NATIONAL REPORT
ON THE
DEVELOPMENT OF EDUCATION

PAKISTAN

Ministry of Education
Islamabad.
November, 2008
## Contents

Preface 2

1. **Introduction** 3

2. **Policies and Goals of Education System in Pakistan** 4
   2.1 Formal System of Education in Pakistan 5
   2.2 Administrative and Supervisory Structure and Operation 8
   2.3 Present Scenario of Education in Pakistan 11
     2.3.1 Progress in Various Sub-Sectors Of Education 12
       i. Expanding and Improving Comprehensive Early Childhood Education 12
       ii. Ensuring Access to Universal Primary Education 13
       iii. Increased Access to Vocational & Technical Education 14
       iv. Improvement in Adult Literacy especially for Women 14
       v. Elimination of Gender Disparities in Primary and Secondary Education 14
       vi. Provision of Quality Education 15
       vii. Promoting Higher Education 16
   2.4 Measures to Improve Literacy 17
   2.5 Measures To Improve Girls & Women Participation 19
   2.6 Measures to Improve Quality of Education Since 2005 21
   2.7 Development of New Education Policy-2008 23
   2.8 Resource Mobilization & Donor Harmonization 24
   2.9 Issues & Challenges in Provision of Education 27

3. **Inclusive Education:** 30
   3.1 Concept and Objective of Inclusive Education 30
   3.2 Inclusive Education: The Way of the Future 31
     3.2.1 Practices for Successful Inclusion 32
     3.2.2 Pilot Project of FDE on Inclusive Education 35
     3.2.3 Concept of Child Friendly School 35
     3.2.4 Activities and Achievements 36
     3.2.5 Risk Analysis / Assumptions 36
     3.2.6 Major Policy Issues on IE in Asia & Pacific Region 37
     3.2.7 Inclusive Education in the Context of Education 37
   3.3 Concluding Remarks 39

4. **References** 40

Annex-I: Brief Report Regarding "Inclusive Education of Children with Disabilities" 41

Annex-II: Islamabad Declaration on Inclusive Education 43
The Constitution of Pakistan seeks to provide quality education to all citizens, regardless of their race, ethnicity, gender, and political or religious beliefs. However, like many other developing societies, there are groups and individuals in our society as well who suffer exclusiveness within the ambit of education system. Prolonged persistence of underdevelopment phenomenon has multiplied these groups and people, belonging to various ethnic and religious minorities and living in remote and isolated regions.

In fact, the Government is committed to achieve quality and equity in education system by firmly implementing the concept of inclusive education. It intends to establish a legal framework and policy regime for education sector inline with the philosophy and principles of inclusiveness, reinforced by the political will of the Government.

The recognition of this objective involves a rethinking of socio-cultural paradigm aimed at promoting an inclusive national society. It also requires a shift in the education system, in order to serve as a pillar for an inclusive culture throughout our national life.

The objective of inclusive education will be to support Education for All, with special emphasis on removing barriers to participation and learning for those who are traditionally excluded especially female child, the disabled, ethnic/linguistic minorities, migrants, and many others.

The education system ought to support even those who are enrolled in schools but are excluded from learning, those who are not enrolled but who can participate if schools are made more flexible in their responses and to those relatively small groups of children with more severe impairments who may have a need for some form of additional support. On behalf of the Government of Pakistan, I reiterate our commitment and resolve for provision of quality education to all citizens. Here onwards, availability, accessibility, acceptability, and adaptability will be main pillars of education system in Pakistan to harness the advantages of inclusive education.

Mir Hazar Khan Bijarani
Federal Minister for Education
1. Introduction

Education is key to change and progress. It rationalizes the social, cultural and political behavior of nations, alleviates poverty and improves the quality of life of the individuals. Thus it is the most important factor which distinguishes the nations from the underdeveloped to develop socially, economically, politically and culturally. The Government of Pakistan accepts education as one of the fundamental rights of citizens as well as commits itself to provide access to quality education to every citizen. The government seriously believes that in order to address modern era challenges of globalization, information technology and competitiveness, it is imperative to build a knowledge based and egalitarian society, in which every person gets education without any discrimination on the basis of age, sex, creed, geographic area, ethnicity, mental or physical disability, social status etc.

Although, education is a provincial subject under the 1973 Constitution, yet it has been placed in the Concurrent List, under which the role of federal government relates to bringing uniformity at the national level between all federating units, with regard to education policy, standard for curriculum and textbook development, assessment & examination system, regulatory and institutional framework, educational data collection and dissemination, etc.

According to Article 38(d) of the 1973 Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan, the state is responsible “...to provide basic necessities of life such as food, clothing, housing, education and medical relief for all citizens, irrespective of sex, caste, creed or race...”. In line with Article 37(b), “the state shall remove illiteracy and provide free and compulsory secondary education within minimum possible period...”. In order to perform these constitutional obligations, the Ministry of Education is making utmost efforts to provide education to its citizens and to improve service delivery in education within the available resources.

The theme of this year's Conference "Inclusive Education – The way to the future" is extremely important in the field of education. Inclusive education means that all students in a school, regardless of their strengths or weaknesses in any area, become part of the school community. The inclusive approach maximizes individual growth and builds a sense of community and participation. Inclusive education offers children with special needs a diverse stimulating environment in which to grow and learn. It develops an appreciation that everyone has unique characteristics and abilities. It helps teachers recognize that all students have strengths.

The Government of Pakistan is committed to cater to the needs of all children without any discrimination and will continue to update its policies and programmes to achieve this objective. This national report on the development of education attempts to describe Government of Pakistan’s policies and goals of formal system of education in Pakistan, its administrative structure, present scenario, progress in various sub-sectors of education and measures / interventions made during the last few years to further improve the system and its operation. On the other hand, the report also reflects government efforts towards inclusive education and pilot projects launched, particularly to bring all children with mild mental or physical disabilities into mainstream education institutions of the country at all levels from pre-primary to higher education.
2. Policies and Goals of Education System in Pakistan

Since independence, attempts have been made to relate the education system to the needs and inspirations of the country. All Education Conference was held in 1947 as per directives of the founder of Pakistan Quaid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah. He provided the basic guidelines for the future development of education by emphasizing inter-alia, that the education system should suit the genius of our people, consonant with our history, culture and instill the highest sense of honor, integrity, responsibility, and selfless service to the nation. It should also provide scientific and technical knowledge to build up our economic life. This was followed by the appointment of various commissions, which submitted their reports periodically. The 1959 Report of the Commission on National Education enjoys a peculiar position in the history of educational reforms. There were several other commissions and policy statements up to 1973.

In 1973, the civilian democratic government came up with the 1973 Constitution of Pakistan, which provided that the state shall:

(a) promote unity and observance of the Islamic moral standards;
(b) promote with special care the educational and economic interests of backward areas;
(c) remove illiteracy and provide free and compulsory secondary education within minimum possible period;
(d) make technical and professional education generally available and higher education equally accessible to all on the basis of merit;
(e) enable the people of different areas, through education, training, agriculture and industrial development, and other methods to participate fully in all forms of national activities including employment in the services of Pakistan;
(f) ensure full participation of women in all spheres of national life.

The above-mentioned goals were pursued by various policy documents announced by subsequent governments who came into power from time to time. Each policy stressed on:

(a) Islamic ideology and character building;
(b) the universalization of primary education and promotion of literacy;
(c) science education;
(d) quality of education; and
(e) reduction in inequalities of educational facilities.
2.1 **Formal System of Education in Pakistan**

In formal education system, there are a number of stages, which are illustrated in the diagram in Annexure-I as described briefly below:

Pre Primary Schooling: Pre-primary education is functional and managed in schools throughout the country. Public schools provide pre-primary education as part of socialization process. The students attending pre-primary class are called Kachi. According to National Education Policy, 1998-2010, the Kachi class will be introduced as formal class in the primary schools. The age group for pre-primary is 3 to 5 years. National Plan of Action for EFA 2001-2015 provided recognition to Kachi class as proxy for early childhood education.

Primary Schooling
This stage consists of five classes I-V and enrolls children of age 5-9 years. Since independence, the policy makers pronounced to make primary education free and compulsory. According to Pakistan Integrated Household Survey (PIHS) 1998-99, the gross participation rate was 71 percent in 1999, it was 80 percent for male and 61 percent for female. For urban female, it was 92 and for rural it was 50 percent. The lowest participation rate observed for rural female in Sindh Province that was 33 percent. The net enrolment rate was 42 percent, it was 47 percent for urban male and 37 percent for rural female.

Middle Schooling
The middle schooling is of three years duration and comprised of class VI, VII and VIII. The age group is 10-12 years. The participation rate at middle school was about 34 percent during 2000-2001. Males were 36 percent and females were 33 percent.

High Schooling
The high school children stay for two years in classes IX and X. The Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education conducts the examination. A certificate of secondary school is awarded to the successful candidates. The participation rate at high school was about 22 percent in 2000-2001 of which, 24 percent were males and 20 percent were females. Vocational Education is normally offered in high schooling. There are varieties of trades offered to the students and after completion of the course they get jobs as carpenters, masons, mechanics, welders, electrician, refrigeration and similar other trades. There are 498 vocational institutions with an enrolment of about 88 thousand in 2001-2002.

Higher Secondary Education
The higher secondary stage is also called the “intermediate stage” and is considered a part of college education. Higher Secondary Education consists of classes XI to XII. During two years stay in this cycle of education, a student at the age of 16 years in this stage can opt for general education, professional education or technical education. The Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education (BISE) conducts the examination and awards a Certificate of Higher Secondary School Education (HSSC). According to 1979 Education Policy, all schools were to be upgraded to higher Secondary Schools. Middle sections of high schools were to be linked with primary schools (designating elementary education). This system has
limited success and some problems were experienced. Keeping in view the problems this system is being introduced gradually.

Higher Education
To obtain a degree, 4 years of higher education after 10 years of primary and secondary schooling is required. Students who pass their first-degree stage are awarded a Bachelor’s degree in arts or science, typically at the age of 19 years. In order to complete an honors course at Bachelor’s degree level, an additional one year study is required. Further, a two years course is required for Master’s degree who have completed two years Bachelors’ degree. A doctoral degree requires normally 3 years of study after the completion of a master’s degree course.

Professional and Technical Education
The duration of post secondary education varies in technical and professional fields. The polytechnic diploma is a three-year course. A bachelor’s degree in medicine (MBBS) requires 5 years of study after intermediate stage (12 years of schooling). Similarly, a bachelor’s degree course both in engineering and veterinary medicine is of 4 years’ duration after the intermediate examination.

Madrassah Education
Side by side with modern education system there is also religious education system, which provides Islamic education. These institutions have their own management system without interference from either the provincial or federal governments. However, grants-in-aid are provided to these institutions by the government. During 2000 there were 6761 religious institutions with an enrollment of 934,000, of which 132,000 were female students in 448 institutions (Khan, 2002). Efforts have been made by the present government to bring the Madrassah in the mainstream under Education Sector Reforms. The main purpose of mainstreaming Madrassah is to enlarge employment opportunities for their graduates. Pakistan Madrassah Education Boards are established to regulate the Madaris activities.

Non-formal Education
There are millions of people in Pakistan who have no access to formal education system. It is not possible for the formal system to meet educational needs of the rapidly growing population. Non-formal Basic Education School scheme was introduced in late 1980’s for those who have no access to formal education. This scheme is very cost-effective. Under this scheme, primary education course is taught in forty months. Non-formal schools are opened in those areas where formal schools are not available. Government provides teacher’s salary and teaching material whereas community provides school building/room. There were about 10,000 NFBE schools functioning in the country in 2005, when the project was reviewed. Basic Education Community Schools project has been launched to set up 20,000 non-formal BECS including already functioning 10,185 NFBE schools.

Examinations
Examinations are usually held annually, which are the main criterion to promote the students to higher classes or to retain them in the same class. However, recently a system of automatic promotion up-to grade-III has been introduced in some schools. In the primary classes, examinations are conducted by the respective schools. However, at the end of the fifth year of the primary stage a public
examination is held by the education department for promotion to the next grade. Another examination is held for the outstanding students to compete for the award of merit scholarships. Similarly, the examination in Middle Schools are held by the individual schools but there is a public examination at the end of grade VIII conducted by the Education Department for awarding of scholarships. The Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education (BISE) conducts the examinations of Secondary and Higher Secondary. The degree level examinations are conducted by the respective universities.

**Teachers’ Training**

In Pakistan, there are 90 Colleges of Elementary Education which offer teachers' training programs for Primary Teaching Certificate (PTC) and Certificate in Teaching (CT) to primary school teachers. For secondary school teachers, there are 16 Colleges of Education, offering graduate degrees in education and there are departments of education in 9 universities which train teachers at the master’s level. There are only 4 institutions which offer in-service teachers' training. Besides these, the Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad, offers a very comprehensive teachers’ training program based on distance learning; its total enrolment is about 10,000 per annum of which 7,000 complete various courses every year.

**Private Education Sector:**

Private sector involvement in education is encouraging. The Federal Bureau of Statistics survey (1999-2000) indicates that there are 36,096 private educational institutions in Pakistan. About 61 percent of the institutions are in urban areas and 39 percent in rural areas. The percentage share of private sector in enrollment is 18 percent at primary school level, 16 percent at middle school level and 14 percent at high school level.

It has been observed that most of the private schools select their own curricula and textbooks, which are not in conformity with public schools. Majority of the schools are “English Medium” which attracts the parents for sending their children to these schools. Most of the schools are overcrowded and do not have adequate physical facilities. These schools are usually charging high fees from the students. Most of the schools are unregistered; therefore, in most cases the certificates issued by these institutions are not recognized by public schools. Majority of these institutions are functioning in the rented buildings.

The National Education Policy 1998-2010 proposed that there shall be regulatory bodies at the national and provincial levels to regulate activities and smooth functioning of privately managed schools and institutions of higher education through proper rules and regulations. A reasonable tax rebate shall be granted on the expenditure incurred on the setting up of educational facilities by the private sector. Grants-in-Aid for specific purposes shall be provided to private institutions. Setting up of private technical institutions shall be encouraged. Matching grants shall be provided for establishing educational institutions by the private sector in the rural areas or poor urban areas through Education Foundation. In rural areas, schools shall be established through public-private partnership schemes. The government shall not only provide free land to build the school but also bear a reasonable proportion of the cost of construction and management. Liberal loan facilities shall be extended to private educational institutions by financial institutions.
Despite all shortcomings of private education mentioned above, PIHS survey indicates that enrolment rates in public schools have declined since 1995-96 particularly a large decline has been observed in rural areas. It is generally perceived by parents that quality of education in private schools are better than the public schools, therefore, those parents who can afford prefer to send their children to private schools. These trends indicate that the public education system is unable to meet public demand for providing quality education in the country.

2.2 Administrative and Supervisory Structure and Operation

According to the Constitution of Pakistan (1973), the Federal Government is entrusted the responsibility for policy, planning, and promotion of educational facilities in the federating units. This responsibility is in addition to the overall policymaking, coordinating and advisory authority; otherwise, education is the provincial subject. The Federal Ministry of Education administers the educational institutions located in the federal capital territory. Universities located in various provinces are administered by the provincial governments, but are exclusively funded by the federal government through the Higher Education Commission.

The Federal Ministry of Education is headed by the Minister of Education. The most senior civil servant in the Ministry is the Education Secretary assisted by Joint Secretary and Joint Educational Advisors of each wing. There are 6 wings in the Federal Ministry of Education and each wing is headed by Joint Educational Advisor.

The provincial Education Departments are headed by their respective Provincial Education Ministers. The civil servant in charge of the department is the Provincial Education Secretary. The provinces are further divided into districts for the purpose of administration. The head of the Education Department in a district is Executive District Officer (EDO). Literacy Department functions separately in case of Punjab and Sindh only it is headed by Executive District Officer (EDO) literacy. In the Provinces of NWFP and Balochistan, literacy is the part of Education Department. The hierarchy then runs down to the District Education Officer, Sub-district Education Officer, Supervisors or Assistant Sub-district Education Officers.

At the grass root level (the union council level), Learning Coordinators (LCs) provide academic guidance as well as supervise the schools. The administrative structure has been decentralized under the Devolution Plan. Village Education Committees (VECs)/ School Management Committees (SMCs) have been set up in the provinces at grass root level.
Management of Education System

The country is a federation of four provinces with a parliamentary system, and other territories. The division of responsibilities of the federation and provinces has been defined by the Constitution of Pakistan.

Education is primarily a provincial subject, however being on concurrent list the federal and provincial governments undertake the legislation collectively. The federal government is responsible for policy-making, coordination, and perform advisory role in education. The Ministry of Education (MoE) administers educational institutions located in the Federal Capital Territory, the Centers of Excellence, the Area Study Centers and other federal institutions in various parts of the country. Universities located in various provinces are administered by the provincial governments, but are funded by the Federal Government through the Higher Education Commission (HEC). NAVTEC is responsible for looking after the vocational and technical education in the country. NCHD is covering various sector including education mainly focusing literacy and UPE.

Administration for Education

There is a three-tier system of educational administration in Pakistan-Federal Government (Ministry of Education), Provincial Governments (Education Departments), and District Governments. The administration and management of school education in Pakistan is undergoing significant changes with the implementation of decentralization under Devolution of Power Ordinance 2001, which spells out the role of District Governments in education. Educational administration of schools has been devolved from Provincial governments to the district governments. Since 2001 most of the educational planning and decision-making now takes place at the district level. Local governance has replaced centralized system and distance planning, as well as to ensure civil society participation.

The roles and responsibilities of three main levels of administration of education in Pakistan are as under: -

Federal Ministry of Education

Federal Minister for Education heads the Ministry of Education and is assisted by the Education Secretary. The Ministry of Education has six administrative wings/cell, i.e., (i) Curriculum Wing, (ii) Policy and Planning Wing, (iii) Project Wing, (iv) Training Wing, (v) Administration Wing and (vi) Monitoring and Evaluation Cell. The Joint Educational Advisor heads each Wing. Besides Wings the Ministry of Education has a number of subordinate and attached bodies for its assistance. The major functions of the Ministry of Education are to:-

- Formulate national education policy and to ensure its implementation.
- Coordinate with provinces and other organizations in educational matters
- Develop curriculum and ensure uniformity in education through out the country.
- Coordinate with foreign governments/international agencies
- Award scholarships for professional growth of students and teachers.
- Look after the development of education in the country and provide necessary funds to the provinces.
Provincial Departments of Education

All provinces have Departments of Education headed by Provincial Ministers of Education. The Department of Education is responsible for the administration of elementary, secondary, technical and higher education in the province. The provincial Secretary of Education assists the Provincial Minister. Each provincial department of education has many bodies such as curriculum bureau, provincial institute of teacher education, textbook boards, Boards of Intermediate and Secondary Education (BISE) etc. to carry out various functions.

The provincial governments have assumed new role under the devolution of power. They retain primary responsibility for pre-service professional teacher education and share responsibility for in-service training with the district governments. Potentially, they have an important role to play in ensuring equity, access to schooling, influencing curriculum and ensuring quality.

Education under District Government

The district governments have acquired significantly greater responsibilities under devolution of power introduced by the current regime. Under devolution plan, the responsibility for managing education falls in the purview of district rather provincial government which is used to manage the education from a distance. Now these local governments are responsible for planning and management such as (i) where to locate new schools? (ii) How to finance their construction? (iii) Inspection of schools to ensure the compliance with standards and carrying out the annual evaluation of teachers and head teachers.

Education finance is another key area under devolution that lies with the district government. The Federal share of revenues is transferred to the provinces. The provinces pool their revenues and transfer them to the districts as per the formula set by Provincial Finance Commission. Now it is the district government that decides how much to spend on education vis-à-vis other public services.

2.3 Present Scenario of Education in Pakistan

The government of Pakistan recognized that education is the basic right of every citizen; therefore, access to education for every citizen is crucial for economic development and for poverty alleviation. The present government has given much importance to education sector it has not only emphasized raising the present literacy rate but also emphasized improving the quality of education. The over all estimated literacy rate was 50.5 percent, for male 63 percent and for female 38 percent during 2001-2002. Urban literacy rate was 70 percent and rural literacy rate is 30 percent during the same period. Pakistan net primary enrolment rate was 66 percent (male 82 percent, female 50 percent) and gross enrolment rate was 78 percent (male 91 percent, female 64 percent) during 2000-01. About 45 percent children who enrolled in grade-1 drop out before completing primary education cycle (male drop out 45 percent, female drop out 54 percent). There are about 4 million children of 5-9 age group who are left out of school. The left out includes those children who never enrolled and those who drop out.

Enrolment at primary level was 16.63 million during 2000-01. The gross enrolment at middle level was 34 percent, male 36 percent and female 33 percent in
2000-01. The gross enrolment at secondary level was 22 percent, 20 percent for female and 24 percent for male. The total number of Arts and Science colleges were 916 (male 536 and female 380) with the enrolment of 763,000 during 2000-01. There are 68 universities in Pakistan with the enrolment of 1.1 million. Out of the total universities, 40 universities are managed by public sector. There are 203,439 educational institutions in Pakistan of which 36,096 institutions are run private sector and the share of the private sector is about 18 percent.

The major issues and challenges of the education system include low literacy rate, high drop out rate, wide spread teacher absenteeism, weak management and supervision structure, shortage of trained and qualified teachers specially female, lack of teachers dedication, motivation and interest in their profession and lack of physical facilities. Moreover the curriculum is mostly outdated, irrelevant and does not fulfill the requirements of present day.

**EFA & MDGs**

Education For All refers to the global commitment to ensure that by 2015 all children would complete primary education of good quality (Universal Primary Completion), and that gender disparity would be eliminated in primary and secondary education preferably by 2005 and no later than 2015. This commitment was made at the World Education Forum in Dakar, Senegal in April 2000 and reaffirmed in the Millennium declaration in New York in September 2000. The Government of Pakistan is attaching top priority to EFA. The country has ten year Perspective Development Plan (2001-11) to visualize the long term macro-economic and sectoral growth strategies, Poverty Reduction and Human Development is the priority area of the Plan. Sector-wide development approach covering all the sectors of education has been adopted under the Perspective Plan. In order to address the EFA implications linkage plan focusing on development of other sectors of Education has also been prepared.

**2.3.1 PROGRESS IN VARIOUS SUB-SECTORS OF EDUCATION**

There is visible progress among all the sub-sectors of education, showing gradual progressive improvement.

a. **Expanding and Improving Comprehensive Early Childhood Education**

Early Childhood Education (ECE) is considered a significant input towards the readiness of child for primary education. On one hand, it provides necessary maturation and readiness to the child for meeting the demands of primary education and on the other hand; it positively affects the intake rate and retention of children in primary schools. National Policy of education advocates the holistic development of child particularly from the view point of physical health, psychological and social growth to make it activity oriented, understandable and enjoyable to caution against the danger of reducing it to teaching of three areas i.e., reading, writing and arithmetic. Efforts have gained momentum to integrate early childhood education into the system and also to extend institutionalized educational facilities to throughout in public sector. Pre-school education in both urban and rural areas is continuously expanding in the country.
In order to cater the educational / learning needs of 3-4 year age group children, pre-primary education is being offered under different denominations such as Katchi Class, Nursery, Pre-nursery, Kindergarten I and II. In current education policy 1998 – 2010, a clear-cut policy provision has been made, stating that Katchi class at primary level shall be introduced in all formal schools as apart of effort to improve the achievement of pupils.

Out of 7.8 million children population (age group: 3-4 year), 7.1 million children have been enrolled in ECE program. The overall gross enrolment ratio was 91 percent in 2005-06.

b. **Ensuring Access to Universal Primary Education**

An Ordinance on Compulsory Primary Education has been promulgated in the provinces. The National Plan of Action for Education For All (EFA) are the key efforts to realize EFA goals. However, the pace of development and achievements varies in different regions due to multiple factors such as capacity, trained manpower particularity planners, mangers etc. However, the impact of policies and plans is positive which ensures primary education for all children.

The overall gross intake rate (GIR) has increased to 116 percent in 2005-06. In most of the provinces, the GIR has increased to more than 100 percent. It indicates that system is also addressing over and under age children to provide primary education. The national Net Intake Rate (NIR) enhanced to 93 percent in 2005-06. The NIR ranges between 63 and 117 percent in different provinces reflecting efforts resulting in positive outcomes. The NIR at primary level shows 16 percent increase during last four years with clear indication of its positive impact on net enrolment at primary level in future.

The national gross enrolment ratio (GER) of primary education has enhanced to 84 percent and GER for females increased to 76 percent. The overall GER in secondary education surges to 31 percent in 2005-06.

The Net Enrolment Ratio (NER) in primary education amplified from 57% to 66 percent in 2005-2006 and NER for female increased to 59 percent. The NER in secondary education also registered a gradual increase.

The repetition rates (RR) in primary education (grade I-V) on average diminished to about 2 percent in 2005-06 as compared to 2.8 percent in 2001-02. This decrease reflects success in an attempt to minimize wastage and maximizing survival rate.

The recent data reveals that National Survival Rate of children to grade 5 was 57 percent and for females about 64 percent in 2001-02; whereas it overall increased to 72 percent in 2005-06. The female survival rate in grade 5 also enhanced to 73 percent for the same period. The public expenditure at primary level out of total expenditure on education has increased substantially to 44 percent in 2005-06. The impact of increase in public expenditure is obvious to result in tremendous progress in near future.
c. Increased Access to Vocational & technical Education

Vocational and Technical Education (TVE) in Pakistan has been reorganized to meet the requirements of the labor market and structural changes in the economy as well as to promote life skills. A National Vocational and Technical Education Commission has been formed along with its counterparts in the provinces. Efforts are being consolidated to vocationalize general education and construction of workshops in schools. While developing the new curricula and Scheme of Studies, various technologies have been incorporated. All these efforts are resulting into the increase of enrolment in vocational and technical education.

d. Improvement in Adult Literacy especially for Women

Pakistan has successfully made improvements in adult and youth literacy. In the context of females, their proportion to adult and youth literates is gradually increasing. A large number of new literacy centers and institutions have been established to increase access; whereas existing literacy centers have been made fully functional. Some have been converted to primary schools through out the country. Government has designed an extensive Programme to open 82,000 literacy centers to increase the adult literacy rate further. The adult literacy rate (15+ and over) has been amplified to 54 percent in 2006-07 which reflects substantive increase during the last couple of years. The overall youth literacy rate of age group 15-24 years increased to 67 percent in 2005-06.

