicate and behave respectfully with the others.

Through the learning of life skills, learners should be able to use their knowledge in everyday life situations, to adjust their attitudes, to adopt values and to translate all those into respectful and protective behaviours.

The material should help learners to improve self management skills, so that they are ready to react in situations of vulnerability. For example: How to avoid undesirable sexual intercourse? How to resist to peer pressure?

Questions related to love feelings and to the various pressures linked to these feelings should also be addressed clearly in the classroom.

Learners also need to know that they can and must ask for help if they have lived a difficult situation. They should also acquire the basic skills to listen and support the others.

Criterion VI – Addressing gender issues

In the early stages of the HIV & AIDS pandemic, infection was predominantly among men. Today this trend has shifted, with women accounting for about 50 percent of the estimated 40 million people worldwide living with HIV & AIDS. Sub-Saharan Africa is the worst-affected region; here women and girls are at least 1-2 times more likely to be infected with HIV than men and boys, with the highest ratio among young people aged 15-24.

Women and girls are more vulnerable to HIV & AIDS infection and impact, for:

- a. Biological vulnerability (worsened by practices such as female genital mutilation and 'dry sex')
- b. Social and cultural factors, for example: women and girls have in general less access to education and to information that would lead them to have protective behaviours.
- c. Political and economic factors, women and girls are generally most affected by poverty and some are forced into risky situations, such as commercial sex work, trafficking, and 'survival sex' in exchange for necessities.

To reduce HIV infection and impact on society as well as to increase well-being of men and women alike, it is crucial to challenge gender stereotypes and remedy gender inequities. Therefore one of the main questions under this criterion is to what extent the learning material is useful in addressing gender issues.

Criterion VII – Promoting human rights and overcoming stigma and discrimination

It is imperative that education on HIV & AIDS fights stigma, fosters solidarity and supports learning about human rights, which equally apply to people affected by HIV (including people directly affected by HIV or AIDS, people who have lost relatives and children who have lost their parents).

HIV & AIDS related stigma and discrimination of people affected by HIV increases the silence surrounding HIV & AIDS and decreases the likelihood people will seek counselling, testing and treatment.

Lack of respect for the human rights of people living with/affected by HIV & AIDS contributes to the spread of HIV and hinders an effective response. When teaching children and young people about sexual and reproductive health, HIV & AIDS, attention should be paid to their own rights, with a special focus on problems of coercion and abuse.

Criterion VIII – Community and culture

The questions under this criterion are aimed to clarify whether the learning material is relevant to the target group in view of the community it is a part of HIV & AIDS education should address the linkage between what is being learnt in school/education programmes and what is believed and taught in the community and society.

Certain social and cultural beliefs and practices can reduce the spread and impact of STIs, HIV & AIDS, and support healthy and protective behaviour, for example strong extended-family systems and social solidarity.

Socio-cultural beliefs and practices can also increase the risk of infection and worsen the negative impact of HIV & AIDS, for example early marriage, widow inheritance, scarification using non sterilised instruments and female genital cutting.

The material should provide the tools to support the learning to:

- Identify myths and misconceptions related to STIs, HIV & AIDS, sexual and reproductive health and rights
- Analyse common community practices and beliefs.

This will help to challenge beliefs and practices that have a negative impact, and strengthen those that have a positive impact on sexual and reproductive health and the prevention of HIV. A balance should be found between what are crucial skills and knowledge for young people living in a world with HIV and what is acceptable to the community.

Criterion IX – Material for learners: learning activities**Criterion IX – Material for teachers: teaching methods****Criterion IX – Material for teacher training: teacher guidance**

N. B. This criterion has been shaped differently for the material to be used by learners and for that meant for teachers and teacher training. Whereas the issues are the same “How to teach sensitive topics and use interactive pedagogical methods” the perspective is quite different for the two target groups, as it is between learning and teaching.

For both learning and teaching life skills, information and basic knowledge is certainly necessary to provide basic facts on sexual and reproductive health and rights, HIV & AIDS. Learners will need to mobilize and apply their knowledge to adopt, or reject, attitudes and behaviours and to be able to learn and apply life skills in real life situations.

However, knowledge is not sufficient to promote or change values, attitudes and behaviour. The opportunity to experiment and practice in real situations is essential for education programs to have an effect on values, attitudes, skills and ultimately behaviours.

In order to deepen understanding, personalise risk and practice self-protective skills, learners should be given sufficient time and space to learn from active observation, role play, group work, individual research, and practice of (problem solving) skills in real life situations and interactions.

In many cases, teachers find teaching on HIV & AIDS, and Sexual and Reproductive Health a challenge. The contents are sensitive and, participatory teaching-learning methodologies need to be applied for this kind of learning.