The Gender Parity Index (GPI) for adult literacy among the age group of 15 years and above has shown increase to 0.58 meaning that there are 58 female adult literates to every 100 male adult literates. In order to minimize the gender gap special literacy programs have been initiated particularly focusing female literacy throughout the country.

e. Elimination of Gender Disparities in Primary and Secondary Education

Multiple efforts reflect success in minimizing the gender disparity at primary and secondary level. Some regions across the country have made significant progress towards gender parity at primary and secondary education since 2001-02. Gender disparities are gradually narrowing down at all education levels. However, the GPI for youth literacy (15-24 year) remained unchanged at 0.72 meaning that there are 72 young females’ literates to every 100 young males.

The GPI for gross intake rate (GIR) in primary education has improved considerably from to 0.91 signifying that there are 91 females to every 100 males in primary education. The success implies a big boost in the enrolment at all levels in future as well.

The gender parity for net intake rate (NIR) at primary level has also enhanced to 0.91 in 2005-06. The GPI for GER at primary level increased to 0.82 in 2005-06. Even, the GPI of some provinces is close to parity levels.

In secondary education, the GPI for net enrolment ratio (NER) has further narrowed down to 0.77 in 2005-06; however, gender parity has been achieved in Sindh Province with huge margin where GPI stands at 1.07. This increase in GPI
the extent of 0.40 is remarkable achievement in favor of females. The GPI for survival rate to grade 5 has been shifted in favour of females in some provinces as well. The GPI for transition rate from primary to lower secondary has also been gliding towards females.

The percentage of female enrolment in primary education has improved to 43% in 2005-06. The overall percentage of female enrolment in secondary education has been recorded as 42 percent in 2005-06. The overall percentage of female enrolment in vocational and technical education amplified to 38 percent in 2005-06 which was previously at 23% in 2001-02. This indicates an increase of 14 percent by 2005-06.

In the education system, there are more female teachers 51% than male counterparts. The percentage of female teachers in primary education is gradually increasing and credit is to the female teacher recruitment policy at primary level. At secondary level, the female teachers out-numbered the male teachers. The percentage of female teachers in secondary education has enhanced to 58% in 2005-06. In all areas of Pakistan, new female teachers at secondary level are being recruited with better qualifications in order to meet the requirements particularly from quality perspective of education.

f. Provision of Quality Education

School education census is an annual feature for public sector institutions in Pakistan. Moreover, a National Education Census covering all kinds and levels educational institutions in both public and private sectors all over the country was also conducted during 2005-06 for the first time in the history of Pakistan. A National Curriculum Council has been established and National Textbook & Learning Materials Policy has been promulgated, aiming at to review curricula and produce quality textbooks to improve quality of education. National Education Assessment System (NEAS) was also established to conduct learning achievement test through out the country and provides feedback of the system to improve quality every year.

The Government of Pakistan is committed to improve the quality of education at all levels. National Education Assessment System (NEAS) is one of the key programmes of the Ministry meant to improve the quality; of education at elementary level, with the following main objectives:

i) To measure learning achievements of students in grades IV and VIII to raise quality of education.

ii) To develop capacity in education assessment related activities.

iii) Institutionalization of sustainable monitoring system.

Accordingly a few years back, the Ministry of Education initiated steps for establishment of NEAS. The National Education Assessment System with the participation of Provinces, Areas and Two Partner Institutions (namely: Institute of Education & Research (IER), University of Punjab, Lahore & Federal College of Education (FCE), Islamabad will try to achieve the above objectives. The Assessment Centres at the Provincial/Areas level have also been established, key staff has been appointed and all the nine centres of NEAS network have become functions. In 2004,
National Achievement Testing-2004 was conducted in Math, Urdu & Sindhi languages for Grade-IV on pilot basis. National Achievement Testing-2005 was conducted on large scale in Math, Urdu & Sindhi languages and in the subjects Social Studies and Science on pilot basis for Grade-IV. In 2006, National Achievement Testing was carried out in the subjects of Mathematics, Languages (Urdu and Sindhi). Social Studies and Science for Grade-Iv on large scale and in the subjects of Mathematics and Languages for Grade-VIII on pilot basis. In 2007, National Achievement Testing has been conducted in Mathematics and Languages on large scale and Social Studies and Science on pilot basis, both for Grade-VIII. Based on the feedback of testing results, overall education system at primary level is being rehashed.

The idea of offering Pakistan for International level Academic Assessments has been accepted in principle by all. Necessary preparations for this will be made and the country will be offered for this assessment in 2012.

The teachers both male and female possess the minimum required qualification at primary level. To further improve the quality of education, the criterion of minimum required qualifications for a teacher is up-graded to minimum degree level for new appointments. The overall pupil teacher ratio (PTR) in primary education is recorded as 40:1 in 2005-06; which doesn’t exceed the international standards of PTR, however, it varies from province to province with slight differences. Although there is an increase in the enrolment at secondary level education but the overall PTR remained same. Variation in PTR among provinces is attributed to the fact that new teachers are being recruited regularly at this level.

The public expenditure on education as percentage of total government expenditure (Budget) has been continuously increasing since 2000. It has increased from 9.95 in 2001-02 to 12.93% in 2006-07. The public expenditure on education as percentage of GNP is also increasing from 1.79 in 2001-02 to 2.49% in 2006-07. The Public Expenditure per pupil as percentage of GNP per capita for primary level is enhanced to 8.77 in 2005-06 from 4.04 % in 2001-02.

The effectiveness of teaching-learning process depends on the institutional environment. Physical facilities play an important role in attracting children towards education and to create effective environment. Provision of basic facilities to schools is the policy priority which is being implemented throughout the country under education sector reforms. The situation as analyzed reflects positive impacts of actions being taken in this regard. The percentage of schools with improved drinking water facility has increased from 57 % to 69% whereas the percentage of schools with adequate sanitation facilities has been enhanced to 63 percent in 2005-06 under President Education Sector Reforms Program (PESR).

**Promoting Higher Education**

Good quality, merit-oriented, equitable and efficient higher education is the most crucial instrument for translating the dream of a knowledge-based economy into reality. The tertiary sector contributes as well in the attainment of social goals of developing civic responsibility, social cohesion and a more tolerant society. For this reason, to its traditional functions of producing skilled labour force and crafting new
knowledge through research, a third is being added world over, that of service to society. It includes contribution to the innovation process, economic growth, sustainable development and social cohesion.

Judged against this background, the higher education system in Pakistan does not perform well. Its relatively tiny size – only 3.7% of the 18 to 23 age cohort participates in higher education. Even though enrolment in both public and private institutions is increasing rapidly at approximately 30% per year, the gross enrolment ratio does not compare well with other developing countries. Another reason of inadequate quality comes from the lack of specialisation among universities as public universities compete in offering the widest variety of disciplines and spread their scarce resources too thinly. The scale, quality and institutional arrangements of the sector are insufficient to support innovation in the economy or attract high flows of foreign capital to its skill base. The R&D capacity is very limited and there is little culture and few institutional arrangements to achieve knowledge transmission to the productive sector through university-industry partnerships.

The Higher Education Commission’s Medium Term Development Framework (MTDF) 2005-2010, addresses these challenges in a comprehensive way. This development framework combines HEC’s vision for higher education in responding to domestic and global challenges, with the practical steps needed to deliver the HEC’s contribution to the reform agenda. Among other measures, Government has also increased the spending on higher education manifold during the last couple of years.

**Measures to Improve Literacy**

- For promotion of formal primary education, government has taken number of steps such as provision of free education, provision of missing facilities, scholarship for girls, provision of free textbooks and other incentives; revision of curricula etc

- Under Education Sector Reforms (ESR) Program, an amount of Rs.100 Million has been allocated annually since 2001-02 for opening Adult Literacy Centers in the provinces.

- Literacy Initiative for Empowerment (LIFE) Program has been launched in collaboration with UNESCO. LIFE activities include training of literacy managers and teachers, development of curriculum and literacy material, establishment of Community Learning Centers (CLC) and need assessment for literacy for next 10 Years. These activities have been launched and are likely to be completed within stipulated time frame i.e. by the end of 2008.

- The Project titled “Establishment and Operation of Basic Education Community Schools” in the country has been improved in 2007 at a cost of Rs.7000 Million for the establishment of 20,000 such Schools (10,185 existing + 9815 new) and for a period of three years from July 2006 to June, 2009.
• National Curriculum on Literacy has been developed and launched in three areas i.e. Basic Literacy Levels I, II and III; Functional Literacy and Income Generating Skills.

• NCHD under its Literacy Program is running 49960 Literacy Centers at a total cost of Rs. 480 Million while 140,000 more centers have been planned to be opened during next five years.

• Elementary Education Foundation in NWFP has opened 7542 Literacy Centers.

• District Literacy Management and Information System are being established in each district of Punjab.

• NGOs have started projects in Adult Literacy.

Future Programs
National, Provincial and District Plans of Action for Education For All (2001-15) have been prepared and launched aiming at Universalization of Primary Education both for males and females and 86 percent adult literacy rate by the year 2015. As per plan, targets such as access to education, gender equity and equality may be achieved by 2015.

Some of main programs/inputs/strategies planned in EFA Plan of Action inter alia include: opening of new primary schools; opening of masjid/maktab schools; introduction of double shift in existing schools; provision of missing facilities to existing schools; and focusing on school effectiveness and improved quality of education.

Non-Formal Basic Education Programme for Hard to Reach Children
A project titled “Establishment of 82,000 Non-formal Basic Education Community Schools” was launched in 1996-97 throughout the country for disadvantaged and hard to reach children. The project is based on the idea of home schools to be run through Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs). These schools are based on multi-grade teaching with single teacher for class I-V and age group 5-14 years. At present 10,185 NFBE schools are functioning throughout the country with enrolment of 361,747 students. The project is being implemented in collaboration with Provincial Project Coordination Offices through Provincial Education Departments. The project has been revised under new title “Basic Education Community School” to open more NFBE Schools. Graduates of NFBE schools will be eligible to get admission in formal schools.

In view of acute shortage of formal middle schools, it is proposed to open 4,000 non-formal middle schools by upgrading the existing non-formal basic education schools. Allama Iqbal Open University has already launched a non-formal middle school project which is a success story. A thirty-month condensed course and textbooks for grades (VI-VIII) have been developed. Allama Iqbal Open University is already offering secondary education through distant learning. In this way, a parallel
but complementary non-formal education stream from primary to university has been created.

**MEASURES TO IMPROVE WOMEN PARTICIPATION IN EDUCATION SYSTEM**

In the field of education, one is constantly concerned with a number of inter-related aspects ranging from the level of demand for and supply of educational opportunities, to access and participation in education including the quality of the teaching and learning process, internal efficiency of the education system, individual learning outcomes, impact of education on personal growth and the well being of the individual, and ultimately community and country as a whole. Equally important is the concern for equity in education, to study the causes of disparities and their impact on socio-economic development of the individual and overall country.

Gender issues remains significant with reference to different kinds of data sets. At the simplest level one can consider the absolute figures and the absolute difference between the male and female illiterates, pupils, students, teachers, etc. Equally important consideration is given to derive statistics in the form of indicators such as literacy rates, admission/intake rates, enrolment ratios, survival rate to grade: V and so on. At more sophisticated level, one can use specific gender-disparity indicators as well as multivariate statistical methods for the purposes of in-depth analysis.

Owing to positive actions and sensitization campaigns undertaken by governments, recent progress in female enrolment and literacy has helped to abridge gender disparities. However, obstacles and resistance to gender equality in education persist, especially in rural or marginalized areas, where traditional attitudes and poverty are predominant and the education supply is insufficient to meet the demand.

Pakistani women constitute 48 percent of the population. The government of Pakistan is committed to reduce and narrow gender disparity and empower women significantly through education. According to Vision 2030 gender equality and gender justice entails equality of opportunity for all citizens both women and men. Recent government interventions have improved empowerment of women by giving them representation at Federal, Provincial, Local Electoral bodies and in other spheres of life. The Women Protection Bill 2006 is important step in providing them some success.

The Millennium Development Goals Report 2006 also addresses the recognition and emphasizes the gender mainstreaming as essential factor for prosperity. Goal III of the MDGs focuses the inequalities in access to education being faced by females. Consequently a target has been laid for primary and secondary education to purge gender disparity by 2005 if possible and by 2015 in all levels of education.

The current situation indicates that out of total primary school enrolment, 43 percent are females and proportion of female primary school teachers is 45 percent.
At secondary level, the enrolment of females is 42 percent; and about 58 percent are female secondary school teachers.

Following are the major policies and programs which have been undertaken to promote primary education and achieve targets of UPE in Pakistan since WEF-Dakar Conference:

- School education curricula have been revised twice (in 2001-2 and in 2006-7) to make it more relevant, meaningful and gender friendly.

- Under two phases of the Project “Girls Primary Education Development”, 1,700 Girls Community Model Schools have been established throughout the country with improved facilities and quality education, which would result in retention of the students and lead to the achievement of UPE.

- Under ‘Tawana Pakistan’ a school nutritional program, food packages are being provided in girls schools of selected districts of the country.

- For the promotion of girl education, a project is being implemented in collaboration with UNFPA. Under this project existing girl primary schools are being renovated to provide conducive environment for education.

- Under President Education Sector Reforms (PESR) Program primary schools are being rehabilitated by providing missing facilities such as electricity, drinking water, toilets, boundary wall etc.

- To enhance female literacy rate a Crash Literacy Program for Rural Women in Southern Punjab Province has been launched. Under this program 1000 adult literacy centers for women are being established during a period of three years.

- NWFP Elementary Education Foundation started major project ‘Literacy for All’ in NWFP to increase literacy rate especially for women in the province. The project is operational in all twenty four districts of NWFP.

- Scholarships to girls enrolled in classes VI to VIII are being provided in all parts of Pakistan to encourage continuation of education beyond the primary level. Particular emphasis is on provision of incentives mentioned above to girls residing in geographic regions with high poverty concentration.

- Scholarships are also given to the girls to enhance their professional educational qualification to become teachers in their respective areas.

- The contents of education are being made more relevant to the practical needs of rural girls through inclusion of subjects such as agriculture, health and hygiene etc. in the curriculum.
Role of women in other developmental areas are being introduced to minimize stereotypes attitudes in textbooks.

Revamping of science education is a major focus addressing rural areas and encouraging female student to follow science stream through scholarships.

**Measures to Improve Quality of Education Since 2005**

- New Scheme of Studies 2006
- New National Curricula 2006
- National Textbook and Learning Materials Policy and Plan of Action 2007
- National Curriculum for Literacy (Basic Literacy and Numeracy, Functional Literacy, Income Generating Skills) 2007
- Resource Centres in Curriculum Wing, National Book Foundation and provincial Textbook Boards

**National Scheme of Studies 2006**

A new Scheme of Studies for school education developed in 2006 with the main objective to educate future generations to be creative, productive, moderate and enlightened citizens capable of participating effectively in a highly competitive globalize knowledge economy.

The Scheme keeps in view the global changes and societal needs; takes into consideration the emerging trends; and keeps in view the needs of the growing economy and acquisition of required skills and values by the students to address developmental challenges

**Highlights of Scheme of Studies**

- Early Childhood Education (ECE) has been formally recognized and made a part of Scheme of Studies.
- Physical Training, Arts and Craft and Library have been added as Foundational Activities for students to build their personality.
- “General Knowledge” has been included in Classes I-II (Islamiyat, Science and Social Studies) and in Class III (Science and Social Studies) to inculcate values along with skills
- Islamiyat is compulsory from Classes III to XII. In addition, Advanced Islamic Studies will be offered at Classes IX-X and XI-XII. Ethics will be available for non-Muslim students.
- Computer Literacy will be compulsory for Classes VI-VIII after 3 years when the provinces have necessary infrastructure.
- Computer Science will be taught at SSC (both in Humanities & Science Groups) and as a separate Computer Science Group at HSSC level.
- Introduction to Technologies will be an optional subject to provide for technical skills education
- Both Urdu and English languages will be taught from Class I onwards as compulsory subjects.
- Medium of Instruction for all science subjects will be English. Schools will gradually convert to English medium of instruction depending on the availability of teachers.
- Medium of instruction for History and Geography will be English or Urdu.
- Academic Session will consist of 210 school days.

**Curriculum Development**

Ministry of Education started reviewing and updating the existing National Curriculum from ECE to HSSC level in Basic Sciences and Social Sciences in 2005. In addition, Curriculum development for Biology, Physics, History, Pakistan Studies, Islamiat, Urdu, Persian, Sindhi and Environmental Studies were outsourced.

**Status of Curriculum Development**

According to new Scheme of Studies, National Curriculum for 82 subjects is to be developed. National Curriculum for 25 subjects (28 titles) notified in 2006, 2007 and 2008. Curriculum for another 9 subjects is under process with provinces/areas for seeking their concurrence before finalization and printing. National Curriculum for several other subjects to be finalized and notified by December, 2008 is under process of development. National Curriculum for 32 subjects will be notified by December, 2009.

**National Textbook and Learning Materials Policy 2007**

National Textbook & Learning Materials Policy 2007 is developed to improve the quality of education at all levels through provision of better quality textbooks at affordable prices. Emphasis is given to choice and competition factors which are critical to achieve the policy objective.

The new Policy will help to introduce of a well regulated system of competitive publishing of textbooks and learning materials as a part of public-private partnership. It will transform Textbook Boards into competent facilitating, regulating and monitoring authorities which will review and approve textbooks for use in schools in their respective areas of jurisdiction.
Under the new policy, an “Inter-Provincial Standing Committee on Textbook Policy” will be established to regulate operational and procedural issues, and monitor and coordinate further implementation process. It will also formulate a Provincial Committee to select and prescribe textbooks for use in public schools in the respective province or areas of jurisdiction.

The policy envisages increased Federal and Provincial investment in school libraries and school educational materials, teacher resource books and guides, and will provide adequate regular budgets to schools for that matter.

Development of New Education Policy-2008

The education policy formulation remained apolitical in Pakistan and such is not the case anymore. Previously the policies were based on ambitious goals; however, this time the government initiated a process for new education policy formulation through the consultation with all stakeholders, by involving almost all concerned segments of society to develop ownership at all levels.

In January 2005, the Inter Provincial Education Ministers’ conference, inter alia, decided to review National Education Policy (NEP) 1998-2010 in order to respond to the challenges of new era and to fulfill its commitments at international level, particularly Dakar Framework of Action for EFA (2000) and Millennium Development Goals (2001) relating to Education. For the first time, a team of consultants was recruited from private sector for this purpose in Sep 2005 to work in collaboration with Ministry of Education and started National Education Policy Review (NEPR) as per approved road map consisting of three phases viz diagnostic phase, prescriptive phase and policy formulation phase. The broad based NEP review process involved (a) Field visits of selected districts of Provinces, (b) National/ Provincial/ Areas Education Conferences, (c) Issue-based Round Tables, (d) Consultations with key organizations and Parliamentarians.

On completion of first two phases, a pre-policy document titled “Education in Pakistan: A “White Paper” was prepared & circulated for stimulating discussion on major policy issues concerning Education sector in Pakistan. On the basis of feedback/ comments on White Paper from various stakeholders, the Education Policy Document was prepared in consultation with provincial/ area education departments, which is expected to be finalized in near future.

Implementation of education policy has been an uphill task in the past. Now strategy has been evolved to overcome this weakness by shifting responsibility of implementation and fixation of targets to provincial governments.

Resource Mobilization & Donor Harmonization

Progress and prosperity of a country, largely depends on the choices of education made available to its people. Its importance for achieving national goals through producing young minds imbued with knowledge, attitudes, skills and competencies to shape the future destiny of a nation.
This is one of the reasons that Education is one of the top priorities of the Government. The country has ten-years Perspective Development Plan (2001-11) as well as five year plan titled “Mid-Term Development Framework”, visualizing the long term macro-economic and sectoral growth strategies. Poverty Reduction and Human Development is the key area of the plan. Sector-wide development approach covering all the sectors of education has been adopted under these Plans. Moreover, EFA National Plan of Action (NPA) was developed through broad-based consultations with principal actors and stakeholders, whereas Education Sector Reforms (ESR) initiative has already been started yielding positive results.

Resource Requirements:

It is a recognized fact that implementation of all education reforms and plan of actions involve huge financial resources which put heavy burden on resource constrained countries such as Pakistan with its meager and limited resource base. It is evident that EFA, MDG and PRSP targets cannot be achieved if the current level of budgetary allocation as percentage of GDP is maintained. For instance, estimated implementation cost of NPA is Rs. 85,982 million for its all three phases. Despite economic and financial constraints, current regime has substantially increased the education budget since 2001. However, it is estimated that it may manage to bear 30 to 50 percent cost of the NPA from its own resources by further gradually increasing the GNP allocations to education sector at maximum 3.5% during the plan period. The gap in resources for the whole plan period is estimated to be Rs. 253 billion i.e. around US$ 4 billion. In order to furnish resources to fill this gap, the assistance of international development partners for financial support through grant and debt SWAP is inevitable.

Resource Mobilization:

Whereas, Pakistan has increased its domestic financing to three times in absolute terms, it is yet not sufficient to meet the requirements. Therefore, external resource mobilization is critical for the development of education sector.

Donors’ assistance for Pakistan’s Education Sector consists of loans as well as grants; which come from different sources. Loans are received from three multilateral organizations namely: Asian Development Bank, the World Bank and the Islamic Development Bank. Grants are made by six organizations; ILO, UNDP, UNESCO, UNFPA, UNICEF and WFP. Organizations such as AusAid, CIDA, DFID, EC, GTZ, JICA, NORAD, and USAID are also extending their grants. In addition, SCF- UK (a Non-Governmental Organization) is also making some contributions in two districts each of Punjab and Sindh. An Amount of US $ 2191 million has been committed by Donors for promotion of education for the period 2001-2011.

Coordination between GOP and Donors for Aid Effectiveness

Overseas development assistance has substantially increased over the last few years. Currently, a total of eighteen donors are working in the education sector of the country. Various multi-lateral and bi-lateral agencies along with international non-governmental organizations are providing technical, advisory and financial assistance to the Government. Some donors finalize their areas of intervention in consultation with the Government of Pakistan whereas others adopt more of an individualistic approach with minimal or no consultation with the government.
A Strong donor coordination mechanism has been evolved under the chairmanship of Federal Education Minister to bring coherence in donor programs and their funding so as to avoid duplication and overlapping. In order to develop better understanding between donors and MoE, a technical forum called Donor-Education Group (DEG) has also been established. All donors involved in education sector development participate in it. Each donor as well as Ministry of Education appraise the important ongoing activities and initiatives to be taken in near future, so as to bring donors harmonization and aid-effectiveness.

Following three tiers of Government-Donors interaction have been proposed and implemented:

- **Level One:** A regular high level forum which deals with general issues of education policy and governance. It was decided to hold a meeting every six months with provincial representation.

- **Level Two:** A technical working level forum is comprised of Ministry of Education and Donors Education Group which holds joint meetings on quarterly basis. Participants from Donors as well as the Joint Educational Advisor, Policy and Planning Wing along with his deputies to attend the forum. This forum deliberates, works out plans and agrees on specific issues to be addressed by the MOE. The MoE then forms working groups and donors agree and specify the kind of support they would provide - operational or technical. Sharing on progress of donor coordination activities in each province is a regular feature.

- **Level Three:** Working task groups under the responsibility of the Federal Ministry would be identified to pursue the specified issues in interaction with the provinces and other relevant institutions and stakeholders including the private sector. The work of these groups leads to agree on feasible sector policies, strategies, reforms and investment plans.

**Streamlining Role of Donors and NGOs in the Education Sector**

The Ministry of Education has demonstrated concern over provision of financial aid to NGOs, directly by the Donors, and over non-reporting of the NGOs activities, which is creating problems. Therefore, Provincial and area governments have been asked to keep a watch on NGOs and report to the Ministry on their performance. On the other hand, government has discouraged and showed concern over the direct financial aid to NGOs by Donors at DEG Forum. The MoE is also emphasizing on better coordination among the donors/NGOs so as to avoid concentration of donors in one district/area for same activities.

The GOP/MoE has been engrossed all major Donors working in Pakistan to provide technical as well as financial assistance to reform education sector. Following are some success accounts of GOP/Donors interaction:
Germany: Agreement to Debt Swap-1 for Punjab and Debt Swap-11 for NWFP each amounting to Euro 25.564 million. The debt will be written off equal to the double amount spent by the Provincial Governments according to approved projects.

Canada: Agreement to Debt Swap for education amounting to C$ 100 million. The Canadian debt swap funds are to be utilized for improvement of teacher education by all the Provincial Governments.

JICA: Assistance for improvement of educational facilities in Pakistan. Counterpart Funds for “Rehabilitation of Elementary Schools in Pakistan” by providing missing facilities such as drinking water, electricity, toilets, boundary walls, furniture, equipment, teaching learning materials, etc. the total counter value funds are around Rs. 2.9 billion.

UNICEF: The Annual Work Plan for the year 2005-06 has been finalized with UNICEF for its implementation at Federal level at a total cost of US$ 360,000 mainly for improvement of basic education in Pakistan.

Fast Track Initiative (FTI)

EFA-FTI is a global partnership initiated by G-8 through multi-lateral and bi-laterals to accelerate progress towards the goal of universal primary completion (UPC) for boys and girls alike by 2015. The initiatives combine stronger national policies, improved capacity, and incremental and effective internal support. The FTI focuses on UPC as one of the six goals of Dakar declaration and also influences to other MDG goals, gender equity and adult literacy. UPC would be an outcome/output indicated to ensure alignment to international indicators, once baseline and projections are established. The ministry of education along with the provincial government has formally entered the FTI process with donors linking it to coherent Donors coordination, PRSP, education sector reforms and the national plan of action for EFA.

Unfortunately, over the past few years, the response from development partners to the government’s desire to become an active participant in the FTI has been indifferent. After almost two years, the World Bank and other members of FTI donor group restarted negotiations on FTI process in early 2005. In a firm response sent to FTI Secretariat on March 15, 2005, the Federal Minister for Education on behalf of Government of Pakistan re-affirmed Pakistan’s commitment to become an active participant in the EFA-FTI. It was also stressed that Pakistan would like to have a lead donor for FTI to be identified by the in-country donors. Further process is again dormant since then and no reply has been received so far from FTI Secretariat.

However, it is important to emphasize that bilateral and multilateral donors have played a significant role in the development of education sector. Their assistance must continue for all programs that intend achieving equity, access and quality targets across all education levels. The assistance should be flexible and united for Programme support and include both capital and recurrent cost. There must be commitment to providing predictable resources aligned to Pakistan’s Medium Term Budgetary Framework (MTBF).
Issues & Challenges in Provision of Education

Pakistan at the time of inception inherited culture of low literacy and underdevelopment. That is why education was one of the major concerns, which obtained considerable attention even by the Founder of the Nation. The Education Conference 1947 set the direction and National Commission on Education provided guidelines to move forward. The consequent national education policies and plans focused their vision on the development of education sector particularly on expansion and quality of education.

Budgetary Constraints

Allocation of appropriate finances is real litmus test for proving commitment of any government. The Government has increased education budget substantially and is also willing to allocate more money in future. So far as Education budget is concerned, in absolute terms, the budgetary allocations for education sector have increased from Rs. 70 billion (US$ 1.16 billion) in the financial year 1999-2000 to Rs. 216 billion (US$ 3.6 billion) in 2006-07 indicating at least three-fold increase in expenditure on education over the last seven years. However, as the enrollments are amplifying and demand for quality education is ever increasing, more human and financial resources are required. Resultantly, Government must spend at least 4% of GDP to adequately finance the education sector.

The budgetary allocations clearly indicate that expansion in overall fiscal space has paved the way for enhanced allocation to education sector during the last 6-7 years. Assurances have been given in the highest economic forum of the country to increase public spending on education from the existing level of 2.44% of GNP to 4%. The real challenge is amicable division of resources and appropriate and justified allocation to each social sector.

Social and Cultural impediments

The sustained efforts of the government towards the spread of education during the last two decades through image projection, innovative interventions and social mobilization have created sufficient awareness among the masses about benefits of education. Challenge is to provide quality education to all to the masses regardless of income status, gender, location and development. It implies access, equity and quality education to its entire population. Though Gender Parity Index is improving however more efforts and measures are required to remove social taboos and cultural impediments for women participation in all walks of life.

Geographic Challenges

Like many other countries of the region, geographical challenges to service delivery of education for school going children, do exist. However, their intensity varies from province to province and area to area. Notwithstanding the population clusters, the total area of Pakistan is 796,096 sq. km having 156,722 primary schools signifying one primary school at every 5 KM including deserts, mountains, forests, barren lands, having virtually no population. The situation poses the challenge to use formal as well as non-formal modes to facilitate education in promoting education.
Language Issue

Pakistan is a multilingual society with Urdu as lingua franca and English is the official language, used in official correspondence. The first ever National Education Census 2005-06 reveals that Urdu is Medium of Instruction in 65% educational institutions in Pakistan, whereas Sindhi is being used in 16% institutions, English in 10% institutions and other regional languages in 9% institutions. Lack of uniformity in medium of instruction poses certain problems in provision of education.

School Factors

Facilities/ Infrastructure: Government of Pakistan is determined to reduce the current imbalances of school facilities existing at different levels of educational system. A substantial proportion of schools in Pakistan lack basic facilities such as boundary wall, safe drinking water, toilets, electricity etc. The National Education Census reveal that out of total public institutions, 35 percent were without boundary wall, 31 percent without drinking water, 54 without electricity and 38 percent without proper Latrine. In creating effective school environment, these facilities are imperative.

To provide missing facilities in schools the Government has earmarked Rs. 1.05 billion through the President’s Education Sector Reforms (PESR). The amount would be spent on provision of water, toilets, science and computer labs and other facilities. This Programme would continue until all the schools have been brought to a respectable state.

Human Resources: Demographic transition offers potential economic benefits by changes in the age structure of population. Pakistan is among the few countries, which has huge human potential and currently experiencing demographic transition. The working age population has surged to 57% in 2004 and it is expected to reach 62% by the year 2015. At this stage, Pakistan urgently needs to exploit this potential for dividend by educating its youth and transforming into knowledge based society.

Teaching Resources: Teachers play pivotal role in any education system. Quality of education depends on the quality of teachers. There is a need to improve quality of teachers by reforming pre-service and in-service training programs. Among others, Government has initiated a debt swap Programme with the Government of Canada to improve the infrastructure of teacher training institutions and revisit the teacher training programs for provision of quality education in the country.

Risk Factors

Drug abuse can badly affect the youth and young students in the society. It deteriorates the school environment and learning as well. As far as issues related to HIV/AIDS are concerned, it poses no big challenge at the moment. However, HIV/AIDS could be potential challenge in future, for which Government has taken due cognizance. It has launched various programs through Ministry of Education and Ministry of Health to create awareness against the use of drugs and HIV/AIDS. Relevant information has been incorporated in text books for students and special teacher training programs have been introduced. Ministry of Health is running a media campaign to create awareness among the youth and masses at large about the drug abuse and HIV/AIDS.
**Political Unrest & Conflict**

Political unrest and conflict often hinder the progress in the education sector development. Since independence, political unrest is a common feature in Pakistani society. This is further augmented by the recent conflict like situations in tribal areas of the country. Both developments profoundly affected the education sector. Political unrest marked by instability resulted in inconsistency educational policies persuaded by various regimes. On the other side, recent conflict-like situations in some of areas have adversely damaged the educational infrastructure as well as continuation of routine educational activities.

**Child Labor**

The National Child Labour Survey, conducted in 1996 found that out of 40 million children (5-14 years age group) 3.3 million are economically active on a full-time basis. According to the findings, inadequate educational facilities among other factors are responsible for child labor. In response, Government formulated National Policy & Plan of Action (NPPA) in 2000, which calls for progressive elimination of child labor by offering education and skills training to the target children. The ILO's International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) is providing technical and financial support to strengthen the institutional capacity of executing agencies. The Government of Pakistan incorporated elimination of child labour Programme in the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper and Ministry of Education has addressed the issue in its ESR and National Plan of Action for EFA.
3. The Concept of Inclusive Education

3.1. **OBJECTIVE:**

To support Education for All, with special emphasis on removing barriers to participation and learning for those excluded: girls and women, the disabled, ethnic/linguistic minorities, migrants, nomads, and many others

- Those who are enrolled in schools but are excluded from learning
- Those who are not enrolled in schools but who could participate if schools were more flexible in their responses and welcoming in their approach
- Those who live in far off places in deserts, mountains, riversides, coastal areas having no schools in the vicinity.
- The relatively small group of children with more severe impairments who may have a need for some form of additional support

- **Availability:** education must be available
  - the right to free and compulsory education to all school-age children up to minimum age of employment
  - strategies for reaching the un-reached in rural and remote areas
  - initiatives such as mobile schools, boarding schools etc. should be introduced or expanded

- **Accessibility:** education must be accessible
  - progressively expanded access to pre- and post-compulsory education as circumstances permit
  - clearly identify what barriers to education excluded groups face.
  - elimination of exclusion from education based on internationally prohibited grounds of discrimination
  - is education really free? What barriers are there due to hidden/opportunity costs?

- **Acceptability**
  - to set minimum standards for the learning materials, methods of instruction, school discipline, health and safety, and professional requirements for teachers
  - to improve the quality of education by ensuring that the entire education system conforms to all human rights standards
  - Identifying reasons for drop-out/ repetition
Adaptability
- to design and implement education opportunities for children excluded from formal schooling
- adapt the education system to the best interests of each child, especially those from disadvantaged groups
- beyond primary education
- inclusive non-formal education alternatives
- mobile schools for children to migrant workers, adapted curriculum for over-aged children, EP initiatives.

3.2 INCLUSIVE EDUCATION: THE WAY OF THE FUTURE

Educating our children has been a great challenge for all the countries of the world. Education policies have tried to put forward different solutions for providing education to our young children. The education of children from diverse backgrounds and different abilities has been a major task for countries like Pakistan. Different educational initiatives are required to be taken so as to provide the children with the necessary information skills through education. Providing education to all, particularly to girls in difficult circumstances has been a challenge for most of the developing countries and Pakistan is no exception. Children with special needs are to be integrated with normal children so as to provide an opportunity for their integration in the society.

"Inclusive Education is based on human rights standards and principles as defined by international human rights treaties and conventions". Inclusive Education is thus to ensure that all children regardless of genders, abilities, disabilities and socio-economic, cultural and ethnic backgrounds

- are treated with dignity and respect
- have equal access to education, health services, work and all other aspects of life.
- are able to develop their full academic, physical, emotional and social potential.
- have access to learning material in appropriate media and technical devices.
- develop confidence in their abilities, skills and future prospects.

In other words, "Inclusive Education is a school system that responds to the diversity and needs of all learners, and adjusts itself to meet the needs of all children". Inclusive Education School are considered as the most effective means of combating
discriminatory attitudes, creating welcoming communities, building an inclusive society and achieving education for all; Moreover, they provide an effective education to the majority of children and improve the efficiency and ultimately the cost-effectiveness of the entire education system.

According to NBACL's Inclusive Education Fact Sheet October 2002, Inclusive education implies full inclusion of all children in our Education system, keeping in view their diverse needs. It is about how we develop and design our schools, classrooms, programs and activities so that all children learn and participate together. It is based on the firm belief, and on real experience, that all children have value and can best learn in regular classrooms alongside children of their own age. Inclusion also means that our schools help develop positive relationships and mutual respect between all pupils.

3.2.1 Practices for successful inclusion

Inclusive education will be successful if these important practices are followed:

- Accepting unconditionally all children into regular class and the life of the school.
- Providing as much support to pupils, teachers and classrooms as necessary to ensure that all pupils can participate in neighbourhood schools and regular classes.
- Looking at all children for what they can do rather than what they cannot do. Teachers and parents have high expectations of all pupils.
- Developing educational goals according to a pupil's individual abilities while understanding that pupils do not need to have the same educational goals to learn together in regular classes.
- Restructuring schools and classes in ways that focus on individual achievement and student learning (for example, by developing class timetables to allow for more individual attention for all students).
- Having strong leadership for inclusion from school principals and other administrators.
- Having teachers knowledgeable about different ways of teaching so that pupils with varying abilities and strengths can learn together.
- Having principals, teachers, parents and others work together to determine the most effective ways of providing a quality education in an inclusive environment.
- Taking parents seriously - especially parents' dreams and goals for their child's future.

Inequality in education remains a matter of concern for many countries. In limited sense, the term Inclusive to mean "including children with disabilities in regular classroom with children without disabilities" can be taken as its general interpretation. However, Inclusive Education is more than this. It may include children with disabilities in seeing, hearing, physical or slow learners. It may also include all children who have been left out or excluded from the school. Also children who may not speak the language of classroom or have a fear of being dropped out because of their sickness, hunger or not showing normal achievement in the class. Children who do not belong to the same religion or cast may be discriminated on the basis of gender, religion or
cast or may be included in the group of special peoples. Refugees or migrants are also included in the list. Children affected by HIV-AIDS are also discriminated and isolated from participation in the teaching learning process. Children supporting the family and working to earn their living for themselves and the family are also included in the group.

In fact, Inclusive education is an emerging concept in the world. Few countries have integrated the excluded and discriminated group of children in their normal school system. In Pakistan we have special schools for children with Physical disabilities and seeing and hearing impairments. These schools are managed by the Ministry of Social Welfare and Special Education. Teachers/instructors posted in these institutions are educated and trained in the filed of Special Education.

Discrimination on the basis of gender, caste, religion, and ethnic group is normally not done in educational institutes of Pakistan. The religions and cultural values are quite strong and the educational material contains materials, which discourage discrimination on the basis of gender, caste, religion, race, color, ethnicity etc. The educational materials contain the concepts of teaching of our religion (Islam) and Human Rights Concepts. Gender sensitization, highlighting the role of women and non-discrimination on the basis of gender are also included in our school teachings. Pakistan educational materials have already integrated the values and norms prevalent in the society. There is no discriminating material included in the textbooks and other teaching learning materials. Discrimination on the basis of caste, colour and profession is not done in Pakistan as might be prevalent in other countries of the region.

Ministry of Education is a partner in the national initiative on Prevention against HIV-AIDS. A national programme has been launched by the Government. Ministry of Education has endeavored to include the concepts of preventive education against HIV-AIDS. Teachers orientation / training materials (3 manuals) on preventive education have been developed and discriminated to teacher training institutes. Training of teachers at Federal and Provincial levels has also been organized. The concept of preventive education against HIV-AIDS and other deceases including the basic health concepts are being included in the curriculum and textbooks at all the relevant levels. A school health programme is also being initiated to provide awareness about the 'basic health issues. This will help to inculcate positive attitudes towards health and hygiene in our young generations.

Ministry of Education has undertaken an initiative of inclusive Education in order to include the children with disabilities in the regular school programmes and to provide them with an opportunity for learning along with other children at an equal footing. The Ministry of Education (Curriculum Wing) was provided with a toolkit on creating inclusive learning-friendly environment by UNESCO-UNICEF. Its translated version in our national language Urdu has been adapted/ prepared in the Pakistani context, in order to provide our teachers with necessary knowledge skills and initiative. The kit is being used by some of the schools in the country where inclusive education is being practiced. The training manuals on inclusive learning environment known as Toolkit, has six independent kits with the following descriptions:
Toolkit-1: It describes about the concept of Inclusive Friendly Learning Environment what means, the essential elements and how a school becomes an inclusive friendly school. Some case studies of different countries have also been provided.

Toolkit-2: This material highlights the importance of teachers, parents and community relationship in the support of inclusive learning environment The important component of parent’s orientation’s, their involvement and support to the children with special needs has also been highlighted. The role of the community for school management support, which plays an important role, has also been highlighted.

Toolkit-3: It highlights the inclusive learning environment together with the factors, which influence it. The case when students do not attend school has been highlighted. Different cultural and local traditions together with negative attitudes have been highlighted. It also suggests the role and responsibilities of parents, communities as well as suggested modification in our attitudes. The family environment, gender dissemination, cultural differences etc. have also been highlighted in the activity.

Toolkit-4: It provides information about the learning and teaching theory and methodologies. It provides information on multiple ways of learning especially for children with disabilities have been highlighted. Best ways through which children learn including verbal or linguistic, logical or methodological, visual or spatial, body or kinesthetic, musical or rhythmic, inter or intra personnel have all been highlighted. The barrier to learning and diversity in the classroom including gender, disabilities, HIV/AIDS etc have also been included. Making learning meaningful for all through activities in normal subjects as well as using special techniques in the classrooms.

Toolkit-5: This deals with the planning for teaching and learning making maximum of use of available resources. Making modifications and alteration in the available physical and academic resources and adopting different approaches for group work, teaching learning activity etc. This also includes modification in behaviour in the inclusive learning environment.

Toolkit-6: This section provides information about healthy and protected skills for all children. Skill base health education and skill required to protect one self from HIV-AIDS and other deceases. Information on better school food and nutrition programme on healthy teaching are mentioned. The skills required for healthy living have also been included in the activity.

In Pakistan capital city, the Federal Directorate of Education, Islamabad has already introduced a pilot project on "Inclusive Learning Friendly Environment" where children from all diverse backgrounds and abilities are being provided with the required information and training in limited number of schools in the Islamabad Capital territory (more good practices follow).

In order to provide or adopt an inclusive learning environment, persistent efforts are being made to incorporate Inclusive Education core themes /elements in the new National Education Policy. National education system, curriculum, textual materials and trainings are focusing on eliminating the social and cultural discriminations. The school administration shall be taken on board and will be given orientation on the
requirements of inclusive education. The teacher are oriented and trained so as to ensure that all children with diverse disabilities and backgrounds are in school and involved with learning to their maximum capacity.

3.2.2 Pilot Project on Inclusive Education

Federal Directorate of Education, MoE Islamabad in collaboration with International Development Partner (IDP) Norway, Sightsavers International (SSI), UK, and Ministry of Social Welfare and Special Education, Islamabad is running a pilot project on Inclusive Education in 16 mainstream schools (boys/girls) of Islamabad Capital Territory.

Likewise, Education Department, Government of Balochistan and IDP Norway are also experiencing the pilot study of Inclusive Education in the 04 schools. FDE is providing some technical support to Balochistan especially in teachers training for Inclusive Education.

The Project envisages to:

• Develop systems within that enables, accommodates and stimulates effective implementation of education reforms and innovation - To support the efforts of the Government of Pakistan to reach the goal of compulsory primary education for ALL by 2015;
• Develop quantitative and qualitative indicators for inclusive and child friendly educations systems, schools and communities;
• Create and further develop inclusive and child-friendly schools in Islamabad and other areas under the authority of FDE;
• Set up a small number pilot schools for demonstration and research purposes where all the key elements of the three movements [Education for All; Inclusion, and; Child Friendly Schools] are incorporated, and;
• Develop practical research programmes related to implementation of inclusive practices in schools as well as innovation and reform within established education systems.

3.2.3 Concept of Child Friendly Inclusive Schools (CFS)

• Pro-actively inclusive, seeking out and enabling participation of all children and especially those who are different ethically, culturally, socio-economically, and in terms of ability.
• Academically effective and relevant to children’s needs for life and livelihood knowledge and skills.
• Healthy and safe for, and protective of, children’s emotional, psychological, and physical well-being;
• Gender-responsive in creating environments and capacities fostering quality; creating environments and capacities;
• Actively engaged with and enabling students family and community participation in all aspects of school policy, management and support to children.

Prime goal of Child Friendly Schools is to contribute to Education for All in an
Inclusive Setting through quality improvement and co-ordination of all efforts and programmes on integrative, inclusive and child friendly education in Islamabad and other areas under FDE jurisdiction

3.2.4 Activities and Achievement:

This project has geared its activities both towards facilitating and stimulating innovation and reform within the system as well as on practical implementation. A Cell for Inclusive Education was established within the Federal Directorate of Education in 2006/2007. Four School Clusters (with each four pilot schools) have been established to facilitate the creation of awareness, re-orientation and training of principles, headmasters and teachers of schools within each cluster.

- In line with envisaged two visits to first Muslim country- Indonesia and one European country- Norway
  - Sight-Savers co-funded the field visit of two senior education officials from the Federal Directorate of Education (FDE) to schools in West Java and West Sumatra that have participated in inclusive education initiatives supported IDP Norway and IDPN Indonesia.
  - Another group of officers concerned with inclusive education project, performed a study visit to Norway in August 2008.
- The EENET (Enabling Education Network) Asia newsletter is published twice a year. In every issue there is an article from the project in Islamabad. The newsletter is also available online.
- EENET Asia Workshop organized in Pakistan in November/December 2006
- National Workshop on Inclusive Education held in February 2007
- Pilot Implementation of IE initiated in six + ten Primary Schools in Islamabad Training and re-orientation workshops on following topics arranged:
  - Inclusive and child friendly practices in schools/classrooms
  - Classroom management
  - Diversity in the classroom
  - Team teaching
  - Development of teacher clusters
  - Co-operation and co-ordination with itinerant resource teachers
- Joint Research Programme on Inclusive Education initiated in collaboration with six research scholars of Fatima Jinnah Women University Rawalpindi, which is in its final stage.

3.2.5 Risk Analysis / Assumption:

This project focuses both on quality improvement of and collaboration between existing programmes as well as introduction of innovation and reform within established government structures as well as in classrooms and schools.

People are generally resisting change. However, the advantages of increased collaboration, transparency and communication within and between stakeholders as well as quality improvement of existing programmes and education methods/strategies are so blatantly evident that we do not foresee any logically based opposition to the goal, purposes, expected outputs or activities. This will be a win-win
situation for everyone involved.

Furthermore, the goal and activities of the institutional cooperation between IDP and FDE will result in a more, optimal use of existing human, financial and infrastructural resources which will enable the Government of Pakistan to reach its target [commitment] of Education for ALL earlier than it otherwise would.

Most activities will focus on changing practices and methods and do not involve major investments in expensive and complicated equipment needing regular maintenance, spare parts, additional staff and other running costs, therefore the sustainability of key activities and programmes will not be influenced by possible lack of additional funding.

The main risk to the sustainability and further development of the results / output of the planned co-operation between FDE, IDP Norway and Sightsavers International UK will be of more political character. Should government priorities shift dramatically or the priorities of individuals within the system it will influence the further development of the innovation and reform introduced during the co-operation [2006 to 2009].

3.2.6 Major Policy Issues on Inclusive Education in Asia & Pacific Region

- Sensitization of parliamentarians, policymakers, implementers, educationists, parents of special children, media and general public
- Policy for Head Teachers & Teachers training on Inclusive Education.
- Exchange visit programme of expert in Asia & pacific regions.
- Initiation of modification in physical environment of Schools to make them accessible for children with disabilities.
- Development of curriculum, textbooks and modification in the assessment and examination system.
- Inclusive Education should be the part of National Education Policy of the Country.
- Coordination among the stakeholders.
- Coordination among various countries of Asia & Pacific regions.
- Sharing of experiences of Asian Countries through International Seminars and Conferences.
- Highlighting success stories in various Asian Countries.

3.2.7 Inclusive Education in the Context of Special Education

An Inclusive Education System with regard to Special Education implies that children with disabilities should have access to quality education in neighborhood schools attended by non-disabled siblings and peers.

Inclusive Education is not a matter of disability; but rather an issue of being a fundamental right of every child to receive education as part of National Policy of
Education - 1998, National Policy for Persons with Disabilities - 2002 and achieving the Millennium Development Goals. The Inclusive Development Programme needs to be embedded in the general education system with the support of professionals trained in special education.

Government of Pakistan is making serious efforts to move towards the globally agreed Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) relating to primary education for all children. In addition, efforts are being made for increasing the base of human development for socio-economic growth for enhancing the quality of life and reducing poverty. In this context, education of all children and young persons with disability becomes a right-based goal just like any normal child.

Equal education opportunity implies access at par with other children and young persons. The goal of equal opportunities cannot be achieved only through limited number of Special Education Centers established by the Directorate General of Special Education, Ministry of Social Welfare & Special Education, Provincial Governments and NGOs. It is also not required to establish such Centers for all challenged children since educational needs to over 90 percent such children can only be met in regular general schools. This can be achieved through a Policy, proper planning, providing necessary equipment, trained teachers and accessibility. A Pilot Project (2003-04 to 2007-08) has been completed in 14 Normal schools of four provinces including Federally Administered Northern Area & Azad Jammu & Kashmir. Salient features at a glance of this project may be seen at Annex -A.

The National Policy of Education 1998 envisaged about Inclusive Education and National Policy for Persons with Disabilities 2002 also states about provision of education for such children and adults. During first week of January 2004, Government of Pakistan - Ministry of Education in cooperation with UNESCO hosted a series of Sub-Regional Meetings of Ministers of Tehran Cluster group on "EFA Planning", "Early Childhood Education" as well as on "Inclusive Education" culminating on Joint Declarations. Another National Consultation on Inclusive Education was arranged at Islamabad on 27th April 2005, which concluded by adopting a joint declarations called "Islamabad Declaration on Inclusive Education" (Annex- B).

The issue today is not whether most of the children and young persons with disabilities can be educated in general schools, the issue is how it should be done. Ministry of Education and Directorate General of Special Education (DGSE) are confident that experts from UNESCO will be able to accomplish this gigantic task by virtue of their knowledge and rich experience. Pakistan will be grateful for joining us in pursuing this noble cause.

DGSE is making efforts to provide by 2025 an environment, at grassroots level that would allow full realization of the potential of persons with disabilities through their inclusive mainstreaming and providing them full support of the government, private sector and civil society. The National Plan of Action to implement the National Policy for Persons with Disabilities has been finalized. The NPA is focused for actions to be taken in the next five years. However, recommendations up to 2025 have been made. It is based on the philosophy that access, inclusion and equalization of opportunities for persons with disabilities cannot be achieved by isolated interventions
3.3 Concluding Remarks

Inclusive education means that all students in a school, regardless of their strengths or weaknesses in any area, become part of the school community. The theme of this year’s International Conference "Inclusive Education – The way to the future" is an important and challenging task in the field of education.

The Government of Pakistan is committed to cater to the needs of all children without any discrimination. All relevant Ministries and Departments in the country are required to providing the required knowledge, skills and values through educational system, both formal and informal education. MoE has already started a pilot project in Islamabad Capital on Inclusive Education for Children with Disabilities in 16 regular boys/girls schools setup for visually impaired, hearing impaired and physical impaired. (Mild to Moderate). Ramps including accessibility to washroom have been made in these schools.

Inclusive Education shall ensure to achieving the goal for increasing school attendance and retention rates resulting in less dropouts on the basis of disabilities and discriminations. Exclusion and socio cultural discrimination, which limits the integration of the children with diverse background and abilities, is to be given away. There is a need for Pakistan to adopt this approach and to build our policy on the experiences gained over many years by different countries working in the field of inclusive education. We needs to built strategies and policies on the successful adopted practices by other countries, organizations and individual working in the area of inclusive education.

The Government of Pakistan is also cognizant of the fact that we need to intensify our efforts for exchange of expertise and material at the regional and global level to benefit in the area of inclusive education. We must join hands, share experiences and provide support to fully implement the principles of inclusive education. This will surely lead our way to the future by making every individual citizen a contributor to the national development.