Material for learners should therefore provide enough time and occasions to practice skills, and material for teachers and teacher training should provide enough advice and guidance, as well as many practical examples of interactive teaching methodologies and exercises. The materials for teachers and teacher training should also provide detailed and clear instructions on the time, the activities and the way to implement these activities.

A teacher should primarily create a safe environment for learners to express and share personal experience, opinions and knowledge. He should also facilitate learning of pupils.

1. Icebreakers and trust building activities

Activities carried out at the start of a session aimed at creating a safe environment for learners and contribute to building trust between the educator and the learners.

2. Classroom discussion/debates/brainstorming

Around a specific issue or a thought-provoking document (including audio/video documentaries), to exchange ideas, learn to listen to others, explore (community) norms and values, express opinions, analyse situations and explore possible solutions.

3. Group work / co-operative project

To learn how to interact with others, practice effective communication skills, deal with conflict, to observe and analyse facts and questions related to a specific issue or situation.

4. Games

To test knowledge in interactive ways, encourage observation and analysis and find solutions to simulated real life situations.

5. Role play

For modelling and practicing skills to deal with possible, complex situations in daily life (e.g. dealing with sexual harassment, advocating safe behaviour, seeking support), exploring social norms, etc.

6. Creative work (posters, songs, story-telling, poetry, theatre plays)

To increase communication with the wider community, to express emotions, to explore self values and concerns, to personalize information, etc. In order to increase the depth of an exercise, it is important that learners (jointly) reflect on what they can learn from e.g. (making) a poster, song etc.

7. Interviews/fieldwork/homework involving parents or the community

To increase communication with the rest of the community; to observe and analyse facts or questions related to a specific SRH, and HIV & AIDS related issue in the community.

Criterion X – Lay out and packaging

User-friendliness of material has a lot to do with format and packaging of material. The material should be a reasonable size and weight, so children can for example, easily carry it around.

The durability and practicality are important, especially as materials will often be used in large groups of children.

The language used should be easy to follow with key words/terminology clearly explained. Finally, images should support and enhance the contents.

RESOURCES TO GO FURTHER

- 1. “HIV/AIDS education: a gender perspective: tips and tools”**, 2002, UNICEF
 - Document available in: [English](#)
 - Website: http://www.unicef.org/lifescills/UNICEF_Gender_HIV.Eng.pdf

- 2. “Girl power: the impact of girls’ education on HIV and sexual behaviour”**, 2006, Actionaid.
 - Document available in: [English](#)
 - Website: http://www.actionaid.org/wps/content/documents/GIRL_POWER_ENGLISH_FINAL_792006_152655.pdf

- 3. “Understanding and challenging HIV stigma: toolkit for action”**, 2003, CHANGE project
 - Document available in English: [Toolkit](#), [Additional exercises](#)
 - Website: <http://www.changeproject.org/technical/hivaids/stigma/StigmaToolkit.pdf>
<http://www.changeproject.org/technical/hivaids/stigma/Additional-all.pdf>

- 4. “The sound of silence”**, 2003, Actionaid
 - Document available in: [English](#)
 - Website: http://www.actionaid.org/wps/content/documents/HIVSoundofsilence_1812006_101429.pdf

- 5. “Treatment education: a critical component of efforts to ensure universal access to prevention, treatment, access and care”**, 2006, UNESCO, IATT on education
 - Document available in: [English](#)
 - Website: <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0014/001461/146114e.pdf>

- 6. FRESH toolkit: HIV/AIDS/STI skills-based health education tools; Basic knowledge about HIV/AIDS/STI, 2004, UNESCO**
 - Document available in: [English](#)
 - Website: http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php-URL_ID=35500&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

- 7. FRESH toolkit: HIV/AIDS/STI skills-based health education tools; Responsible behaviour, delaying sex, 2004, UNESCO**
 - Document available in: [English](#)
 - Website: http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php-URL_ID=35500&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

- 8. FRESH toolkit: HIV/AIDS/STI skills-based health education tools; Responsible behaviour, protected sex, 2004, UNESCO**
 - Document available in: [English](#)
 - Website: http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php-URL_ID=35500&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

9. FRESH toolkit: HIV/AIDS/STI skills-based health education tools; care and support, 2004, UNESCO

- Document available in: [English](#)

- Website: http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php-URL_ID=35500&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

10. “Life Skills Training Guide for Young People: HIV/AIDS and Substance Use Prevention” 2003, UNESCO

- Document available in [English](#)

- Website: http://www.unodc.org/pdf/youthnet/action/message/escap_peers_00.pdf