* * * * *
References


The New Brunswick Association for Community Living (NBACL), *INCLUSIVE EDUCATION FACT SHEET October 2002* (downloaded from: www.nbacl.nb.ca/reports-docs)
**Objectives of the Inclusive Education.**

i) To establish Inclusive education System for Children with Disabilities in regular schools setup.

ii) To create awareness and motivation in the teachers of regular education system, parents and the community for education and intellectual development of the children with disabilities through inclusive education.

iii) To provide special education facilities for children with disabilities in the selected schools in cost effective manner with easy accessibility approach.

1. Date of Commencement 2003-2004
2. No of Normal Schools 14
3. Location of Schools. Islamabad, Lahore, Hyderabad, Sukkur, Peshawar, Quetta, Muzaffarabad (AJK) and Gilgit (NA)
4. Disabilities covered Visually Impaired, Hearing Impaired and Physical Impaired. (Mild to Moderate).
5. No of Enrolled Special Children 227.
Rs.10.000Million for Year 2008-2009.
7. Seminars/Workshops 50 Seminars/Workshops Conducted at Lahore, Sukkur, Hyderabad, Karachi, Quetta, Mardan, Peshawar, Muzaffarabad (AJK) Gilgit (NA) & Islamabad.
8. Achievements
   i) Equipment & Furniture. Equipment & Furniture provided to 14 schools like Braille Machines, Wheel chairs, Crutches, Low vision aids, Braille Slates, Writing frames, Tape recorders, Specially designed furniture etc.
   ii) Accessibility Ramps including accessibility to Washroom will be made ensure during the financial year 2007-2008.
   iii) Post Graduate Diploma in Inclusive Education Department of Special Education University of Karachi started diploma classes in 2008, Aga Khan University Karachi has started a certificate course on Inclusive Education.
iv) Islamabad Declaration on Inclusive Education. National & International Organizations on Inclusive Education held in Islamabad agreed upon "declaration on inclusive education".

v) Starting of Inclusive Education in Schools
   a) City District Govt. Lahore.
   b) Northern Areas.
   c) 24 District of NWFP.
   d) All District of AJK.
   e) Federal Directorate of Education, Islamabad (Singed Memorandum of Understanding).

vi) Training 1100 Teachers/Stake holder were trained from Normal & Special Education setup.

vii) Community Education Sensitized mass community through publication literature and leaflets regarding importance of Inclusive Education.

9. **Future Plan/Policy** **Salient feature**

i) Establishment of Hic Center for Inclusive Education At Mirpur Khas, Sindh & Turbat (KECH) Balochistan during Current financial Year 2008-2009.

ii) PC-Ion Inclusive. Education Prepared Inclusive Education will be started in 41 districts all over Pakistan at a cost of Rs.536.128 million.
Islamabad Declaration on Inclusive Education

Allah says in the Holy Qur'an:

Surely we created men of the best stature. [Surah 95: Ayeh 4]; and

He created the heavens and the earth with truth, and He shaped you and made good your shapes, and unto Him is the journeying. [Surah 64: Ayeh 3]; and

And when thy Lord said unto the angels: Lo! I am about to place a viceroy in the earth. [Surah 2: Ayeh 30]

We recognise that all children have equal right to freedom of expression, quality education and have access to a safe and healthy environment; in accordance with the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan [1973]; to have full rights and obligation as citizens as confirmed in; the UN Declaration of Human Rights [1948], reinforced by the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child [1989], World Declaration on Education for All [1990], UN Standard Rules on Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities [1993], Salamanca Statement and Framework for Action [1994], Dakar Framework for Action [2000], UN Millennium Development Goals [2001] and the National Policy for Persons with Disabilities [2002] guarantee the rights of all children, both with and without disabilities, to obtain quality education adapted to their individual needs, abilities and aspiration and full and equal participation in all other aspects of life.

Therefore we, the participants at the National Consultation on Inclusive Education held in Islamabad, Pakistan on 27th April 2005 urge the federal, provincial and district governments, education institutions, schools, parents, religious institutions, nongovernmental organisations, organisations of/for persons with disabilities, donor community, business community and the society at large to:
1. Ensure that all children regardless of gender, abilities, disabilities and socio-economic, cultural, and ethnic backgrounds:

- are treated with dignity and respect;
- have equal access to education, health services, work and all other aspects of life;
- are enabled to develop their full academic, physical, emotional and social potential;
- have access to learning material in appropriate media and technical devices; and
- develop confidence in their own abilities, skills and future prospects.

2. Design federal and provincial policies, Plans of Action and provide sufficient resources to match with the development and comprehensive implementation of inclusive education in all public and private schools throughout Pakistan.

3. Develop and implement a coordinated mechanism between federal, provincial and district governments, institutions under the Ministry of Education, the Ministry of Social Welfare and Special Education and the Higher Education Commission [HEC]. All efforts should be made in the line with the National Plan of Action [NPA].

4. Develop inclusive, child- and learning friendly environments on all levels of the mainstream public and private education system [from pre-primary to tertiary education] throughout Pakistan.

5. Eliminate barriers to learning, participation and development:
- at all levels of the mainstream public and private education system [from preprimary to tertiary education] throughout Pakistan; and
- in all public areas [i.e. parks, shopping centres and public transport].

6. Create, develop, support and strengthen structures to meet the needs and develop the unique abilities of all children through extensive co-operation amongst all ministries, institutions and organisations concerned.

7. Ensure that all teachers and school administrators in pre- and in-service education and training learn to embrace and encourage the diversity of needs and abilities of children, among others through;
- development and implementation of flexible curricula and evaluation system;
- use of technology to improve teaching and learning process;
- networking of resource persons within the social, medical, vocational and other relevant fields; and
- introduction of "Embracing Diversity - UNESCO/UNICEF Toolkit on Creating Inclusive, Learning-Friendly Environments".

44
8. Continuously promoting and raising awareness about the concept of inclusive education through teacher education and training, human resource development within the government and non-government sector, advocacy, research forum mass media, etc.

9. Develop mechanisms to secure efficient coordination of all efforts related to education among the Ministry of Education, Ministry of Social Welfare and Special Education, Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Information and Broadcasting, and other line ministries in order to implement the idea of inclusion in public and private sector schools.

10. Incorporate inclusive education into all laws, policies and plans [incl. EFA Plans, EMIS, etc.] related to education, health etc.

11. Actively engage and involve children, parents, teachers, professionals, community and religious leaders, civil society organisation [incl. charitable foundations, welfare organisations, etc.], business community and philanthropists in all aspects of school development, policy, management and support to children.

Islamabad, 27th April, 2005

Participants from:
* Ministry of Social Welfare and Special Education. * Ministry of Education
NATIONAL EDUCATION POLICY

2008

Draft
October 2008
NATIONAL EDUCATION POLICY
2008

Draft
October 2008

(After necessary amendments in view of discussions with/ comments from provincial/ area education departments on NEP April 2008 document)

Ministry of Education
Government of Pakistan
INTRODUCTION

CHAPTER 1.

THE STATE OF PAKISTAN’S EDUCATION

1.1 Access to Educational Opportunities

1.2 Equity in Education

1.2.1 The Gender Dimension

1.2.2 The Rural-Urban Divide

1.2.3 Provincial and Area Disparities

1.3 Quality of Provision

1.4 The Resource Commitment

1.5 Structure of Education: Public-Private Provision

CHAPTER 2.

NATIONAL EDUCATION POLICY: OVERARCHING CHALLENGES AND RESPONSES

2.1 Background

2.2 The Demographic Transition

2.3 Uniformity and Confidence in Public Education System

2.4 Social Exclusion and Social Cohesion

2.5 Setting Standards for Education

2.6 Dovetailing Government Initiatives

2.7 Leveraging International Development Partnerships

CHAPTER 3.

MAJOR DEFICIENCIES: THEIR CAUSES AND THE WAY FORWARD

3.1 Understanding System Deficiencies

3.1.4 The Commitment Gap

3.1.5 The Implementation Gap

3.2 The Way Forward: A Paradigmatic Shift

CHAPTER 4.

FILLING THE COMMITMENT GAP: SYSTEM VALUES, PRIORITIES AND RESOURCES

4.1 Educational Vision and Performance

4.2 A Reaffirmation of Educational Vision

4.3 Overarching Priorities: Widening Access and Raising Quality

4.4 Mobilising Resources for Education

CHAPTER 5.

FILLING THE IMPLEMENTATION GAP: ENSURING GOOD GOVERNANCE

5.1 Developing a Whole-of-Sector View

5.2 Ensuring Policy Coherence

5.3 Overcoming Fragmented Governance

5.4 Bridging the Public-Private Divide

5.5 Overcoming Structural Divides

5.6 Building Management and Planning Capacity

5.7 Getting Stakeholders Involved
INTRODUCTION

The Need for a Policy Review

1. The National Education Policy 2008 (the “Policy”) comes in a series of education policies dating back to the very inception of the country in 1947.

2. Two main reasons prompted the Ministry of Education (MoE) to launch the review in 2005 well before the time horizon of the existing policy framework (1998 - 2010)\(^1\) had approached. Firstly, the policy framework has not served as a satisfactory guide, as the policies pursued under that framework had not produced the desired educational results. Performance of the education sector has been deficient in several key aspects, most notably in access rates, and in quality and equity of educational opportunities.

3. Secondly, new international challenges like Millennium Development and Dakar Education for All (EFA) goals, have gained greater momentum in the intervening years and demanded fresh consideration. These challenges are triggered by globalisation and nation’s quest for becoming a “knowledge society”. Besides, some compelling domestic pressures such as devolution of powers, economic development and demographic transformations have necessitated a renewed commitment to proliferation of quality education for all.

4. It was keenly felt by all levels of government that deficiencies of the education sector posed long term risks to Pakistan’s quest for modernisation. Besides, the problems afflicting Pakistan’s education called for a fundamental re-orientation of the system, not its marginal tempering, which needed to be spelled out through a wide-ranging consultation process. Even though some fundamental reforms may be implemented gradually over time, their direction needed to be charted out early, forming the basis for more detailed plans of action and co-ordinated implementation mechanism.

Background and Process

5. The Policy is based on a lengthy process of consultation initiated in 2005, in line with the roadmap endorsed by the IPEM. The review exercise was conducted in close co-operation with all stakeholders, particularly the Provincial, Area and District governments. Several in-depth research studies were commissioned to feed into the process. To garner focused discussions, a series of 23 green papers were prepared on different topics by NEPR team and widely disseminated to stimulate discussion and get feedback. The process included field visits to 31 representative districts, one national and seven provincial/area education conferences, ten issues based focused group discussions and extensive consultations with educationists from all over Pakistan. With further consultations, the results were summarised in a pre-policy ‘White Paper’\(^2\) and circulated for comments. The final policy document benefits from a further round of comments from all stakeholders including the Provincial and Area Governments.

---


findings and recommendations are the consensus emerging from the consultations and represent a national view.

6. The NEP review process has adopted a long-term perspective for assessing the education sector’s performance and for charting its future course. While it is expected that some of the results of the reforms and policy actions to be taken bear fruit only over a long term, it is emphasised that action is needed now if those expectations are to become a reality in the future.

7. The purpose of the Policy is to chart out a national strategy for guiding education development in Pakistan. Some of the policy actions outlined have already been initiated in reforms during the process, most notably in the domains of curriculum development, textbook/learning materials policy and provision of missing facilities. The Policy takes account of these ongoing reforms and integrates them in a comprehensive set of recommendations.

8. The success of the policy actions outlined will undoubtedly lie in its implementation. The Policy fully recognizes the centrality of Provinces/Areas in fruitful realization of a national educational vision. It is therefore envisioned that the Strategies and Implementation Plans will be developed and executed by the Provincial and Area Governments. The role of the Federal Ministry of Education will be that of a coordinator and facilitator so as to ensure sectoral and geographic uniformity in achievement of educational goals nationally.

9. Given the national scope of the Policy, a reinvigorated Inter-Provincial Education Ministers’ Conference (IPEM) will be the steering and overseeing body for implementation. In this respect, the Policy considers the Federal-Provincial collaborative effort, already initiated, as the key to success.

10. The education strategy of a modern state must be comprehensive in both its horizontal and vertical dimensions. On the horizontal axis, education policies ought to be fully integrated with other socio-economic policies, both at national and sub-national levels and the Policy proposes actions to achieve this integration. In the vertical dimension, it is necessary to adopt a sector-wide approach that takes account of all the linkages between different components of the sector.

11. The objective of this policy document is to achieve following vision of the STATE on Education:

   “Education is a categorical imperative for individual, social and national development that should enable all individuals to reach their maximum human potential. The system should produce responsible, enlightened citizens to integrate Pakistan in the global framework of human centered development.”

12. Chapter 1 lays out the current state of Pakistan’s education sector. Available indicators are assessed against data in comparable countries. Chapter 2 identifies two fundamental causes that lie behind the deficiencies in performance, and outlines the way forward that consists of system-wide and sub-sector level reforms. Chapters 3 and 4 chart out ways of improving performance at the sector-wide or system level, while Chapters 5 and 6 outline reforms and policy actions to be taken at the sub-sector level.
CHAPTER 1.
THE STATE OF PAKISTAN’S EDUCATION

13. Taking stock of the current situation is an indispensable part of any policy development exercise as a mean of identifying areas of policy intervention. This chapter provides a brief review of Pakistan’s education system through indicators of access, equity, quality, resources, and structure of the education system. The latest available profile is complemented by information on how some of the indicators have evolved over the recent years. The chapter also provides a comparison with a selected group of countries that could be regarded as benchmark or reference countries.

1.1 ACCESS TO EDUCATIONAL OPPORTUNITIES

14. Gross Enrolment Ratio (GER) for early childhood education (ECE) rose quite remarkably from 36% of all children aged 3-4 years in 2001-02 to 91% in 2005-06\(^3\). This is significant progress, and the EFA mid-term targets for ECE have been met, although there remain questions about the quality of provision in so-called “Kachi” class.

15. There was considerable progress as well, at the primary level, where the Gross Enrolment Ratio rose from 71% for 2001-02 to 84% in 2005-06. Progress is evident in the Net Enrolment Rate (NER) as well, which measures enrolment as a percentage of all children in the required grade-specific age. Primary school NER rose from 57% in 2001-02 to 66% in 2005-06. There has been good progress in cutting down the drop-out rates in public sector, which fell from 43% in 2001-02 to 28% in 2005-06 for the Primary sector. Despite the progress, however, the 66% rate is below mid-term NER target (79% for 2005-06).

16. Participation at the secondary school level has also improved: the GER and the NER rose, respectively, from their levels in 2001-02 of 24% and 20%, respectively, to reach 31% and 24%. Enrolment ratio in tertiary education, which was 2.5% for 1999-2000, rose significantly to its 3.7% level in 2005-06.

17. During 2005-06, literacy rate for all adults 15 years old and over rose to 52% and for young adults (aged 15-24 years) to 67% in 2005-06. Both these rates show improvements from their 2001-02 levels, of 43% and 62% respectively\(^4\).

18. Despite the progress, the 2005-06 participation and attainment levels are disappointingly low. Some one-third of primary school age children remain out of school, a proportion that rises to some three-quarters for secondary school children. Clearly, Pakistan is some distance away from achieving universal schooling, even at the primary level.

19. An equal concern is that except for ECE, Pakistan’s performance on GER and NER lags behind its neighbours from the primary level and above. The performance on primary completion rate is particularly weak, and Pakistan’s adult literacy rate (49.9%)

---


\(^4\) ibid
is lower than the rate for countries like Sri Lanka (90.7%), Iran (82.4%), Indonesia (90.4%), Viet Nam (90.3%), Egypt (71.4%) and India (61%) for 2004-05.

20. Low access rates can also be attributed to the lack of confidence in the public sector schools to deliver quality education which has convinced parents either to shift their kids to private schools or absorb additional financial burden by arranging private tuitions. Where neither is affordable the households prefer to have their children drop out from school and join income earning activities. The average student of the public sector education system cannot compete in the job market. This leads to social exclusion of the already poor. The decline has primarily resulted from political interference and corruption that has permeated the entire sector. Recruitments, transfers and postings became politically driven. Absentee teachers and ghosts schools have discovered under various exercises. Cheating in examinations is a widespread phenomenon. Primary sufferers are the most poor and underprivileged in the system. Those who make it to higher education in the public sector cannot get employment due to absence of merit or poor quality of their educational abilities.

1.2 EQUITY IN EDUCATION

21. The averages for Pakistan, noted above, mask large differences in access across gender, ethnic minorities, provinces, regions and rural-urban divides. This results in weaker performance on equitable distribution of educational opportunities. It is common knowledge, as well as a proven outcome of many studies that discrimination exists in the education system in various forms. The inequity has been the result of poor implementation and social customs. Over the years, little attention has been paid to rectify the situation. The issue of equity runs through the entire education system and has serious implications for sustainable and equitable development in the country. Unless the issue is seriously recognized and assessed in all its manifestations, a realistic policy to reprise the situation will not evolve.

22. Data reported below, which are limited to gender and rural urban and provincial disparities, show that females and pupils in rural areas face systematic disadvantage at all levels of education. The intersection of these dispersions compounds the disadvantage for some groups; the disadvantage faced by female students becomes multiplied if the female student happens to be in a low performing province or region.

1.2.1 The Gender Dimension

23. In 2005-06, the Gender Parity Index (GPI) for primary education was below the parity level 0.82 for both GER and NER. These figures showed significant improvements from their 2001-02 figures of 0.72. The Index falls for the secondary level to 0.77 (GER and NER) but, again, registers improvement from their 2001-02 level of 0.73. Despite improvements, it is evident that those girls continue to face significant disadvantage in access as they reach adulthood. The situation improves significantly for higher education, where in some subject areas the index is in favour of females. Further positive features for gender parity come from the survival rates for

---

young girls reaching Grade 5, where the GPI (1.02) reveals a marginally better result than for young boys. Young girls do better, as well, in transition rates between primary and secondary education (1.07).

24. Gender Parity Indices for adult literacy rate rose from 0.51 in 2001-02 to 0.58 in 2005-06 and for youth literacy rate, it remained at the same level of 0.72 in the same period. Proportion of female enrolment in vocational education is at 38%. Females are particularly under-represented in rural areas (36% versus 43% for urban areas), a feature that also holds for secondary education (35% for rural and 48% in urban areas). Female teachers make up only 47% of primary school teachers, rising to 55% in secondary schools, but with only 31% in TVE.

1.2.2 The Rural-Urban Divide

25. The relative disadvantage of the rural areas compared to the urban becomes evident from the secondary level and above. At the early childhood education level, the GER for urban areas (88%) for 2005-06 was actually below the figure for rural areas (93%), and, at the primary level, the GER for urban areas (85%) was only slightly better than the 84% for rural areas. The rural disadvantage at the secondary level is rather large: (48% urban versus 22% rural). The percentage gap between the two areas has widened from 20 points in 2001-02 to 26 points in 2005-06.

26. More surprisingly, rural provision also performs better on some efficiency measures. Grade 1 repetition rates for rural areas, was better than the urban rates (2.25 versus 3.1%), a comparison that holds through to other primary level Grades. The differential for Grade 5, was 2.0% versus 2.9% in favour of the rural areas. In terms of the survival rate to Grade 5, however, rural areas are at a significant disadvantage, where the survival rate is only 67% compared with 94% in the urban setting. On the other hand, in terms of teacher input, the pupil teacher ratio (PTR), is favourable for rural primary schools (39 pupils per teacher) compared with the urban (43 pupils per teacher). This is reversed for secondary schools, where the ratio of 12 pupils per teacher in urban areas is better than for rural secondary schools (18 pupils per teacher).

27. The rural schools suffer more from poor facilities: while 90% of urban schools benefit from water sources, only 63% of rural schools do so. A similar disadvantage pertains to sanitation facilities, which are available to 88% of urban schools but only to 56% of schools in the rural setting.

1.2.3 Provincial and Area Disparities

28. There are large disparities in access and quality measures across Provinces and Areas. A common pattern is for Sindh or Punjab to be at the top of the league, while Balochistan is a weak performer among the Provinces. During 2005-06, at the primary school level, the NER for Punjab (68%), Sindh (67%) and NWFP (66%) with Balochistan showing up at 40%. Similarly for NER at secondary level, Punjab (26%) has more than twice as high an enrolment rate compared with Balochistan (11%) and

---

7 ibid.
8 National Education Census 2006
FATA (11%). For GER at secondary level, Balochistan has a GER of 15%, FATA scores a low GER of 14%, while the rate is highest in ICT at 82%. On literacy measures as well, the pattern is similar. Literacy rates for young adults are highest in Sindh (71%) and lowest in Balochistan (48%). Considering all adults, literacy rates are highest for Sindh (55%) and lowest for Balochistan (37%)\(^\text{10}\).

1.3 Quality of Provision

29. Through the recent introduction of the National Education Assessment System (NEAS) in 2005 it has become possible to assess quality of educational outcomes at school level on a scientific and quantitative basis\(^\text{11}\). The NEAS 2005 assessed Grade 4 students in the subject domains of Urdu and Mathematics, which was expanded to include Science and Social Studies in NEAS 2006. Grade 8 students were assessed in Mathematics and Language in NEAS 2007.

30. The 2005 results show that the average score of Grade 4 students in Urdu (369) and Mathematics (421) was well below the scaled average of 500. The 2006 results confirm that the average score of Grade 4 students was less than 50% of the possible marks in each of the four subjects tested\(^\text{12}\). The results from NEAS 2007 for Grade 8 students give slightly better results for Urdu but again show that the average score of students is below the 50% mark in Mathematics\(^\text{13}\).

31. An international comparison confirms the relatively poor quality of Pakistan’s education. The NEAS 2005 score for Pakistani students are well below the international scaled mean of 495 in the TIMMS assessment. Pakistani students perform relatively poorly compared to their counterparts in all other countries in the study excepting Iran, Philippines, Morocco and Tunisia.

32. Two measures of input quality are also available: qualifications of the teaching staff and the Pupil-Teacher Ratio (PTR). In regard to teacher quality, about 47% of ECE teachers have the required qualifications, a rate that jumps to 100% at the primary and secondary levels\(^\text{14}\). These data must be interpreted with caution, as the standards for qualifications at this level are widely believed to be unsatisfactory.

33. The PTR works out to a high of 40 for primary schools and 15 for the secondary. Pakistan does well in terms of trained teachers and its pupil/teacher ratio is not as high as for India and Bangladesh, indicating better resource support\(^\text{15}\).

34. The survival rate to grade 5 is 72%\(^\text{16}\), that is, more than a quarter of students entering primary education do not reach the last grade. Considerable progress has been

---

\(^{10}\) ibid

\(^{11}\) National Assessment Report 2005, National Education Assessment System, Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan,

\(^{12}\) National assessment Findings 2006, National education Assessment System, Ministry of Education Government of Pakistan,


\(^{16}\) Education for All: Mid-Decade assessment, Country Report Pakistan, Ministry of Education, Government of
made since 2001-02 when the survival rate was 57%. Despite progress in absolute terms, Pakistan’s performance is weakest in comparison with its neighbours excepting Bangladesh\textsuperscript{17}.

35. The problem of drop out rates is severe, as it adds to the number of out of school children. More than 31% drop out during the primary level; some 16% after the middle level; another 16% after the secondary phase and yet another 16% during the higher secondary phase during 2004-05\textsuperscript{18}.

36. Repeat rates are another measure of internal efficiency of the education system. The overall repeat rates for Grade 1 to 5 are between 2.1 to 2.6 and typically highest for the first Grade and Grade 5. Repeat rates are generally lower for young girls\textsuperscript{19}. On this measure, Pakistan’s experience is not too dissimilar from its reference countries\textsuperscript{20}.

37. National Education Census 2005 reveals that most schools are sparsely equipped. Library facilities, computer resources, sports and recreation facilities are poor. However, the paucity of facilities can be gauged from the fact that only 69% of schools have drinking water and only 63% sanitary facilities; and many schools do not have boundary walls\textsuperscript{21}. However, progress has been recorded in each of these areas since 2000.

38. In regard to the quality of the labour force produced by the higher education sector, the number of researchers per million people one is often used as an indicator. The number for Pakistan (75) is considerably lower than some of its reference countries such as Iran (1,279) and India (119)\textsuperscript{22}.

1.4 The Resource Commitment

39. Financial resources for education come largely from the public sector, which spends 2.5% of the GDP (2006-07) on education. A further 0.5% is estimated to be the contribution of the private sector, putting the combined resources at around 3% of GDP for 2006-2007\textsuperscript{23}. Although both public and private contributions have increased over the years (as a proportion of the GDP), there has been some increase in this proportion over the recent years, from the comparable figure of 2.2% in 2000-2001, revealing a slight upward trend.

40. The data on public expenditure on education reveal the low priority Pakistan gives to education: it spends relatively less on education (2.3%) than countries like Iran (4.7%), Malaysia (6.2), Thailand (4.2%), South Korea (4.6%), India (3.8%), and Bangladesh (2.5%)\textsuperscript{24}.

\textsuperscript{17} World Development Indicators 2007, The World Bank, 2007.
\textsuperscript{21} National Education Census: Highlights, Ministry of education, Government of Pakistan, 2006.
\textsuperscript{22} Human Development Report 2007/2008, UNDP.
\textsuperscript{24} World Development Indicators 2007, The World Bank, 2007.
41. In terms of cost structure by type of provision, the annual expenditure per pupil in the public sector for 2005-06 amounts to Rs. 6,436 at the primary school level, rising to 6,815 for secondary education and 40,332 for the tertiary level\(^{25}\). The data also show the large rise in tertiary costs over the period 2003 to 2006.

42. In terms of disbursements to various components of the education sector, the primary sector accounts for some 44%, the secondary sector 24%, and some 13% goes to the tertiary sector, the rest being claimed by other sectors\(^{26}\). Expenditures on the primary and secondary education, therefore, amount to some five times more than the expenditure on the tertiary sector. These ratios vary a great deal among countries, since they depend on a large number of country specific factors such as the demographic profile, cost per student in different sectors, the state of development of different sectors, and the needs of the economy. In comparison, the share of the tertiary sector in the developed economies is, on average, 2.7 times larger than for non-tertiary sectors, though the ratio varies widely among countries\(^{27}\).

1.5 Structure of Education: Public-Private Provision

43. The private sector contributes some 0.5% of the GDP to education, about one-sixth of total financial resources. The private sector institutions can be for profit or not for profit and religious/missionary. They offer mainstream education as well as religious education through Deeni Madaris. The medium of instruction employed by the educational institutions is predominantly Urdu (65%). This percentage is higher for public institutions (68%) compared with the private sector institutions (57%)\(^{28}\).

44. The public sector accounts for around 64% of all enrolments and dominates the structures of Primary Schools, Secondary and Higher Secondary Schools, Inter and Degree Colleges, and general Universities. While the overall share of the private sector in total enrolment is around 36%, its enrolment share is 42% in pre-primary education, Primary stage 32%, middle stage 33%, high 30% and higher secondary 18%, Technical/Vocational (52%), Vocational/ Polytechnics (57%), Non-Formal Basic Education (61%) and Deeni Madaris (97%)\(^{29}\).

45. The private sector’s role has been expanding in recent years. While there are several causes for this relative growth, it is partly a reflection of the shortcomings of the public sector to provide quality education.

\(^{25}\) P&P Wing, Ministry of Education


\(^{29}\) ibid.
CHAPTER 2.
NATIONAL EDUCATION POLICY:
OVERARCHING CHALLENGES AND RESPONSES

2.1 BACKGROUND

46. Education is a living system that gets impacted by the environment within which it exists. These environmental factors can be domestic as well as international. Changes in technology, business systems and general global environment, all require policy responses. Traditions, culture and faith all reflect upon the education system while at the same time get affected by it. The element of continuity and change remains perpetual and it is up to a society to determine its pace and direction.

47. The societal, political and governmental structures also impinge on the effectiveness of the education system. An education policy cannot be prepared in isolation of these realities. The current policy therefore identifies some of the overarching challenges and proposes policy options, within the context of the education system.

48. Cultural values of the majority of Pakistanis are derived from Islam. An education system reflects and strengthens social, cultural and moral values. Pakistan’s educational interventions have to be based on the core values of faith.

49. The National Education Policy recognizes the importance of Islamic values and adheres to the agreed principles in this regard. All policy interventions shall fall within the parameters identified in the Principles of Policy as laid down in Articles 29, 30, 33, 36, 37 and 40 of Constitution of Pakistan 1973. These include the need for Muslim children to be provided instructions in Islamiat to enable them to develop themselves as good Muslims. Similarly, minorities should be provided with facilities to get education of their own religion.

2.2 THE DEMOGRAPHIC TRANSITION

50. Recent studies on demographic trends reveal that economists have begun to focus on the impact of changing age structure of the population. The interest in relation between population change and economic growth has again caught light due to the demographic transition taking place in the developing countries, which offers potential economic benefit by changes in the age structure of the population during the demographic transition, owing to an increase in working age population and associated decline in the dependent age population. In fact, different age groups in a population have different economic implications. The young need investment in health and education, adult supply labor, income and savings and at old age there is a need for retirement income and again investment in health. East Asia witnessed a dramatic and rapid demographic transition over the last four decades.

51. According to Population Census, the dependent population (below 15 years and above 65 years) was 51.2% in 1981, and 53.1% in 1998 which according to UN population projections, fell to 42.7% in 2004 and will further fall to 38.3% in 2015. Similarly, the working age population which was 48.8% in 1981 and 46.9% in 1998...
surged to 57.3% in 2004 and it’s expected to reach 61.7% by 2015, demographic transition is taking place though currently at a slower pace. It poses enormous challenge for the government to manage the economy in such a way that the transition benefits Pakistan.

2.3 Uniformity and Confidence in Public Education System

52. The imperative of uniformity in Pakistan’s educational system flows from the Constitution of Pakistan, which entrusts the State with the responsibility of organizing an equitable and effective education system, with an aim to enhance the overall well being of Pakistanis. The national educational systems in different countries have evolved with the state in such a way that they appear to flow from each other. That is the reason modern states have one educational system, customarily called the ‘national educational system’. No other system in a State, except the national educational system, shares the ideals, objectives, and purpose of a State. The institution of Education in fact, acts as the repository of the trust that the citizens have in the State, mediating the achievements of the past with the aspirations of the future for all the citizens of any given State. It is this correlation between the State and the Educational System, which bestows the singularity to the national educational system, making it a unified and unifying entity. To promote and protect this uniformity, the national educational systems strive to establish the uniformity in structures and modes of education throughout the country. As the national educational systems also evolve as a response to the particular demands of distinct ethnic, social, economic, religious, political groups and communities, there is always room for diversity. This diversity can lend strength to the educational outcomes, especially in a federation like Pakistan, if this does not work at cross purposes with the uniformities, which any national system would need to retain its uniformity and to be able to offer a national response to challenges, which have the potential and possibility of affecting whole of the country such as the loss of competitiveness, extremism, security threats, and subversion of national values, etc.

53. Aware of the importance of the local cultural context, the new National Educational Policy supports the reflection of the local cultural contexts through curricula and through the usage of the vernacular as a medium of instruction at the early stages of education, as enshrined in Pakistan’s Constitution.

54. The emergence and continued presence of parallel systems of education in Pakistan i.e., private schools and madaris, apparently violates the principle of the uniformity of the educational system adversely. The Policy is aware of the historical context which favored the emergence of these parallel systems and endeavors to encourage these systems to blend in the national educational system in such a way that they strengthen the uniformity of the national educational system, especially in terms of Curricula, Educational Standards, Costs and Conditions and Learning environment. The provision of educational services is a public function. The Constitution of Pakistan expects the public sector to take lead in performing this public function. The relative failure of the governmental educational system has resulted in the emergence of the alternative education provider i.e., the private sector. When, a private educational institution is providing educational services for a fee or as a public good, with an almost total administrative autonomy, it remains a public function. The assurance of uniformity therefore would remain the responsibility of the State. It can do it entirely on its own or
can develop public-private partnerships to ensure that the exigency of uniformity in standards and purpose of education is not compromised.

55. The loss of uniformity in our educational system is best evidenced in the lack of beneficial and synergetic linkages between the Technical, Vocational, Professional and scientific education sub sectors. If Pakistan has to become a talent rich country, it needs to integrate and gel all the four with the national educational system.

56. Governance refers to the way in which any social unit – from society as a whole to the smallest community organization – organizes itself politically to undertake a range of public functions. Governance in the educational system is very weak. The Educational Policy, informed by the ideals of democratic governance, which implies a partnership between the principal societal actors in the making and implementation of public policy, would try to effect a better allocation and management of public resources, wherever necessary involving the private sector.

57. The unity of objectives of our educational efforts - is it in the public or private sector - is spelt through the over-arching principles of access, quality, affordability and relevance. The way the Pakistani educational system has developed over time, we do notice a certain dispersion of the objective of the unity, manifesting itself in the form of parallel educational systems and their equivalence, and the issues of medium of instruction, and representation of minorities, etc. The Policy is guided by the principle of creating a minimum level of uniformity in order to protect the uniformity of the Pakistan’s educational system as a tool of social progress and of all round development in an increasingly globalized and competitive world.

58. English is an international language, and important for competition in a globalized world order. Urdu is our national language that connects people all across Pakistan and is a symbol of national cohesion and integration. In addition, there are mother tongues / local vernaculars in the country that are markers of ethnic and cultural richness and diversity. The challenge is that a child is able to carry forward the cultural assets and be at the same time able to compete nationally and internationally. Globalization and Competitiveness

59. Globalization is not a new phenomenon but its pace in recent years has been unprecedented. This has created opportunities and challenges for countries all over the world. An education system cannot remain in isolation of these challenges and opportunities. Unfortunately, a comprehensive national analysis and debate on the potential impact and possible benefits of globalization has been a major deficit. Work that has been undertaken has been confined to the business sector. Even here the feedback into the education system to develop a desired response has been missing. Other aspects of globalization like media and culture have been ignored.

60. The relevance of education to global competitiveness can be seen in the table from the Global Competitive Index (GCI), given below. Pakistan has been compared with its major competitors in an international context. (Higher the number assigned to a pillar, the lesser the performance.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GCI Pillars and Comparators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pillars/ Parameters</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Institutions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2. Infrastructure & 67 & 117 & 60 & 62 & 23 & 76
3. Macro-economy & 86 & 47 & 50 & 88 & 31 & 110
5. Higher Education and & 104 & 108 & 77 & 49 & 32 & 81
7. Technological Readiness & 89 & 114 & 75 & 55 & 28 & 83


61. It can be seen that in education and health related indicators Pakistan falls behind all other countries. It has to be realized that even the sustainability and improvement of other indicators depends on education.

62. Important products and enablers of globalization have been technologies like the internet and satellite television. This impact has overtaken the perceptions of the policymakers most of whom grew up in an era when these technologies did not exist. These are important tools of education as well as potential detriments to the objectives of national education. There has been no analysis to comprehend its potential impact on children both in the positive as well as negative aspects.

2.4 Social Exclusion and Social Cohesion

63. Education is not only about the individual, it has a societal role --a societal role of selecting, classifying, distributing, transmitting and evaluating the educational knowledge, reflecting both the distribution of power and the principle of social contract. In a country with alarming inequities of income and opportunities, reducing the social exclusion needs to be one of the principle objectives of the Policy. The educational system in Pakistan is accused of strengthening the existing inequitable social structure as very few people from the public sector educational institutions could move up the ladder of social mobility. If immediate attention is not paid to reduce the social exclusion and moving towards inclusive development in Pakistan through emancipatory education, Pakistan can face unprecedented social upheavals.

64. Almost all the past educational policies talk about the role of education as a tool of social reform and social development. But all these policies have not been able to significantly contribute to increase social inclusiveness by ensuring social mobility through education and training. Educational system is supposed to ensure the right of an individual to grow in income and stature on the basis of his/her excellence in education and training.

65. Uneven distribution of resources and opportunities and apprehensions of sliding down on the scale of poverty promote social exclusion. Increased levels of social exclusion express itself in different forms like ethnic strife, sectarianism and extremism, etc. Social exclusion or extremism is not exclusively a function of the curriculum but a host of factors like poverty, inequity and identity crisis contribute to it and it becomes such a huge challenge that calls for a comprehensive response on urgent basis.
2.5 Setting Standards for Education

66. A key deficit is absence of clearly articulated minimum standards for most educational interventions and their outcomes. Even where these are established, there is no measurement or structured follow up. As a result, impact of the interventions remains subject to anecdotes or speculation and the true picture never emerges. Since standardization has not been part of the governance culture, relevant indicators have not been developed. Only recently the National Education Management Information System (NEMIS) has begun the process of computing indicators. Though even these indicators are those that have been internationally identified and developed by UNESCO or some of the donors for cross-cutting international programs like Dakar Framework of Action for EFA and Fast Track Initiative (FTI) for EFA. Indigenous requirements on a scale have not been assessed.

2.6 Dovetailing Government Initiatives

67. Recently many new initiatives have been taken by the government aiming at providing missing facilities. Traditional approach of improving infrastructure and providing brick & mortar is no doubt necessary, but not sufficient for quality education delivery and sustainable economic development in the existing burgeoning global competitive milieu. Although some initiatives also focus/target on improving teaching quality and learning environment, building capacity of education managers and administrators, etc. Apart from the Ministry of Education, many other initiatives have been launched in the recent past by different Ministries, organizations and departments like National Commission for Human Development (NCHD), Higher Education Commission (HEC), National Vocational & Technical Education Commission (NAVTEC), MoSW & SE, Labour & Manpower Division, to develop the Human Resource of Pakistan in a bid to meet the emerging challenges.

68. It has been observed that some of these good initiatives are working in isolation from each other, thus not adding much value to the national objectives. These programs need to dovetail in such a way that their impact is multiplied and we get best return on our investment and efforts. There is a need of coordination at the provincial level, where this is not already being done. Also the issue of vertical programmes and projects should be re-assessed as these currently have little or no ownership from the provincial governments. Main reason is the failure to integrate provincial governments in the planning and need assessment stages.

2.7 Leveraging International Development Partnerships

69. International development partners are providing generous support to education sector in Pakistan. Different donors have different focus in terms of programmatic emphasis and geographical coverage. However, at times their projects overlap in an unbefitting manner or their programmatic focus and emphasis bring limited value addition to the objectives of the government. Getting optimum value from these investments has become a challenge in the absence of institutionalized mechanisms for donor coordination. In order to help and optimize the partnership with international development agencies, it is important to review the guiding national policy framework, and fine tune it to meet the national goals.
CHAPTER 3.
MAJOR DEFICIENCIES:
THEIR CAUSES AND THE WAY FORWARD

70. The foregoing analysis reveals that Pakistan has made progress on a number of education indicators in recent years. Notwithstanding the progress, education in Pakistan suffers from two key deficiencies: at all levels of education, access to educational opportunities remains low and the quality of education is weak, not only in relation to Pakistan’s goals themselves but also in international comparisons with the reference countries.

71. On the Education Development Index, which combines all educational access measures Pakistan lies at the bottom with Bangladesh and is considerably below in comparison to Sri Lanka. A similar picture is painted by the gross enrolment ratios that combine all education sectors, and by the adult literacy rate measures. The overall Human Development Index (HDI) for Pakistan stands at 0.55, which is marginally better than for Bangladesh and Nepal but poorer than other countries in the region. The report also shows that while Pakistan’s HDI has improved over the years but the rate of progress in other countries has been higher. Bangladesh, starting at a lower base has caught up, while other countries have further improved upon their relative advantage. These developments do not augur well for Pakistan’s competitive position in the international economy. As the Global Competitiveness Index (GCI) shows, Pakistan’s performance is weak, on the health and education related elements of competitiveness, when compared with its major competitors like India, China, Bangladesh, Sri Lanka and Malaysia.

3.1 UNDERSTANDING SYSTEM DEFICIENCIES

72. There are two fundamental causes for the weak performance of the education sector: (i) a lack of commitment to education – a commitment gap - and (ii) and an implementation gap that has thwarted the application of policies. The two gaps are linked in practice: a lack of commitment leads to poor implementation, but the weak implementation presents a problem of its own.

3.1.4 The Commitment Gap

73. The low resources stand in sharp contrast to the commitment required by the policy statements, which set up ambitious goals for the sector. The national emphasis on education goes back to the enshrining of the right to education in the Constitution.

---

31 ibid.
74. The contrast between the vision and the commitment has been pointed out by the Planning Commission: “We cannot spend only 2.7% of our GDP on education and expect to become a vibrant knowledge economy.”

75. The commitment gap could come from two reasons: (i) a lack of belief in education’s true worth for socio-economic and human-centred development; and/or (ii) a lack of belief in the goals themselves. In regard to the first, the analysis done during the policy review, including reviewing recent international research and policy experience, confirms the potent role education can play in achieving economic growth and social development. On this basis, the commitment gap could not arise for this reason.

76. The second reason, the lack of commitment to the policy goal itself may, therefore, be the real problem. At the time of its birth as a nation, Pakistan inherited an approach to education that had two features. First, the education system of the time was designed to supply the skills needed to run the colonial administration. The accent was on education for the few, basically to fill public service jobs. The prevailing objective was service to the administration rather than service to the students and learners. This assessment is echoed by the Economist Intelligence Unit assessment in its latest review of education, in which it observes that “Pakistan’s education system is among the most deficient and backward in Asia, reflecting the traditional determination of feudal ruling elite to preserve its hegemony”.

3.1.5 The Implementation Gap

77. The implementation gap, though less well documented, is believed to be the more pervasive in that it affects many aspects of governance and the allocation and use of resources. One piece of evidence relates to the amount of developmental funds allocated to the sector that remains unspent. Estimates range from 10% to 30% of allocated funds remaining unutilised. The underlying causes may lie in the lack of a planning culture, planning capacity and weaknesses in the accountability mechanisms.

78. Another type of implementation problem surfaces in the corruption that is believed to pervade the system. Anecdotes abound of education allocations systematically diverted to personal use at most levels of the allocation chain. Political influence and favouritism are believed to interfere in the allocation of resources to the Districts and schools, in recruitment, training and posting of teachers and school administrators that are not based on merit, in awarding of textbook contracts, and in the conduct of examinations and assessments. The pervasive nature of corruption indicates a deeper problem where the service to the students and learners is not at the forefront of thinking and behaviour on the part of some involved in operating the system.

3.2 THE WAY FORWARD: A PARADIGMATIC SHIFT

79. Addressing the two underlying deficiencies requires a fundamental change in the thinking that informs education policy at all levels. The need for a paradigmatic shift is echoed in the ‘Vision 2030’ report of the Planning Commission, which calls for major adaptations and innovation in the education system.

80. The paradigmatic shift requires that the objectives of the education policy would be to serve the interests of students and learners rather than of those who develop policy or implement programmes. This is a very fundamental shift as it implies changes in all the important parameters of education policy: what educational provision to offer; who benefits from educational provision; what pedagogy and teaching and learning methods to employ; and how the resource cost should be shared among the stakeholders. Accordingly, the Policy recognises the need for reforms and makes recommendations for action in a wide range of areas, which are divided into the two categories. First, there are system level reforms, which deal with such issues as the vision of the system, sector priorities and governance, and resources for the sector. The second set of reforms address problems that are specific to individual sub-sectors of education, ranging from early childhood education to adult learning.
CHAPTER 4.
FILLING THE COMMITMENT GAP:
SYSTEM VALUES, PRIORITIES AND RESOURCES

4.1 EDUCATIONAL VISION AND PERFORMANCE

81. The Constitution of Pakistan sets out a broad-based egalitarian view of education, based on values, and responding to the requirements of economic growth. Its Article 38 (d) speaks of instilling moral values and of providing education to all citizens irrespective of gender, caste, creed, or race. Article 37(b) explicitly states that the State of Pakistan shall endeavour “To remove illiteracy and provide free and compulsory secondary education within minimum possible period”. Article 34 requires that “Steps shall be taken to ensure full participation of women in all the spheres of national life”. It is in this perspective that Pakistan has made a commitment to achieve the six Education for All (EFA) goals within the specified target dates.

82. In contrast to this vision for education, there has been little de facto commitment to achieving the ambitions of a national educational policy. Governance and management of education has fallen short of the commitments. As a consequence, Pakistan’s education system, far from being a cohesive national system, is afflicted with fissures that have created parallel systems of education and has performed poorly on the criteria of access, equity and quality.

83. As the report ‘Vision 2030’ describes it, the reality on the ground is “the divide between the prevalent school structure and differences in levels of infrastructure and facilities, media of instruction, emolument of teachers, and even examination systems between public and private sectors. The rich send their children to private run English medium schools which offer foreign curricula and examination systems; the public schools enrol those who are too poor to do so.” This divide can be further categorised across low cost private schools and the elite schools. There is another divide between the curriculum that is offered to the children enrolled in Deeni Madaris and the curriculum in the rest of the public and private establishments. There is also an unresolved and continuing debate on how and what religious and moral values to be taught through the educational system and how to accommodate non-Muslim minorities.

84. Pakistan’s commitment to universal primary education by 2015 under the EFA framework appears elusive on current performance, as participation is low and access drop-out rates continue to be high. There are persistent gender and rural-urban disparities. Girls continue to remain under-represented in the education system, both public and private. The rural urban divide is stark on most indicators of school provision and participation, which becomes particularly attenuated in some Provinces and Areas. International comparisons of education quality revealed by the NEAS are not encouraging.

85. An education system cannot remain in isolation of the challenges and opportunities provided by globalization. These are in the field of business and commerce, technology, cultural values and identity and many more. Unfortunately a comprehensive national analysis and debate on the potential impact and possible
benefits of globalization has been a major deficit. Work that has been undertaken has been of more confined to the business sector. Even here the feedback into the education system to develop a desired response has been missing.

### 4.2 A Reaffirmation of Educational Vision

86. Recognising the commitment gap, a first priority is a reaffirmation of the fundamental vision of education. The goals and targets, and the financial and human resources required to achieve them, follow closely from the commitment to a clearly articulated vision.

87. There are solid reasons for the reaffirmation. New research provides convincing evidence of education’s contribution to both economic and social development, which can be achieved simultaneously because the processes of economic growth and social development are interlinked. There are close links between equity in educational opportunities and equitable income distribution and income growth. If the education system is constructed on a divisive basis the divisions it creates can endanger long run economic growth as well as stability of society. An unjust society creates an unstable society and an unstable society cannot sustain stable long term growth.

88. The contribution of education to economic growth of societies is well established. A long history of research has confirmed that each year of schooling contributes 0.58% to the rate of economic growth \(^{35}\). The evidence is not just for the developed economies of the world but, importantly to the point, for the developing nations as well.

89. This new research highlights the possibilities of both a vicious and a virtuous circle operating from equity of educational opportunities to equity of income distribution, and from social cohesion to economic growth. An affirmation of commitment to Pakistan’s egalitarian education vision in the service of all citizens and as a driver of economic and social development can help to produce a virtuous circle of high levels of human and social capital leading to equitable economic growth and social advancement. The education sector policies have to be reoriented if they are not to fall in the vicious circle trap.

90. The reaffirmation of educational vision requires a change of mindset that would permit development of goals, policies and programmes in support of the vision. The Planning Commission’s ‘Vision 2030’ also argues for such change of the mindset, which commits to a new set of societal goals. The Ministry of Education has adopted following vision:

> “Education is a categorical imperative for individual, social and national development that should enable all individuals to reach their maximum human potential. The system should produce responsible, enlightened citizens to integrate Pakistan in the global framework of human centered economic development.”

### 4.3 Overarching Priorities: Widening Access and Raising Quality

91. The objective of education is the preparation of a self reliant individual, capable of analytical and original thinking, a responsible member of his community and, in the

---

present era, a global citizen. It is imperative to identify and, possibly define, the touchstone for development of the child as a member of society. Each culture has its own ethos that bears relevance for its individual constituents. The challenge today is to secure values without regressing into unnecessary anachronism and parochial insularity. The other relevance of education is its ability to provide the graduates with an opportunity to earn a living. Education should be able to increase the earning potential of the individual who is literate; irrespective of the eventual vocation opted for.

92. The foregoing articulations of the economic and social goals are taken by the Policy as an appropriate basis for defining the priorities for national education policy. They lead to two over-arching policy priorities. Given the important role of education as a key driver of economic growth and social advancement, the first policy priority is to widen access to education for all. Improving the quality of education, particularly in its dimension of being relevant to the needs of the economy, becomes the second strategic priority because of its role in nurturing the knowledge economy.

93. This Policy document identifies policy actions in pursuit of these two overriding objectives. They are divided into policy actions required at the system level, treated below in this chapter and in Chapter 4, and actions pertaining to specific sub-sectors of education, which are treated in Chapters 5 and 6.

Policy Actions:

1. Provinces and Area Governments shall affirm the goal of achieving universal and free primary education by 2015 and up to class 10 by 2025.

2. Provincial and Area Governments shall develop plans for achieving these targets, including intermediate enrolment targets and estimates of the required financial, technical, human and organisational resources.

3. The plans shall also promote equity in education with the aim of eliminating social exclusion and promoting national cohesion. Greater opportunities shall be provided to marginalised groups of society, particularly girls.

4. Governments shall improve quality of educational provision at all levels of education.

5. National Standards for educational institutions and learning outcomes shall be determined. A National Education Standards Authority shall be established. The standards shall not debar a provincial and area government from having its own standards above the prescribed minimum.

6. Steps shall be taken to make educational provision relevant for the labour market and for promoting innovation in the economy, by giving greater emphasis to vocational and technical education and by restructuring study programmes and curricula to offer more applied learning options.

7. Universities and research institutes shall place greater emphasis on mobilising research for promoting innovation in the economy.

8. Educational inputs need to be designed with a comprehension of the challenges and opportunities related to globalization. Strategies shall be developed to optimize opportunities and minimize the more negative impacts
4.4 Mobilising Resources for Education

94. Reforms and priorities will need to be planned in detail at various levels of government, including the cost requirements. In the absence of such detailed estimates in advance, it can be said with confidence that the required resources will exceed by considerable margin from the present 2.7% of GDP.

95. The need for a higher level of allocation comes from the fact that both the volume and the quality of provision have to be improved simultaneously. In addition, Pakistan starts from a smaller base level of resource commitment, as is evident from a comparison with other developing nations. As the report ‘Vision 2030’ puts it forthrightly, “We cannot spend 2.7 per cent of GDP on education and expect to become a vibrant knowledge economy”.

96. Pakistan has experienced sustained economic growth of close to 7 per cent over the last ten years. Current projections expect this rate of growth to continue. On the basis of these estimates, the expanding GDP and per capita income should be able to accommodate greater allocation to the education sector, which should be able to pay for the reform initiatives and policy actions outlined in the Policy.

Policy Actions:

1. The Government shall commit to allocating 7% of GDP to education by 2015 (?????) we should either not give a figure or give a more realistic.

2. Governments shall explore ways to increase the contribution of the private sector, which at present contributes only 16 per cent of the total educational resources.

3. For promoting Public-Private-Partnership in the education sector, particularly in the case of disadvantaged children, a percentage of the education budget as grant in aid (to be decided by each Province) shall be allocated to philanthropic, non-profit educational institutions.

4. A system of checks and balances for the private sector, shall be formed to oversee the issues of fees, school standards, pays of teachers, conduct and hygiene etc.

5. Total resources for education shall be further augmented by developing strategies for inviting and absorbing international contributions. The Federal and Provincial/Area Governments shall develop consensus on needs and priorities for foreign assistance in education.

6. A system for donor harmonization and improved coordination between development partners and government agencies as various inputs and investments shall be developed.

7. The cost estimates for serving as the basis for educational allocation shall be based on a more comprehensive definition of the concept of “free” education. This shall include all education related costs such on stationery, transport and meals, which are, in general, not covered at present, and shall be applied as a basis of allocating funds on a needs basis for poor children.

8. Governments and educational institutions shall strengthen planning and implementation capacity to improve utilisation of resources.
CHAPTER 5.
FILLING THE IMPLEMENTATION GAP:
ENSURING GOOD GOVERNANCE

97. The Policy has identified implementation problems as one of the two main underlying causes of poor performance of the education sector. Implementation problems, themselves, can be traced to several types of governance problems, which need addressing:

1. Absence of a whole-of-sector view
2. Lack of policy coherence
3. Unclear roles in fragmented governance
4. Parallel systems of education (public-private divide)
5. Weak planning and management
6. Lack of stakeholder participation

5.1 DEVELOPING A WHOLE-OF-SECTOR VIEW

98. The education sector has divided responsibilities at the Federal level and between the Federal and other sub-national administrations. At the Federal level, the responsibilities for different elements of the education are carved up between the HEC, NAVTEC and the Ministry of Education (while other Ministries also run individual establishments and trusts). This splitting up within education also exists at the Provincial level. In Punjab, the Department for Literacy and Non-Formal Education is separate from the Provincial Education Department. In Balochistan, Literacy comes under the Social Welfare Department, and so on. There is no mechanism for developing a whole-of-sector view at the national level.

Policy Actions:

1. A comprehensive Human Resource Development policy shall be developed integrating all types and branches of HRD institutions from ECE to tertiary education. The policy must keep market needs in view, including the flexibility in market trends, for Higher and Technical and Vocational Education.

2. This sector-wide planning shall be co-ordinated by a newly created Ministry of Human Resource Development that brings together responsibilities for different sub-sectors of education, training and learning.

5.2 ENSURING POLICY COHERENCE

99. Education policies have major intersections with other policies at the national level and sub-national levels. Policies for early childhood education (ECE), are closely linked to social welfare policies; education and skills for the labour market figure as a factor with employment, labour, economic and regional development policies. Policies in the higher education area, likewise, are closely linked with innovation, growth and industrial policies. They point to the need for coherence across many policy domains. A whole-of-sector-view is an essential input for achieving policy coherence. There are
parallels at the provincial level as well, though the need for a sector wide view may be less stringent.

Policy Action:

1. The new Ministry of Human Resource Development shall be responsible for bringing the sector-wide view to discussions of coherence with other socio-economic policies of the Government

5.3 OVERCOMING FRAGMENTED GOVERNANCE

100. Governance of education is the overarching framework that determines the ability of the state to meets its goals and targets; the responsibility to ensure that education of quality is available to all without discrimination. It cannot abdicate this responsibility to any other entity within (or outside) the country. The state dispenses its responsibility in education through direct service delivery as well as regulating the non-state interventions in the sector. The largest proportion of the service delivery in Pakistan remains with the public sector even as the private sector is growing. However, the current size of the private sector, including the propensity for continuous growth, calls for a more inclusive approach to dealing with education. An approach that considers the role of the private sector, its linkages with the rest and the possibilities of synergizing for improved outcomes.

101. Looking at the education sector vertically, Pakistan, like many other federal countries, has divided jurisdictional arrangements over education matters. Within a Province or Area Administration, jurisdiction over education is further divided across District and institutional levels. Given these divided jurisdictions, it is essential that the demarcation of responsibilities is clear. A lack of clarity in roles and responsibilities leads to unclear regimes of accountability and the possibility that responsibilities could fall between the stools of different levels of government.

102. Inter-tier roles are, in principle, clearly defined in the Constitution and its related Ordinances. The Constitution of the country puts education on the concurrent list as a national responsibility, which does not mean a Federal responsibility. It implies a collective national response of all the Provincial and Areas governments along with the Federal government as equal partners. The Federal Ministry of Education is required to co-ordinate and facilitate the process.

103. Considerable ambiguities can, however, arise in how the principles are applied in practice, as the principles of responsibility-sharing can be open to different interpretations. In the past, there has been a perception that the Federal Government may have extended its mandate, while some voices from the Provinces see little role for the Federal level.

104. The ambiguities that can arise concern with not only the Federal and the Provincial Governments but also, under the Devolution arrangements, between the Provincial and District administrations. The relations between the provincial governments and the local governments are in transition and there are a number of issues that need to be addressed. The main problem arises from an administrative instead of a functional division of powers between the provincial and the Local
Governments. Greater clarification will also be needed if decentralisation is pushed further to the school level. It is essential that different levels of governments should come together to articulate a clear understanding of inter-tier roles and responsibilities.

105. This process can be aided by strengthening the role of the Inter-Provincial Education Ministers’ (IPEM) Conference. Policy making shall remain a national function with participation from the Federal Government and the Provinces in a national forum. The role of the Federal government should be that of a facilitator and co-ordinator, while the IPEM would have oversight over implementation.

106. Inter-tier relations between the Provincial and District governments are still in a flux after Devolution. Within the local government itself, the process is even more complex as there has been centralization at the district level at the cost of the sub-division and union level and the demarcation lines are fluid. As a principle, Devolution is regarded as a step in the right direction, and decentralisation right down to the school level is imperative in the long run for improved service delivery in education, even though there may be teething problems as the policy is introduced.

Policy Actions:

1. To remove ambiguities between the different roles of Federal and Provincial Governments in the field of education, their respective role and responsibilities shall be mapped and clarified.

2. The Federal role shall be of a facilitator and co-ordinator. This should apply to not only the school level but also other levels and streams of education, including technical and vocational education.

3. National Education Policy-making shall be the responsibility of the Federal Government in consultation with the federating units.

4. The oversight of National Education Policy shall lie with the IPEM Conference, which shall review progress and implementation periodically.

5. An overarching framework shall be developed to aggregate the initiatives taken by education Ministry, departments and organizations. All these initiatives shall be coordinated to leverage their outputs in such a way that they respond to the emerging challenges of globalization era, in a concreted way.

6. Provinces shall clarify the principle of subsidiarity and the approach to devolution on the basis of achieving greater functional effectiveness.

7. Provinces shall establish District Education Boards for managing school education at the local level.

8. Decentralisation shall move to the school level, which shall become the basic unit for planning, including school-based budgeting. Towards this end, management and planning capacity shall be developed at the school level.

5.4 BRIDGING THE PUBLIC-PRIVATE DIVIDE

107. One manifestation of weak governance is the existence of insulated parallel systems of public and private education in Pakistan, which has caused a number of
problems. First, a small but important component of the private sector caters to the elite and offers high quality that only the rich can afford. Its long-term socio-economic impact is divisive for the society, not least in the relative neglect of improvements in the public sector. Second, Deeni Madrassahs form a component of the private sector. The parallel system in this case consists of a curriculum that lies outside the mainstream. Third, private sector establishments within the mainstream are not properly regulated, which can leave students unprotected. They do not often register with the Provincial authorities as they are required by law and do not often comply with the regulations. Registered private schools often charge more fees than they are authorized to take (the average household annual expenditure per student in a private establishment is reported to be four times greater). Similarly, private schools are being encouraged to offer admission and education services to 10% needy but meritorious students free of cost, a regulation that is not followed by most private establishments. Fourth, the curriculum and qualifications structures do not give a clear idea of their equivalence with public sector qualifications, which can put these students at a disadvantage. Finally, the public sector has failed to capitalise on the potential benefits of synergies from the growth in private sector.

108. Over the last few years, the private sector has been attempting to bridge the gaps and ills of our system like inequitable access, poor quality, high drop outs etc. These efforts have sometimes been through formal agreements with the relevant governments and sometimes on an informal basis. It is being increasingly felt to institutionalize the arrangement to receive optimal results across the country instead of incremental efforts in sporadic areas. The question arises of where the private sector can assist. Practically, in every possible educational input. The private sector can assist in all areas of educational inputs. Where exactly would depend on the specific area or domain. Some of these inputs, inter alia, include (The list is not exhaustive, nor does it identify areas that are new to the concept.):

1. School construction
2. Textbooks development
3. Libraries development including provision of supplementary reading material
4. Teacher education
5. Transportation
6. Food supplement to poor children
7. Literacy programs

109. There may be other forms also. All of these options can be evaluated for efficacy and then implemented according to local conditions and requirements. Some options already operational in the country are:

8. voucher systems in existing schools or adoption of ill performing public schools (already first practiced in Sindh by Sindh Education Foundation and now at a larger scale, by the Punjab Education Foundation in poorer districts of Punjab);
9. using premises and/or facilities of the public schools for higher than the existing level of schooling (first piloted by Punjab Education Department in 2003 and replicated by some other provinces at a small scale);
10. additional services like literacy centers after school timings of the morning shift in the public sector schools (also initiated by FDE in some ICT institutions in
Policy Actions:

1. Available educational resources in the private sector shall be mapped and information made available to all. The resources in this case would include more than simply private schools which already are part of the overall education census.

2. Transparent and clear procedures shall be initiated in the education sector to allow utilization of private sector inputs. Systems shall be developed through involvement of all stakeholders, the public sector, the private sector and the community.

3. Provincial Governments shall encourage private education at the school level as an additional option available to those who can afford such education. At the same time, Governments shall take steps to encourage public sector institutions to draw benefit from the resources available in the private sector.

4. A common curricular framework shall be applied to educational institutions in both the public and the private sector. Governments shall take steps to bring the public and private sectors in harmony through common standards, quality and regulatory regimes.

5. Where already a private school exists with additional admission space, the children shall be accommodated in it, through public financing and the public sector new school shall either be developed in separate vicinity or for different levels. Private sector schools shall be provided permission on a need cum quality basis.

6. The students of Madrassahs shall be brought at par with the students of formal public secondary schools through the introduction of formal subjects.

7. Provincial and Area Governments shall develop regulations for establishing and running private sector institutions that include transparent accountability procedures. Where such regulatory bodies have already been developed, those shall be reinvigorated.

8. Provincial and Area governments shall take steps to build capacity of the regulators to enable them to effectively monitor compliance by private sector institutions

5.5 Overcoming Structural Divides

110. There exists the challenge of ensuring a uniform system of education that provides level playing field for the children irrespective of their caste, creed, family’s economic capacity and religion, and in line with the fundamental rights and principles of policy as enshrined in the Constitution of Pakistan. The challenge is not merely of providing level playing field but also setting standards that ensure unity and uniformity in the education system. National educational systems always provide space for diverse demands of distinct ethnic, social, economic, religious, political groups and
communities. But this diversity has to be permitted within a broad based national vision and standardization that must direct all educational institutions irrespective of ownership or ideology.

111. Pakistan’s education system manifests parallel systems of public and private provision and within the private sector there is an English medium provision. These systems are largely divided on the basis of income status of parents and language of instruction. Performance in two sectors differs significantly in quality. Within the private sector are the English medium schools, generally of better quality but expensive and not well regulated. These divisions are in large measure a failure of governance of the system. Altogether, they are sowing the seeds of long run fissures that bode ill for both economic growth and social cohesion in the future.

112. Recognition of the importance of English in the modern world has been manifested in the policies of most countries. Many countries are reviewing their education policies for improving the proficiency of their students in the language. Pakistan’s policy is also based on the perception of increased importance of English language. It has been felt that the education sector, with the exception of a few elite schools, fails to produce the requisite proficiency. This has led to social exclusion of those who cannot afford to access these schools. There is also an opinion that the deficiency has impacted Pakistan’s potential to attract investment and benefit optimally from globalization. In Pakistan the best jobs, whether in the public or the private sector, are beyond the reach of those who lack proficiency in the English language

Policy Actions:

1. The state shall provide greater opportunities to the citizens and areas that had been largely excluded from the mainstream development and participation in the national processes by ensuring even and equitable human development across Pakistan.

2. Ministry of Education in consultation with Provincial and Area education departments, relevant professional bodies and the wider public, shall develop a comprehensive plan of action for implementing the English language policy in the shortest possible time, paying particular attention to disadvantaged groups and regions.

3. The curriculum from Class I onward shall include English (as a subject), Urdu, one regional language, mathematics along with an integrated subject.

4. The Provincial and Area Education Departments shall have the choice to select the medium of instruction up to Class V.

5. English shall be employed as the medium of instruction for sciences and mathematics from class IV onwards.

6. For 5 years Provinces shall have the option to teach mathematics and science in English or Urdu/official regional language, but after five years the teaching of these subjects shall be in English only.

7. Opportunities shall be provided to children from low socio-economic strata to learn English language.
5.6 Building Management and Planning Capacity

113. Educational management demands professional standards and expertise for which the traditional policy makers at the ministries or the head teachers are unprepared and untrained. At the institutional level, planning also takes time away from teaching responsibilities. Recognising this, many countries around the globe are paying special attention to training school leaders, and academies for school leadership are flourishing. In contrast, most persons at management positions in Pakistan’s education sector have no training in the function. Head teachers, DEOs, EDOs and DPIs are mostly appointed from amongst the teacher cadre (college or school), without much management experience.

114. The strategies in regard to Devolution require considerable strengthening of planning capacity at all levels of programme development and delivery. An important requirement for planning is the availability of standards for both input requirements and educational outcomes, which is lacking at present. It would be a responsibility of the Federal government, under the framework of IPEM, to develop a National Standards for Education.

115. Good planning also requires data and indicators of performance. These have been severely lacking at all levels of educational activity and performance. Recently the National Education Management Information System (NEMIS) has begun the process of computing indicators. However, these indicators are those that have been internationally identified and developed by UNESCO or by some of the donors for cross-cutting international programmes like Dakar Framework of Action for EFA and Fast Track Initiative (FTI) for EFA. It is essential to develop a data base that covers all planning needs specific to Pakistan’s context. The deficiencies in data developed by these systems led the government to undertake a comprehensive census, the National Education Census 2006, which for the first time also covered all non-state-owned institutions, colleges and universities. Although a major step forward, the census can only be taken once every few years and it does not meet many of the data needs of education policy planners.

116. While data limitations have been a real constraint in educational planning, insufficient use of data has been made in decision making and planning even when they have been available. This is partly due to the culture of not using quantitative analysis and partly because the managers lack the required training.

Policy Actions:

1. A management cadre for education, with specified training and qualification requirements, shall be introduced.

2. Education planners and decision makers shall be trained in the use and analysis of educational statistics to develop the practice of information-based decision making and planning.

3. The national standards approach shall be the criterion for a realistic assessment of resource requirements as well as a fair and equitable basis for allocation across institutions.
4. A Financial Management Information System shall be developed to support the planning, implementation and evaluation function. It shall be linked to the existing Educational Management and Information System (EMIS).

5. A National Standards and Certification Agency for EMIS shall be established to set and evaluate the quality of education data collection, analysis and use across all levels and tiers of the education management.

6. The Provincial and Area EMIS shall cater to the data needs of all tiers of the local governments. It shall also provide data to NEMIS for national aggregation on a routine and timely basis.

7. A separate database for literacy and non-formal education shall be developed.

5.7 GETTING STAKEHOLDERS INVOLVED

117. Effective implementation of policies is aided if the stakeholders have ownership of the policies. One weakness of the governance regime in Pakistan has been its weak performance in getting all stakeholders to have a say in policy development. Overall, most stakeholders are of the view that various experiments with School Management Committees (SMCs) or Parent Teachers Associations (PTAs) have had limited success. Most cases of success are either owed to a dynamic head teacher or a local non-government organisation that provides an interface between community and the school.

118. In most rural areas these organizations are controlled by politically influential persons who have little interest in school improvement. The SMCs function well as long as the finances allocated are unused. In other cases, finances remain unutilised because of fear of audit. Also, most head teachers have no training in working with communities and are unprepared for capitalising on the potential of SMCs. The main obstacle to greater success remains the lack of acceptance and comprehension of the concept at both the community as well as school level.

119. For the New Education Policy to succeed it has to be a collaborative exercise with the stakeholders, at all levels of education, policy development and programme delivery.

Policy Actions:

1. School Management Committees (SMC) shall be strengthened through involvement of students, teachers, educationists, parents and society (STEPS).

2. The tenure of the SMCs shall be lengthened so that the members are able to make use of their experience.

3. To promote greater utilisation of allocated funds, Governments shall move from financial audit to performance or output based audit system for SMCs.

4. Head teachers shall be trained in social mobilisation to involve community effectively.

5. Awareness campaigns shall be launched, at the District, Tehsil and Union levels, to sensitise communities about their role in school education.
120. There is a general agreement that the quality of education has been a major casualty of the system’s inefficiency. The biggest victim has been the public education system but quality cannot be assumed as given in the private schools. Efforts to increase enrollments are not sustainable in the absence of quality education in the country. Re-prioritization of quality can only be initiated with a common understanding of the term and then focusing on the major imports that impact it; these being curriculum, textbooks and learning materials, assessments, teachers and the learning environment available in an educational institution.

121. Broadening the base with quality is the most central strategic education policy priority. The superstructure of the knowledge society cannot be erected without a wide and high quality base that can feed quality human resources into all walks of societal endeavour, from the economic to the social. This chapter sets reforms for widening the base of education at the foundation level, in the areas of early childhood, primary and secondary education. Since much of non-formal and adult learning is also concerned with the foundation level learning, the chapter also presents reforms and policy actions for this sector.

6.1 EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION (ECE)

122. Early Childhood Education confers benefits to the child’s cognitive development and better social and emotional adaptation. Neurological studies have found that children’s brain development has particularly high potential around age three, when appropriate stimulating learning environment, which can just as well be playing activity, can increase the physical size of the brain itself. In economic terms, there are long-term positive effects of ECE on employment, labour force participation and earnings. The broader social impacts include better health, lower incidence of anti-social behaviour and greater civic participation. Studies estimate that ECE is a sound investment: for each dollar invested in quality early childhood education governments provides a return ranging anywhere from 2 to 13 dollars.

123. Historically, however, early childhood education has not been formally recognized by the public sector in Pakistan. The traditional ‘katchi’ class in some public sector schools has predominantly remained a familiarisation stage towards formal schooling for un-admitted, younger siblings of students. A limited part of the class I National Curriculum is taught to this group.

124. Against this background, for the first time in Pakistan’s history, ECE was included as a component in the Education Sector Reforms programme, and funding was provided to the provincial and district governments, which has also been included in the National Plan of Action of Education for All. Pakistan is committed to the Dakar Framework of Action, the first goal of which is to expand and improve comprehensive ECE for all children, especially for the most vulnerable and disadvantaged.
125. Progress has been achieved over the last few years, as noted in Chapter 1, but further action is required in three areas to improve provision of ECE across the country: (i) wider participation; (ii) better quality; and (iii) improved governance.

**Policy Actions:**

1. Improvements in quality of ECE shall be based on a concept of holistic development of the child that provides a stimulating, interactive environment, including play, rather than a focus on regimes that require rote learning rigid achievement standards.

2. The early childhood education (ECE) age group shall be recognised as comprising 3 to 5 years. At least one year pre-primary education shall be provided by the state and universal access to ECE shall be ensured within the next ten years.

3. Provision of ECE shall be attached to primary schools, and these schools shall be provided with additional budget, teachers and assistants for this purpose.

4. For ECE teachers, a two-year specialised training in dealing with young children shall be a necessary requirement.

5. This training shall be on the basis of ECE revised national curriculum. The curriculum and support material for ECE shall take account of the cultural diversity of particular areas.

### 6.2 Elementary Education

126. Primary education is not a strong link in education in Pakistan. The Policy focuses attention on two large and critical problems facing the sector: (i) low participation and narrow base of the sector, and (ii) weak quality of provision.

127. Despite some progress in recent years, access rates remain low, as noted in Chapter 1. Net enrolment rates at 66% for primary are the lowest compared to the selected reference countries. Even though these 2005 rates have improved in 2006-07, Pakistan still faces the risk of defaulting on EFA 2015 targets. The narrow base is further attenuated through high drop out rates. The survival rate to Grade 5 is 72%. Of those who succeed in completing Grade 5, there is a further loss to the system through those not making the transition to the secondary level. Pakistan cannot afford to live with the narrow base in the perspective of long term economic and social development of the nation.

**Policy Actions:**

1. Government shall provide the necessary financial resources to achieve the EFA goals.

2. All primary schools shall be upgraded to middle level.

3. International Development Partners shall be invited through a well-developed plan for expanding school facilities.
4. High priority shall be paid to reducing the drop-out rates. An important element of this effort should be to provide financial support to children who drop out because of poverty.

5. Schools shall be made more attractive for retaining the children by providing attractive learning environment and other measures.

6.3 Secondary and Higher Secondary Education

128. The secondary and higher secondary school system prepares young people for life. It has two important roles in this respect – providing skills to the labour market, as many students leave formal schooling at this time; and providing input to the tertiary system, for those who go on to this level of learning. The policy questions are, whether the system provides an adequate base for both these functions. Quite apart from the quality of instruction at this level, a central question that Pakistan education policy makers must confront is whether the level of skill development and preparation that can be achieved by twelve years of school education is sufficient as a terminal qualification.

129. The system as it exists has shortcomings in two main respects: it has a narrow base that leaves a large number of young people outside the system and the quality of skills it produces is not well matched with the needs of the labour market. The policy actions needed to address these concerns include several that have been outlined in the section 5.2 above dealing with elementary education. The additional reform initiatives described below are specifically meant for secondary and upper secondary education.

130. Access and participation rates at this level of schooling in Pakistan are low in comparison to reference countries. Pakistan’s national average ratio of secondary to primary school is 1:6 but, in certain parts of the country, it reaches the high figure of 1:13. There is a clear need for expanding the provision. At the same time, efforts have to be made to cut the high drop out rates and induce more out of school youths back to the school system, particularly the girls whose participation is still very low.

Policy Actions:

1. Provision shall be expanded, particularly in the rural areas and of schools dedicated for girls. Priority shall be given to those locations where the ratio of secondary schools is low.

2. Student support shall be increased to prevent students from dropping out of school for financial reasons.

3. Schools shall introduce more student-centred pedagogies.

4. Counselling facilities shall be made available to students from the elementary level onwards in order to constructively utilize their energy, to deal with any displays of aggression amongst young students and to address any other psychological distress that a student may be in, by suggesting a suitable remedy.

5. Counselling at higher secondary level must also address the career concerns of young students and encourage them to take up studies as per their aptitude other
than the “accepted” fields of study, be it technical, vocational or any other area of study

6. Schooling shall also be made more attractive by adding community service programmes.

7. The integration / restructuring process between secondary and upper secondary levels shall be facilitated by moving Grades 11 and 12 from college level and merging with higher secondary level schooling.

8. A system for ranking of primary and secondary educational institutions across the country shall be introduced with rankings based on result outcomes, extracurricular activities and facilities provided to the students, in order to encourage healthy competition between schools.

9. To create an order for excellence in the country, a “National Merit Programme” shall be introduced to award bright students

6.4 LITERACY AND NON-FORMAL LEARNING

131. Literacy training and non-formal learning can be two different types of activities although with a large overlap. Non-formal learning can take the form of literacy training but it also includes a variety of other types of learning activities such as skill training on the job and traditional apprenticeships. In Pakistan’s context, the literacy programs generally consider adults and young people who are out of school. The non-formal learning includes these categories but also other on the job learning that youths and adults might participate in, which may not have raising literacy as its objective.

132. There are multiple causes of low literacy: social taboos, poverty, child labour, and illiteracy of the parents/families and institutional weaknesses. Efforts to combat illiteracy have been half hearted, disjointed and not suited to local conditions and requirements. At the provincial level, there is a lack of uniformity in existing structures, and the set up varies from province to province.

133. There is also a question of what priority literacy promotion should be given in the public budget when resources are not available for basic facilities in the primary schools, although the private sector can contribute resources in this field of learning. The case for improving literacy is based on both its economic and social benefits, quite apart from the large benefit that accrues to the individual in the form of personal development.

134. In the economic field, literacy scores contribute to higher productivity, a contribution that is in addition to the contribution made by years of schooling. A more literate person has higher participation rates in the labour force, is more likely to be an entrepreneur, and is more open to adopting new techniques of production. A literate parent contributes to better leaning achievement for his or her children.

135. There are, as well, wider social benefits of literacy that have been estimated empirically. There is a noticeable impact on health. A literate person is more likely to have better health and incur less expenditures costs on health maintenance.

Participation in civic activities and democratic processes are more likely with literacy than without. The most important social objective served by literacy is achieving greater social inclusiveness.

136. There are four main difficulties with current literacy and non-formal learning programme, which needs to be addressed. First, the quality of such programmes is variable as they are not regulated by some minimum quality standards. One reason for the often poor quality of the programmes is low quality of teachers, which is also not regulated. Second, a certification and accreditation regime is missing. There are no benchmarks or standards that can be used for assessing literacy programmes. As a consequence, it is difficult to link the certificate offered by these programmes to formal learning opportunities. Hence, graduates of these programmes find it difficult to enter into the formal sector. Third, current literacy programmes are also not well-linked to employment opportunities. Fourth, literacy programmes are often found to be effective if there is a follow-up programme of reinforcement, which are lacking at present.

Policy Actions:

1. Government shall develop a national literacy curriculum and identify the instructional material and professional development programmes to support the curriculum. The curriculum shall be objective driven, so as to facilitate assimilation of trainees into mainstream economic activity.

2. Government shall develop and enforce minimum quality standards for organisations involved in literacy in the form of literacy certification and accreditation regime. The literacy providers shall be required to offer the literacy programmes according to the specified standards.

3. A system shall be developed to mainstream the students in non-formal programmes between the ages of 11 and 16 into public education system, and a system of equivalence shall be developed to permit such mainstreaming. New literates shall receive formal certification so as to facilitate their entry into government schools.

4. Linkages of non-formal education with industry and internship programmes shall be developed to enhance economic benefits of participation.

5. Horizontal linkages between schools and vocational/skills training centres shall be established.

6. Government schools shall initiate non-formal education stream for child labourers. Children involved in various jobs or work shall be brought within the ambit of non-formal education system with need-based schedules and timings.

7. Special literacy skills programmes shall target older child labourers, boys and girls (14 to 17 years). Special educational stipends shall be introduced to rehabilitate child labourers.

8. Arrangements shall be made to use school buildings for adult literacy after school hours.

9. Government shall develop guidelines for post-programme initiatives. Regular follow-up shall be made a part of the literacy programs.
Steps shall be taken to ensure that teachers for adult learners and non-formal education are properly trained.

Community and private sector involvement in awareness programmes, content, design and availability of facilities, shall be mobilised.

6.5 Education in Emergencies

Pakistan has endured large scale emergencies in recent years and along with other aspects of life, education has suffered greatly through inadequate planning. Pakistan’s education system has not recognised the need for preparation of individuals and groups to grapple with the demands of emergencies through organised and effective responses. Credible rehabilitation and disaster management plans need to be put in place to ensure early restoration of education service. School education must prepare pupils for organised, ameliorative responses.

Policy Actions:

1. Awareness shall be raised amongst the students regarding emergency situations, natural disasters and school safety so as to inform their behaviour in the times of such crisis

2. Curriculum for each level of education, shall integrate information on emergencies, natural disasters and trauma management

3. Curriculum for Civics of secondary and higher secondary level (Grades 9 to 12) shall formally address response in an emergency or disaster, on the basis of latest international best practices.

4. Teacher education/training programmes shall include provisions to enable the teacher to address education in emergencies,

5. A repository of all emergency related materials, manuals, guidelines, minimum standards and research pertaining to education shall be maintained at the respective departments of education, teachers training institutions and universities.

6. Disaster Management Plans shall include education delivery mechanism for rehabilitation.
CHAPTER 7.
RAISING THE QUALITY OF EDUCATION

138. Defining quality is elusive but some parameters will need to be drawn. There is an impending need to debate and agree on what constitutes quality at each stage of education and the system overall. Based on this, some standards will need to be defined and pursued through development of policies, strategies and plans which target them. The recently completed NEAS 2007 points to significant quality deficits and confirms the widespread perception of the low quality of Pakistan’s education. Improving quality requires action in the areas of teacher quality, curriculum and pedagogy, textbooks, assessment approaches, and in learning environment and facilities. In developed countries, close to two thirds of children’s performance in early schooling depends on factors outside the school, namely on the home environment, the socio-economic status of parents, parent education particularly the mother’s, and the learning resources available at home. Of the remaining one-third, teacher quality and leadership at school are believed to be the more important factors. Most of the inputs in the system have an impact on quality. However, there are five- six basic pillars that have the major contribution. These are curriculum, textbooks, assessments, teachers, the learning environment in an institution and relevance of education to practical life/labour market. While elementary schooling is facing many deficiencies in each of the input areas that would need to be improved; the most significant action is required in improving the teaching resources and the pedagogical approaches teachers employ. The reform of teaching quality is of the highest priority.

7.1 IMPROVING TEACHER QUALITY

139. There is a consensus amongst all stakeholders that the quality of teachers in the public sector is unsatisfactory. Poor quality of teacher in the system in large numbers is owed to the mutations in governance, an obsolete pre-service training structure and a less than adequate in service training regime. Presence of incompetence in such a huge quantity and permeation of malpractices in the profession have eroded the once exalted position enjoyed by teachers under the eastern cultural milieu. Teaching has become the employment of last resort of most educated young persons; especially males.

140. Reform is required in all areas: pre-service training and standardization of qualifications; professional development; teacher remuneration, career progression and status; and governance and management of the teaching workforce. The growth of private sector is adding new complexities to the teaching profession and needs to be taken into account in any reform of the system.

Policy Actions:

1. A Bachelors degree, with a B.Ed., shall be the requirement for teaching at the elementary level. A Masters level for the secondary and higher secondary, with a B.Ed., shall be ensured by 2018. PTC and CT shall be phased out through

38 Teachers Matter: Attracting, Developing and Retaining Effective Teachers, OECD 2005.
encouraging the present set of teachers to improve their qualifications, while new hiring shall be based on the advanced criteria.

2. Teacher training arrangements, accreditation and certification procedures shall be standardised and institutionalised.

3. Teacher education curriculum shall be adjusted to the needs of the school curriculum and scheme of studies. The curriculum shall include training for student-centred teaching, cross-curricular competencies, and an on-site component.

4. A separate cadre of specialised teacher trainers shall be developed.

5. Governments shall take steps to ensure that teacher recruitment, professional development, promotions and postings are based on merit alone.

6. All teachers shall have opportunities for professional development through a programme organised on a three-year cyclic basis. Progress in career shall be linked to such professional development.

7. Recruitment of Teachers and running of Teachers Training Programmes shall be done at the District level, so as to reduce the problem of absentee teachers and the negligence of schools in remote areas.

8. Teacher allocation plans, likewise, shall be based on schools needs and qualifications of teachers. Over the course of next two years, Governments shall develop a rationalised and need-based school allocation of teachers, which should be reviewed and modified annually.

9. To control absenteeism and multiple job-holding, Provincial and Area Administrations shall develop EMIS data on teacher deployment.

10. Institutionalised and standardised in-service teacher training regime shall be established in those provinces where it has not already been done.

11. In-service training shall cover a wide range of areas: pedagogy and pedagogical content knowledge; subject content knowledge; testing and assessment practices; multi-grade teaching, monitoring and evaluation; and programmes to cater to emerging needs like trainings in languages and ICT.

12. Training needs shall be assessed on the basis of research and training programmes.

13. Governments shall take steps to improve social status and morale of teachers. These include: Upgrading of teacher salaries as part of establishing a separate teaching cadre and teaching career; teachers' professional development, and a reward system based on performance measures.

14. The teaching workforce shall be managed on a truly professional basis, organised as a specialised function.

15. The voice of teachers associations shall be given due consideration in decisions on collective issues affecting teachers.

16. Governments shall aim to draw upon resources from the private sector through public-private partnerships, especially in the areas of teacher education and professional development programmes.
17. International Development Partners’ resources shall be harnessed within a broad national programme of teacher improvement for the country as a whole through inter-tier collaboration.

7.2 CURRICULUM REFORM

141. Curriculum is the guide that delineates the learning path of a student. It also determines the process of this learning. Normally a curriculum should have the teacher as the centre but textbooks development appears to be the only activity flowing from the curriculum. In the classroom teachers do not use it being solely focussed on the single textbook assigned to them. Even assessments are based on this textbook and not the curriculum.

142. The curriculum also does not cater to the diverse conditions in the education sector itself (e.g. multi-grade classes), as well as, the variations within the geographical breadth of the country. Pakistan is blessed with a multitude of cultures and topographies, these fail to be adequately recognized and assimilated by the education system. In basic primary education the most important missing element is the diffused focus on the local context. However efforts have been made to overcome the deficiencies in curriculum development and its translation into meaningful knowledge.

143. A comprehensive review of school curricula was initiated in 2005. The Curriculum Wing of the Ministry of Education, strengthened by professionals from the field, reviewed the scheme of studies in the first phase. In the second phase, the revised curricula for 23 core subjects (classes I to XII) were notified in 2007. The review of remaining subjects as listed in the scheme of studies is in progress and will continue during 2008. Comparison of current curriculum with curricula of different countries; consultations with teachers, administrators, educationists, curriculum experts and students; field visits to collect feedback from teachers and stakeholders; identification and training of working teams through workshops and seminars; reviews of drafts by subject experts and working teachers leading to further revision and refinement of contents; and preparation of a uniform curriculum format consisting of standards, benchmarks and learning outcomes were vital parts of the curriculum development process.

Policy Actions:

1. Curriculum development shall be objective driven and outcome based. It shall focus on learning outcomes rather than content. It shall closely reflect important social issues; provide more room for developing the capacity for self-directed learning, the spirit of inquiry, critical thinking, problem-solving and team-work; and local contextual material.

2. The curriculum development and review process shall be standardised and institutionalised within the framework of the Federal Supervision of Curricula, Textbooks and Maintenance of Standards of Education Act, 1976.

3. Curriculum shall emphasize the fundamental rights guaranteed to the citizens of Pakistan, so that each individual shall develop within himself/herself and the
society at large, a civic culture strong enough to withstand any extra constitutional interference which threatens those rights.

4. Environmental education shall be made an integral part of early education.

5. Use of ICT in Education shall be promoted.

6. Curriculum shall include health education. This education will among other things help in (i) Awareness of fatal diseases such as HIV/AIDS and prevention of harmful practises (ii) Detection and prevention of child abuse in many cases.

7.3 Quality in Textbooks and Learning Materials

144. Ministry of Education in consultation with Provincial/Area Education Departments, constituted a committee to design and recommend a Textbook Policy for improvement in Textbooks and Learning Materials. A comprehensive dialogue, involving all stakeholders, led to the notification of a ‘National Textbook and Learning Materials Policy and Plan of Action’ in June 2007.

145. The objective of the exercise was defined as: “Improvement in the quality of education at all levels through better quality textbooks at affordable prices and other learning materials for promoting Pakistan as a knowledge-based society……Choice and competition are major forces in achieving this objective. Choice on the part of the buyer promotes acquisition of knowledge, empowerment and participation. Competition on the part of the producer leads to a wider variety of products, improved quality, availability and better prices”.

Policy Actions:

1. A well regulated system of competitive publishing of textbooks and learning materials shall be introduced.

2. Textbook Boards shall be transformed into competent facilitating, regulating and monitoring authorities. The Boards shall review and help support the process of approval of textbooks for use in schools in their respective areas of jurisdiction.

3. A Provincial /Area Committee comprising representatives of the education authorities, Textbook Boards, the private sector, teachers and other stakeholders shall be formed to select and prescribe textbooks for use in public schools in the respective province or areas of jurisdiction. Private sector schools shall be free to use from amongst the books authorised by the respective Textbook Board.

4. Federal and Provincial Governments shall arrange for the Textbook Boards to provide assistance in capacity development for the national and/or provincial publishing industry to become competitive players in an expanded education publishing market.

5. As part of the review and approval process, Textbook Boards shall seek a no objection certificate from Federal Ministry of Education, Curriculum Wing.

6. Federal and Provincial / Area Governments shall increase investments in school libraries and supplementary reading, teacher guides, teachers’ training and learning materials.

7. An “Inter-Provincial Standing Committee on Textbook Policy” shall be established to regulate operational and procedural issues, and monitor and coordinate further implementation process. Curriculum Wing of Federal Ministry of Education shall be the secretariat for the Committee and shall be strengthened for the expanded tasks.

8. Implementation of the new system of regulated competitive publishing of textbooks and learning materials shall start with the introduction of revised National Curricula.

9. Special textbooks shall be prepared to cater to multi-grade environments. Alternately supplementary reading material that helps self learning must be developed for such environments.

7.4 IMPROVING STUDENT ASSESSMENT

146. Assessment systems are quality measures that cater to a number of requirements of the education system. These can be used to measure overall system efficiency as well as individual students’ performance for movement in the education system. A comprehensive assessment design would provide feedback for improvements at all tiers starting from changes in the classroom to improvements in the national systems.

147. Assessment system currently suffers from several deficiencies in promoting quality education. The one with more sinister outcomes is the practise of rote learning which stops the mental growth of the child and blocks innovative learning. Efforts have to be made to address this issue and need for inculcating critical and analytical thinking skills for producing life-long independent learners have to be emphasized. Assessment mechanism should be such that analytical thinking and critical reflections are tapped and encouraged.

148. The recent work of the National Education Assessment System and the Punjab Examination Commission shall be continued and further in reforming the system across the country.

Policy Actions:

1. Education system needs to be internationally competitive and Pakistan shall make efforts to offer itself for international level academic assessments by 2012.

2. Student performance shall be based on assessing competence in a specialised area that requires a given skill set. There shall be periodic reviews of the assessment system.

3. Multiple assessment tools in addition to traditional examinations shall be explored, to ensure the right balance between the uses of formative assessment approaches combined with the summative approach of high-stakes examinations.
4. National standards shall be developed to reduce the differences in quality across regions. Assessment processes shall be standardised and become uniform across the Boards over time so that students appearing in examinations under different Boards can expect to receive the same grades.

5. A centralised assessment system through gradual reduction of the number of boards shall be achieved within the next five years.

6. The Education Boards shall be responsible for capacity building of paper setters and examiners.

7. A comprehensive plan shall be prepared to eliminate cheating from examinations and shall address social attitudes towards the issue.

8. A quality cycle management shall link the various systems of assessment and institutions involved in assessment (examinations, NEAS/PEAC, continuous assessment) to provide feedback to curriculum development, textbooks development and teacher education and professional development.

7.5 Attaining Standards in the Learning Environment

149. In an average rural area of Pakistan, a five or six year old child walks to the school dreading what he or she would face. Children are scared of the teacher for de facto corporal punishment exists in all provinces, although Punjab has managed some interesting counters. They know that they may have to sit on cold floor in winters and a hot one in summers provided they are lucky enough to have a school building otherwise the tree is the only shade available to the children. Toilets are a luxury and where in some schools they exist, the ratio is extremely unwise. These issues are linked to poverty irrespective of the locale. Library facilities are very rudimentary and teaching aid material is generally in short supply. Games, sports and other co-curricular activities such as debating contests, drawing competitions, skills/ arts and crafts training, and cultural activities that positively contribute to the overall development of school children are missing from most schools. School infrastructure facilities are highly inadequate, especially in rural areas. In public sector, around 38% of schools are without boundary walls, 32% without drinking water facilities, 56% without electricity, 40% without sanitary facilities and 6% without any buildings.

150. One element of the learning environment consists of teacher-student relationship. Although firm data are not available, anecdotal evidence suggests that corporal punishment exists in all provinces.

Policy Actions:

1. A framework setting out the basic standards for school facilities and teaching aid materials shall be established by 2012 and shall form the basis for allocation of funds.

2. All schools shall establish a school mission that assists students in achieving their learning potential and personality development as the key goals. Pursuant

---

to this, co-curricular and extra-curricular activities shall be made a mandatory part of the entire learning process.

3. A concept of service to the society shall be introduced

4. Student-teacher ratios shall be standardized and enforced at school level

5. An awareness campaign against corporal punishment shall be initiated and teachers shall be held accountable for violations.

6. A study for analyzing the impact of modern media on children with a view to realize its potential to help in attaining the objectives of the education system shall be undertaken. This must encapsulate the negative impacts and the possible ways to mitigate them.

7. A code of conduct shall be established which shall enable student unions to participate in healthy activities without affecting the environment of the educational institutions.

7.6 MATCHING WITH THE LABOUR MARKET

Policy Actions:

1. Courses at the secondary and higher secondary level shall be reviewed with a view to making them more relevant to the needs of the labour market in order to better prepare those students not going on to further studies.

2. A study shall be conducted to evaluate the impact of technical matriculation and explore ways of introducing an improved system of technical and vocational education at high school level. The stream shall offer two-way link with the academic stream and also provide links to a revamped vocational and technical sector at higher levels.

3. Approaches shall be found to provide students with a window to the world of work. This could involve short assignments with the local enterprises and institutions or ‘job shadowing’ approaches to familiarise students with the work environment.

4. A career guidance and service shall be introduced at secondary and upper secondary levels, if not in each school, at least for school clusters. This shall involve local employers in providing information about job openings and the nature of work requirements.
CHAPTER 8.
STRENGTHENING SKILL DEVELOPMENT AND INNOVATION

151. Pakistan’s Technical and Vocational Education (TVE) is not a major supplier of skills to the country’s labour market. The supply from the higher education sector is primarily academic and theory-oriented. Both these sectors operate in some isolation from the needs of the labour market. Furthermore, the research effort of the universities has very weak links with the innovation processes and requirements of the national economy. Combating these two deficiencies is the main focus of the educational reforms of post-secondary education. The long term goal of these reforms is to generate a quality base of breadth that can meet the needs of growth and innovation of a high value-added and knowledge economy. The reforms also aim at making Pakistan a significant ‘Talent Source’ at the international level so that the country can attract high FDI flows and quality foreign enterprises, particularly in the service sector.

8.1 TECHNICAL, VOCATIONAL AND PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION

152. The share and importance of the TVE sector in total enrolment vary greatly among countries. But in most countries, the relative share of the applied proportion of the tertiary sector is higher than the 18.5% in Pakistan. Hence the base of technical and vocational skills provided to the economy in Pakistan is both narrow and of low quality. The inadequate quality stems from both a smaller number of total years of preparation and limitations of the curriculum, compared to the more advanced systems.

153. The reasons for these problems lie partly in the history of the education sector. At the time of country’s independence, there were only few industries in the country, and the skills required by the colonial government were largely of general academic type for serving the administrative needs of the government. Even a general matriculation certificate with no technical or vocational content was deemed satisfactory to fill most of the junior level administrative and service jobs. The academic degrees of Bachelors of Arts and Masters of Arts were sufficient to fill the requirements for higher level jobs. This tradition has largely been maintained since the Independence, even though the economic structure of the country has changed significantly. The demand-pull effects have had limited effect on educational provision.

154. The neglect of the TVE sector is another serious limitation of the sector. The certificate and diploma programmes do not seem to have a progression ladder into higher level skills. They do not provide entry claims into the tertiary sector with credit recognition in both the academic and applied streams. In addition to this blocked forward linkage, the backward linkage with apprentice training in the traditional sector is missing. There is no provision whereby the traditional apprenticeship experience in the non-formal sector could be assessed and certified for entry into the formal sector of vocational education. The current TVE certificate stream is too narrow in its scope and does not cover the large variety of skills training that takes place in the traditional sector. Two way cross-over between the academic and the applied / professional streams is lacking in our system. The absence of a well-articulated qualifications system is a major structural shortcoming of Pakistan’s education sector.
Another problem specific to the vocational/technical and professional sector is the fragmented structure of governance. Many institutions and jurisdictions are involved in governance of this field without a clear demarcation of their respective responsibilities. There is no focal point for coherent planning for the sector.

At the same time, the voices of the important stakeholders such as the business sector are not adequately taken into account in shaping the content, structures and certification of study programmes. The TVE sector does not benefit from good collaboration and input from the business sector, such as for updating its equipments and teaching materials. Resultantly, there are perennial complaints from employers about the substandard quality of the skills available in the market.

The Policy recognises the high importance of developing a broad-based and high quality sector for providing technical skills. As the manufacturing and services sectors have expanded, skill requirements of the country have changed as well, and there are needs for technical and vocational skills even in the traditional sector as it adopts more productive techniques of production. The technical intensity of production processes will increase as new technologies become more pervasive, thereby raising the demand for TVE skills of a higher quality.

Combined with this demand pull force within the country, Pakistan could benefit from a forward looking supply strategy of producing a sophisticated skill base to meet the anticipated growth in global demand for such skills and to attract multinationals and FDI looking to locate where quality skills supply is available at reasonable cost. Pakistan has not performed so well in this regard in comparison to India, which has developed a wider and more qualified skill base to the point that it can export high value added services. The current global talent deficit is expected to expand rapidly and Pakistan needs to be well poised to benefit from this expanding demand.

In view of the foregoing analysis, the Policy addresses three principal problems faced by the sector: (i) its weak linkages with other education sectors and the labour market, (ii) deficiencies in the governance of the sector; and (iii) the need to expand supply of technical skills.

**Policy Actions:**

1. A National Qualifications Framework (NQF) shall be established along with a changed program structure that encompasses all qualifications in the country, both academic and vocational/technical. The NQF shall be competency based and provide entry points and progression routes throughout the structure of qualifications. In particular, it shall provide the possibilities of two-way cross-over between the academic and the applied streams, with clearly mapped out recognition of credit points for each competency level.

2. The business sector, in particular, shall be included in advising on the course and programme content, and in providing training positions and job shadowing opportunities for students in the applied streams. The business sector could also help teachers by giving specialised lectures and short training programmes.

3. All administrative jurisdictions and stakeholders shall be involved in a consultative process to develop the NQF programme. Expertise shall be sought from countries that have applied the NQF approach in recent years.
4. To address the problem of fragmented governance structure, a coordination mechanism between higher education, school education and technical, vocational education shall be developed.

5. Government shall develop a suitable framework for technical and scientific education and training with close involvement of Chambers of Commerce and Industry.

6. Commerce stream should also be introduced under technical education and vocational training regimes.

7. Curriculum should be updated on regular basis

8. Public Private Partnerships (PPP) should be strengthened in this area.

9. A regular tracking system shall be instituted for graduates to get feedback on relevancy

10. B.Tech technologists must also be registered by the Pakistan Engineering Council

11. There shall be a:
   i. vocational training facilities at tehsil level
   ii. polytechnic institute for every District (Agency in FATA)
   iii. colleges of technology in each Province/Area on a needs basis.
CHAPTER 9.
HIGHER EDUCATION

160. Good quality, merit-oriented, equitable and efficient higher education is the most crucial instrument for translating the dream of a knowledge-based economy into reality. The tertiary sector contributes as well in the attainment of social goals of developing civic responsibility, social cohesion and a more tolerant society. For this reason, to its traditional functions of producing skilled labour force and crafting new knowledge through research, a third is being added world over, that of service to society. It includes contribution to the innovation process, economic growth, sustainable development and social cohesion.

9.1 DEFICIENCIES OF THE HIGHER EDUCATION SYSTEM

161. Judged against this background, the higher education system in Pakistan does not perform well. Its relatively tiny size – only 3.7% of the 18 to 23 age cohort participates in higher education. Even though enrolment in both public and private institutions is increasing rapidly at approximately 30% per year, the gross enrolment ratio does not compare well with its competitors such as India (7%) and Malaysia (12%)\(^ {41} \).

162. There are deficiencies in the quality of both skills and research output of the sector. Few of Pakistan’s public sector universities are ranked among the world’s top 500 universities. The number of faculty members having PhD degrees is low at 25%. The pass rates of undergraduates are also low and international recognition of qualifications limited for most universities. Although the per capita expenditure per student is many times higher than in the secondary sector, the sector used to be poorly funded for appropriate infrastructure including libraries, laboratories, scientific equipment, teaching aids, and high speed internet connection.

163. Another reason of inadequate quality comes from the lack of specialisation among universities as public universities compete in offering the widest variety of disciplines and spread their scarce resources too thinly. They are not selective in specialising in a few areas to develop the requisite critical mass of resources required for achieving higher quality. Universities in the private sector, on the other hand, have tended to specialise in market-oriented disciplines like IT, Management Sciences and Business, and there are complaints, in this sector as well, about their quality.

164. The scale, quality and institutional arrangements of the sector are insufficient to support innovation in the economy or attract high flows of foreign capital to its skill base. The R&D capacity is very limited and there is little culture and few institutional arrangements to achieve knowledge transmission to the productive sector through university-industry partnerships. Precisely speaking, the Higher Education Sector in Pakistan faces numerous challenges in implementing its reform agenda, but the following have been identified as key issues to be addressed:

1. Poor standard of faculty and lack of training / capacity building
2. Low enrollment in higher education

\(^ {41} \) Higher Education Commission’s presentation made to NEP Review Team on August 22, 2006.
3. Minimal relevance of higher education to national needs and lack of compatibility to International Standards
4. Low quality of research and lack of relevance to national requirements
5. Poor Governance of Universities

On the governance side, the issue of provincial and federal domains again creates a problem specifically at the under-graduate or the college level. Though the curricula are determined at the Federal level and the degrees awarded by universities working under the control of the Higher Education Commission, the administrative control of colleges themselves lies with the provincial governments.

9.2 STEPS SUGGESTED IN HEC-MTDF 2005-2010

165. The Higher Education Commission’s Medium Term Development Framework (MTDF) 2005-2010, addresses these challenges in a comprehensive way. This development framework combines HEC’s vision for higher education in responding to domestic and global challenges, with the practical steps needed to deliver the HEC’s contribution to the reform agenda set out in the HEC Mission document.

1. Faculty are the heart and soul of the university, and without an active and well qualified faculty it will not be possible to have meaningful development in this sector.

2. Faculty development can not be viewed in isolation and must be considered together with the development of an environment conducive to academics, as well as research and development in the universities. Faculty development programmes must also address factors pertaining to retention of qualified faculty in the public sector higher education institutions.

3. Institutions of higher learning are knowledge repositories whose faculty and students accrue knowledge and apply it to understand and address “local” issues.

4. An integral role of higher education institutions is in assisting with policy making and serving as “think tanks” to the public and private sector.

5. In line with the worldwide paradigm shift from “Teaching” to “Learning”, programs of study will focus on ensuring maximal absorption of subject matter by the students.

6. Faculty training in pedagogical, communication and ICT skills is required at all levels to enhance the efficiency of teaching in higher education.

7. The higher education system and institutions must accord high priority to ensuring the quality of services and quality of outcomes. Internal quality assurance processes of higher education institutions must be strengthened to conform to international standards of quality assurance.

---

8. While building the higher education sector priority should be given to recognizing excellence and supporting it.

9. To ensure that reform initiatives are aligned with development objectives, the engagement of key stakeholders of the higher education sector in the decision making processes is of utmost importance, particularly in ensuring the relevance of educational and research programmes to economic imperatives.

10. Changing innovation processes and the evolution of the relative contribution made by the private and public sectors have emphasized the need for strong industry-university linkages, allowing both sectors to interact and collaborate on joint projects.

11. Engineers build nations and engineering education must receive priority, especially in engineering disciplines of immediate economic relevance to major industry sectors such as:
   a. Information and Computerization Technology
   b. Petroleum Sector
   c. Mining
   d. Construction
   e. Textile and Manufacturing
   f. Engineering Design, etc
   g. Biotechnology and Nanotechnology.

12. In the modern global knowledge-economy, employers increasingly look to universities and colleges to deliver the well-educated workforce they require in the form of rounded, flexible, and readily employable graduates to remain competitive.

13. A broad-based education system is required to ensure that graduates have not only mastered their respective areas of specialization but are also able to effectively interact with people having a wide variety of backgrounds.

14. Graduates of the higher education system must have the ability to communicate effectively both in reading and in writing.

15. In the rapidly changing global economy, the labour market constantly requires new and different skills, requiring mechanisms to be enhanced to allow professionals to upgrade their skills at regular intervals and develop new competencies through lifelong learning. Higher education institutions are required therefore to offer learning opportunities in response to diverse demands and work cooperatively with stakeholders to ensure that the appropriate courses are readily available.

16. Brain Drain is a daunting problem for Pakistan. Whilst it is essential to maintain mobility, and a source of intellectual enrichment, measures are to be introduced to encourage Pakistanis to return to their country of origin and to take part in its economic, social and cultural development.
17. The Higher Education sector is a major force for innovation. Universities and colleges through local, regional, national and international partnerships must share their expertise and facilities to support socioeconomic regeneration and growth.

18. Knowledge creation and diffusion are increasingly important drivers of innovation, sustainable economic growth and social well-being. Research is to be reconfirmed as a fundamental activity of institutions and the establishment and long term sustainability of a dynamic research sector in universities, that engages stakeholders in its activities, is key to achieve economic competitiveness.

19. It is widely recognized that transferring knowledge effectively is often as important as original scholarship. Incentives are to be provided to ensure that scientists who produce innovative research and work to disseminate its findings receive recognition and support. In addition, stakeholders who depend on the work of researchers are to be reassured that the investment of public funding is sustainable and directed toward areas of national interest.

20. Competitive research grants on funding must be available to ensure that the best ideas in area of importance are recognized, and allowed to develop.

21. Opportunities for collaboration with the world scholarly community should be provided for both post-graduate students and faculty alike.

22. It is imperative that award of Ph.D. degrees should signify original contribution to the world body of knowledge as certified by International experts.

23. Institutions of higher learning should be encouraged and supported to ensure “productive” research output and generate intellectual property through set up of technology Industries Centres.

24. Universities of technology should be established to produce technologists required by industry.

25. National Centres in areas of economic importance should be identified and strengthened to top world standards.

26. HEC envisions the universities and institutions of higher learning and research to play a catalytic role in the economic development of the region in which they are located. Development projects should therefore be initiated with a vision of sustainable economic development in the region in which the Institution is located.

27. Determined efforts are essential to increase access to higher education for under-represented groups. The strategy here will be two-faceted: firstly to promote cultural change in instilling the value of higher education amongst citizens; and secondly to tackle the primary barrier of prohibitive costs of higher education. Distance education and open learning can play a major role in widening access.

28. Extensive access to higher education will first require optimal usage of existing physical infrastructure. It will be necessary however to invest in
equipment, laboratory facilities and space to cater to the demand of enhanced enrolment.

29. Modern information and communications technologies (ICT) are key to enhancing efficiency, efficacy and impact of programmes of development in the higher education sector.

30. ICT must be effectively leveraged to deliver high quality teaching and research support in higher education both on-campus and using distance education, providing access to technical and scholarly information resources, and facilitating scholarly communication between researchers and teachers.

31. Additional television channels should be dedicated to the delivery of high-quality distance education programmes.

32. It is necessary to focus on implementation excellence, which will require adoption of modern project management and reporting techniques as well as computerized financial management systems.

33. Allied with the increased demands on higher education by its customers and stakeholders, the sector faces growing expectations from government and society as a whole. With increased appropriation of public funds towards Higher Education come growing demands for transparency and that those financial allocations are well-targeted.

34. Movements in the global knowledge-society will require universities to develop into diverse, flexible, self-analytical and adaptable enterprises. Only a sector that is actively engaged in meeting the needs of its stakeholders will be adequately prepared to respond to the accelerated pace of change the global markets will inevitably undergo in the 21st century.

166. The Framework envisages increased investment for higher education, rising to 18% of the education budget on the assumption that the total education budget grows to 5% of GDP in 2010 and 7% of GDP by 2015. This will involve raising enrolment in higher education sector to 10% of target population by 2015 and to 15% by 2020. The Policy endorses the main lines of the Framework, while suggesting additional action that are consistent with the Framework.

**Policy Actions:**

1. Steps shall be taken to raise enrolment in higher education sector from existing 3.7% to 10% by 2015 & 15% by 2020

2. Investment shall be increased to 18% of the education budget on the assumption that the total education budget grows to 5% of GDP by 2010 and 7% by 2015.

3. For promoting greater specialisation in research, a two-fold strategy for its R&D function shall be pursued: basic research in the universities and research institutions shall focus on building the capacity to conduct and absorb cutting edge research. The purpose would be to position the research endeavour to participate in the cutting research when research resources

---

permit. The second strand shall be a focus on knowledge mobilisation – that is, transmission of research knowledge through various forms of university-industry partnerships and incubator programmes and science parks to the business sector. This commercialisation strategy aims at assist the innovation process of the economy.

4. Research grants and scholarships shall be awarded to deserving and poor students for continuing their studies in universities/institutes of higher education.

5. For promoting quality in its teaching function, universities shall collaborate to be selective in specialising in particular areas rather than each university attempting to cover the whole range of programmes.

6. Universities shall consider introducing four-year Bachelor degree programme. The PhD degrees shall have a minimum of four years. Universities shall develop quality assurance programmes, which include peer evaluation including foreign expertise.

7. Ranking system of the universities shall be made more broad-based including parameters that directly point to the quality of learning.

8. Recognising the importance of social sciences in developing better social understanding, transmission of civic and cultural values and the potential to reduce conflict, universities shall pay greater attention to this area in their research function.
CHAPTER 10.
FINANCING OF EDUCATION IN LINE WITH VISION 2030

10.1 POLICY VISION AND ITS FINANCING

167. “Without vision, the people perish.” The education sector has been without a comprehensive vision for far too long. Indeed, there have been policies, plans, reforms, goals, objectives, initiatives, and countless vision statements (i.e., Education for All), but there has been no vision: no widely owned understanding of where all of our efforts are taking us; no well-informed conception of what a high-quality, high-efficiency education system looks like and how it must function in order to be that way.

168. When reform tends to be without a clear vision, it tends not to add up to much of anything, as indicated in the diagram below. The net effect is close to zero, which means there is very little forward movement. Conversely, if there were a vision and all reforms and policies were aligned such that they worked toward the realization of that vision, the net effect would be substantial.

169. It is one thing to say that by 2015, “children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be able to complete a full course of primary schooling,” it is quite another to know what the full course of primary schooling looks like and what it will cost over time. To say that “90% of the children in the age-group (5-9) would be enrolled in school by a specific year and not know what will cost to achieve that goal is to say nothing at all. We not only need a vision of a system that works on behalf of more and more learners learning more and more; we need a vision the costs of which we know over time; a vision we know we can afford over time, given certain realistic assumptions about economic growth and the percentage of that growth going into education.

10.2 THE RESULTS: VISION 2030

170. The year is 2030 for which the Government of Pakistan is envisioning to get a very good return on its investment into education. In particular, the education system would be producing an abundance of:

1. citizens who are effective problem solvers—people who can think laterally and so apply their knowledge to new situations to come up with creative solutions;
2. citizens who are lifelong learners and capable of moving about from job to job within a complex and ever-changing economic environment;
3. citizens who contribute significantly to the information/knowledge-based global economy;
4. citizens who act responsibly in vibrant civic society and stable democracy;
5. and citizens who are morally upstanding.

---

44 Millennium Development Goals
10.3 **The Essential Elements**

171. These results can be attributed to a number of essential elements within the education system:

1. Defined learning outcomes
2. A curriculum that is tightly aligned to those learning outcomes
3. An assessment system that is tightly aligned to the curriculum: one that determines how well each student has done vis-à-vis the learning outcomes
4. Performance standards for every education professional in the system
5. Performance appraisal systems that determine how well every education professional has performed vis-à-vis their performance standards
6. Accountability systems/mechanisms aligned to the performance appraisal systems
7. Institutionalized deliberative forums that drive on-going, well informed, and widely owned, system-wide improvement
8. Career ladders linked to professional development and performance
9. Sufficient funding

172. In 2030, learning outcomes exist for every grade/course. They prescribe what every learner needs to know and be able to do upon completion of the grade/course in which he/she is enrolled. The curriculum is aligned to these learning outcomes such that when it is fully implemented by a highly qualified teacher those learning outcomes can be realized. In order to determine how well the curriculum is being implemented—to see if the learning outcomes are being realized—an assessment system is in place; one that is implemented at the end of the year for every student in the system. Each student must now take an end-of-year (EOY) exam. That teachers and students can come to know how well they are progressing toward these learning outcomes, continuous assessment is practiced in every classroom.

173. Performance standards exist for every education professional in the system. These standards are tightly aligned to the particular roles and responsibilities outlined in each position’s job description. A teacher’s performance is based largely on how well his/her students do on the EOY exams. So too for Head Teachers, District Education Officers, and Provincial Education Officers: their performance is based in part on how well their respective students do on the EOY exams. By making student achievement a measure of how well key personnel throughout the system perform ensures that classroom learning is the central focus of the entire education system.

174. The performance of education administrators (Head Teachers, District Education Officials, and Provincial Education Officials) is also determined by how well they utilize scarce resources on behalf of more and more students learning more and more. In particular, position-specific performance standards are in place to ensure that a certain number of un-enrolled children become enrolled annually. Inasmuch as it is

---

45 Inasmuch as a teacher considers the students within their classroom theirs, Head Teachers now consider the students within their school theirs, District Officers now consider the students within their district theirs, and Provincial Officers now consider the students within their province theirs.

46 By way of example, planners will have performance standards in place that will, in a sense, force them to develop plans that have classrooms being built where they are most needed, not where some politician might want them built.
important for those students who are in school to learn more and more (the quality issue), it is equally if not more important for those students who are not in school—the previously un-enrolled and drop-outs—to get into school and start the learning process (the access issue). To this end there exists a minimum standard of provision (MSP) for each and every school and therefore, for each student and potential student. As a result, resources are mobilized where they are most needed vis-à-vis some optimal blend of improved quality and improved access.

175. A performance appraisal system is in place in 2030 to determine how well, on an annual basis, each education professional has performed with regard to their particular performance standards. A critical feature of this system is the periodic ratcheting up of everyone’s performance standards: no one is allowed to stand still within the system.

176. When educational professionals achieve their annual performance standards, they are rewarded; when they fail to meet those standards, organizational learning mechanisms are activated to remediate the situation—to facilitate the professional’s learning such that their performance can improve. If after a number of remediation interventions sub-standard performance persists, sanctions are imposed. In short: all educational personnel are held to account for their performance, and a good portion of their performance is determined by how well, and how many of, their respective students perform.

177. School, district, and provincial-level performance is made transparent regularly in level-specific deliberative forums: institutionalized venues within which school, district, and provincial officials account for how well their respective educational jurisdictions are performing before a wide range of stakeholders. That these forums are the venues within which stakeholders reflect, deliberate, and ultimately counsel upon the ways and means of level-specific improvement, they are verily, the system’s engines of on-going education development. As institutionalized entities these forums are formally mandated with bylaws to ensure that each and every stakeholder, including parents, has an equal say in the various activities of the forum.

178. Highly qualified education professionals permeate the system in part because they are being held accountable for doing their jobs, in part because of a needs-based demand-driven professional development infrastructure. There are career ladders for both teachers and administrators. In order to assume a position on any rung of the ladder, a person must, among other things (such as performance), take and pass a number of prescribed professional development courses designed to equip that person with the skills and knowledge necessary for them to carry out the roles and responsibilities of that position. If they do not pass these courses, they cannot assume the position. Because the private returns of the next highest rung of the career ladder are so relatively high (i.e. increased pay, stature, and/or responsibility), educational professionals pay for their own professional development.

47 The minimum standard of provision is an index of sorts that indicates what, in the way of inputs (i.e., textbooks, pedagogical materials, contact hours, classroom space, etc.), is needed in order to provide a standard of education—in order for the learning objectives of each and every student (and potential student) to be realized over time.

48 The MSP differs across school types: primary, middle, urban, rural, vocational/technical, etc.

49 Parents are represented in higher-level forums by elected representatives in parent associations. Accordingly, District Parent Associations represent parents’ views and concerns in District Forums while Provincial Parent Associations represent parents’ views and concerns at Provincial Forums, etc.
179. No one can be held accountable for achieving their performance standards without the resources necessary to do so: there must be accountability reciprocity. Accordingly, there is sufficient funding for all of this to work. That there is sufficient funding can be attributed to a number of factors:

1. Increased political and social will for quality education for all: politicians and citizens alike see the value of education and they are willing to invest in it.
2. Improved internal efficiency: with negligible repetition and drop out rates, more and more children are passing through the system, learning more, within the allotted timeframe\(^50\).
3. Improved economic efficiency: by and large, the public returns to basic education far outweigh the private returns, while the private returns to post secondary education far outweigh the public returns. By obtaining more private contributions from those sub-sectors of the system where the private returns are greater, more public resources can be channeled into those sub-sectors of the system where the public returns are greater.
4. Improved administrative efficiency: with educational professionals being held accountable for performance, there is little to no waste in the running of the system.
5. Improved financial efficiency: high unit costs have been reduced\(^51\) and resources are being channeled into those things that yield the most learning.
6. Streamlined financial flows: all education finances are now earmarked.

10.4 THE HIGH PERFORMING SYSTEM

180. With these essential elements of the system in place by 2030, we now would be having classrooms in which high quality teaching and learning is regularly taking place, implementing a curriculum designed to facilitate critical thinking, problem solving, team work, and knowledge application. Each classroom is, at the very least, sufficiently equipped as per the minimum standard of provision for that school. Repetition and drop out rates are negligible largely because of the high-quality teaching and learning that is going on.

181. Each classroom has a well-trained\(^52\), highly motivated, and well paid teacher\(^53\): an academic well versed in the subject(s) s/he teaches; someone who is also a professional educationist skilled in a number of modern pedagogical techniques that foster inquiry, interaction, and lateral thinking among all students regardless of their learning styles. Teachers assess their pupils continuously helping them to reflect on what they did right,

---

\(^{50}\) When a child drops out after 2-3 years of education, (s)he has not learned enough for the state to reap the benefits of the investment that has been made in that child; and when a child repeats—when it takes, say, 15 years to receive the allotted 9 years of education—the state ends up paying an additional 67% than would be the case if that person never repeated. In both instances, one has rather large efficiency losses.

\(^{51}\) By way of example, in 2006 the average number of classrooms per primary school was just over 2. That average is now much closer to 10. With larger schools, we have much lower unit costs.

\(^{52}\) The minimum academic qualification for teachers is (B.A./B.Sc.) while the minimum professional qualification is (B.Ed.).

\(^{53}\) By way of example, primary-level teachers are being paid 70% more \textit{in real 2005 terms} than their 2005 counterparts.
what they did wrong, and how they could best learn from their mistakes. The vast majority of these students pass their EOY exams.

182. These high quality classrooms are supported by schools that are characterized by widespread learning, not just by the students, but also by the teachers, administrators, SMCs, and parents. All such role-specific learning is directed toward improving student achievement. Every school is adequately equipped—as per the minimum standard of provision—to foster such widespread and continuous learning.

183. Teachers interact with other teachers from within the school and from neighboring schools in order to learn from each other’s experiences and knowledge. Head Teachers are well-trained professionals chosen from a pool of qualified administrators. To become a Head Teacher (or any other higher-level education administrator), aspirants are required to receive a passing grade on a set number of accredited professional development courses that prepare them for the position being pursued. All staff are hired, promoted, and retained on the basis of qualifications and performance.

184. The overall well being of the school is ultimately in the hands of the SMC, members of which are well trained to carry out their particular roles and responsibilities. Elections are staggered over time such that there is no longer the possibility of complete turnover of membership. Members now serve for 6 years with elections taking place every 2 years for 1/3 of the membership. This allows 2/3rd of the membership to help train the newly elected members. As a result, SMCs are now largely self-training entities.

185. Ongoing school improvement is driven by the development and implementation of School Improvement Plans (SIP). These plans are developed regularly within the school/community-level deliberative forums mentioned earlier. This ensures that the plans and the decisions leading up to them (e.g., setting priorities, weighing the relative importance of various needs, and assessing and making tradeoffs) are widely owned and reflect the best information and knowledge available.

186. There are sufficient funds for all performance standards to be met; put another way, there are enough resources to run the school effectively and to drive a meaningful school improvement program. The SIPs are an essential part of a rational budgeting process that triggers the resources needed to implement them.

187. A nested set of inter-related and highly coordinated education systems—district, province, and federal—support these schools (see Figure 8). There are clearly defined divisions of labor, lines of authority, roles and responsibilities, and channels of communication: the three systems work as one. Political interference has all but been eliminated, in part because of the accountability systems that have been put in place throughout the system; in part because all education personnel are now hired and removed at the level at which they work: teachers are hired and removed at the school/community level, district officers are hired and removed at the district level, etc.

188. System-wide improvement—district, provincial, and federal—is driven by the development and implementation of level-specific improvement plans. These improvement plans are, to some extent, cumulative. District improvement plans reflect their respective schools’ improvement plans and whatever needs to be done within the districts. Provincial improvement plans reflect their districts’ plans and whatever needs
to be done within the provinces, etc. These plans are drawn up within the level-specific deliberative forums mentioned earlier.

10.5 THE FUEL

189. The nine essential elements bring about the high performing system focused on classroom learning. Both are fuelled by data/information that is timely, valid, and accurate. The National Education Management Information System (NEMIS) regularly provides relevant high-quality data/information to each and every stakeholder throughout the system. As a result people know what is going on, how well their students are doing, how well their school is doing, how well their district is doing compared to other students, schools, and districts respectively. They also know how the money is being spent. All education administrators have ready access to the information they need in order to make informed decisions regarding the allocation and utilization of scarce resources vis-à-vis more and more students learning more and more.

10.6 THE COST

190. The aforesaid vision is affordable, given certain assumptions about the economy—annual percent in real growth in the GDP (4.8%)—the percent of GDP spent on public education annually (4.5%), and a wide range of policy options regarding enrolment rates; the number of teachers; the number of non-teachers; construction needs; facilities, equipment, and materials; post-secondary education, operating costs, and a wide range of unit costs including salaries. The numerical value of each policy option has been set to achieve the following goals:

1. getting as many children into, and staying in school as possible;
2. providing them with the best possible education; and
3. ridding the system of as much waste as possible.

191. Increasing enrolment costs money; so too does increasing quality. Reducing waste saves money. When the first two factors “out-cost” the third, there has to be increased spending as well, but within reason. The education sector cannot expect the economy to grow at 10% per annum (in real terms) over the course of the next 20 years; nor can it expect to receive 10% of GDP over that same period of time.

192. The “solution” presented in this document is not the only possible one—countless other affordable solutions can be generated. That said, here are some cost estimates for essential features of A High Access, High Quality, and Affordable Scenario:

- Total Cost (2005-2030): Rs. 12,922,685,093,115 (Rs. 12,922 billion)
- Average Annual Cost: Rs. 497,026,349,735 (Rs. 497 billion)
- 2005-2030 Surplus: Rs. 1,966,192,768,025 (Rs. 1,966 billion)
- 2005 Cost/Pupil: Rs. 6,545 per annum
- 2030 Cost/Pupil: Rs. 8,944 per annum
- 100% Primary Enrolment by 2015

54 NEMIS is largely a composite of provincial and areas EMISs that all work together as a unified and highly coordinated whole. The district EMISs extend all the way out to each and every school.

55 The average of the last 15 years.
100% Middle Enrolment by 2015
100% Secondary Enrolment by 2020
40% Higher Secondary Enrolment by 2025
2005 Average Teacher Salary: Rs. 93,993
2030 Average Teacher Salary: Rs. 202,750
Lowest qualified teachers: B.A./B.Sc & B.Ed.
Primary and Middle Stage Teachers: 70% raise (in real 2005 terms)

The 2005-2030 “surplus” is critical, and most reassuring, in that it offers all of us a rather large cushion regarding some of the policy options presented in the scenario. Note, it is nearly twice the annual average cost of education. Should some of our assumptions be overly optimistic and/or if some of our base year data is off by a few percentage points, having a cushion as large as we have here, means that Vision 2030 will still be affordable over time.
CHAPTER 11.
FEDERAL – INTER-PROVINCIAL IMPLEMENTATION
ACTION PLAN

11.1 OBJECTIVE

194. The National Education Policy (NEP) 2008 analyses problems and issues hampering the development of education in Pakistan, and outlines a wide range of reforms and policy actions to be taken and to be pursued in a coordinated federal – inter-provincial process. The NEP thus outlines what is to be done. The NEP does not deal with who will do what, how will something be done, and when is something done. Past national education policy documents largely remained declarations of intent and were not followed up by an effective implementation, because the ‘who’, ‘how’ and ‘when’ was not adequately looked into.

195. The 13th Meeting of Inter-Provincial Education Ministers (IPEM), held on 9th May, 2008 in Islamabad, decided and directed that “An Action Plan will be developed by each Province/Area and collated at the Federal level.” The purpose and objective of the Action Plan shall be to outline, create an understanding and achieve consensus on who will be responsible and who will do what, how will it be done (implementation process, organizational set-up, interaction of working groups and advisory panels), and when would be something done (priorities and time scheduling).

196. ‘Action’ relates to

1. Operationalizing and implementing education policies as agreed in the NEP 2008 (‘policy actions’)
2. Developing and reaching agreement on standards, strategies and targets
3. Direct action and support programs to achieve targets

11.2 PROVINCIAL AUTONOMY AND OWNERSHIP

197. The policy shall be implemented and monitored within the principles of provincial autonomy and ownership of the process. The federating units remain the key actors. However, the highest level of monitoring shall be through a national framework that will involve all the federating units and the federal government as partners. The forum of the Inter-Provincial Education Ministers’ Conference (IPEM) shall, therefore, be the highest oversight body for guiding educational development in the country (as articulated in this NEP document). Technical level teams, from the federal government as well as the provinces, shall support this forum.

198. The Inter-Provincial Education Ministers’ Conference has traditionally managed federal-inter-provincial coordination in the education sector and shall be institutionalized and strengthened without infringing on the respective roles of the

---

56 in pursuance of the decisions taken in the 13th Meeting of Inter-Provincial Education Ministers (IPEM) held on 9th May, 2008 in Islamabad
federal and provincial governments as envisaged in the 1973 Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan.

199. Ownership and active participation of all stakeholders and tiers shall be essential and has to be nurtured from the very beginning. Emphasis will be laid throughout the process on inter-provincial exchange and mutual learning of concepts and reform approaches already developed by a province or area. As a principle, modalities and time schedules for implementation of a particular area of reform may vary from province to province within the overall common framework.

**Federal – Inter-Provincial Implementation**

**Implementing Policy Reforms – A Continuous Cycle**

200. Implementation is conceived as a continuous process of review, implementation, monitoring, feed-back and adjustments as considered and agreed necessary during the course of implementation. Fig. 1 depicts the implementation process:

201. There are five steps:

1. The National Education Policy (NEP) shall be reviewed and revised in a Federal – Inter-Provincial process with broad stake-holder dialogue and participation.

2. Plans of action for agreed reforms shall be incorporated in provincial/area Sector Plans in a Federal – Inter-Provincial process with inter-tier relationships, roles and responsibilities being under review at the same time. This will require a trustful and constructive cooperation of the players involved.

3. Reforms shall be implemented within the implementation of the Sector Plans. The responsibility at this stage rests with the Provinces/Areas which shall have to regularly and intensively interact, cooperate and coordinate with the districts and lower tier organs, schools, parents, community and the wider civil society.

4. Progress shall be monitored at all levels. Inter-tier joint reviews shall be arranged where problems and issues are coming up.
5. Feedback shall be provided upwards from the lower organs and schools to the Province/Area and further upwards to the Inter-Provincial Education Ministers (IPEM) Conference through the Policy and Planning Wing of the Federal Ministry of Education as IPEM’s federal secretariat.

202. The Inter-Provincial Education Ministers’ (IPEM) Conference, with the Policy and Planning Wing of the Ministry of Education functioning as IPEM’s federal secretariat, shall be overall responsible for facilitating, steering and monitoring the process.

RESPONSIBILITIES FOR MAIN AREAS OF REFORM AND INTERVENTION

203. The NEP 2008 analyses problems in a holistic view and proposes a wide scope of complex reforms and policy actions to be taken. The question of ‘who is responsible’ for a particular reform leads to a structuring of main areas of reforms and interventions under four headings:

I. Policy Process and Sector Planning
with the key responsibility resting at the planning level of the Education line ministries and departments in coordination with the Departments of Finance and Planning & Development, dealing with:

- Federal - Inter-Provincial Coordination
- National Education Policy (NEP) - Review and Implementation
- Sector Planning - Scope, Format and Process
- Monitoring the Achievement of National Education Targets

II. Governance and Capacity
with the key responsibility resting at the political and secretariat level, dealing with:

- Inter-Tier Roles & Responsibilities and Sector-Wide Coordination
- Harmonizing Parallel Systems of Education (Government, Private, Religious)

III. Quality and Relevance
with the key responsibility resting with the professional bodies of the Education line ministries and departments (i.e. Curriculum Wing, Textbook Boards, Teacher Education Departments and Institutions, Examination Boards, NEAS/PEAC, etc.), dealing with:

- System of Quality Assurance (Schools, District, Province/Area, National)
- Curriculum Reform
- School Language Policy
- Textbooks and Reading & Learning Materials
- Teacher Education, Qualification and Effective Deployment

IV. Achieving National Education Targets
with shared responsibilities, (a) for planning at the planning level, (b) for implementation at the professional bodies and at the lower operational and administrative organs, (c) for ‘public accounting’ and for setting revised targets where necessary, again the political and secretariat level, dealing with:

- Education Financing and Finance Management - Strategies, Standards and Targets
- Access and Equity - Strategies, Standards and Targets
Quality ('Learning Outcome') – Strategies, Standards and Targets

PLAYERS, INTERACTION AND COORDINATION

A ‘matrix’ approach

204. The organization of the process shall follow a ‘matrix’ approach. Error! Reference source not found. schematically depicts who shall be required (coordinators, focal persons, development partners, expert and advisory panels) and how these players shall be interacting in the process of implementing the NEP 2008 reforms to achieve national education targets.

205. There shall be two lines of interaction and coordination,

1. Horizontally, the federal – inter-provincial thematic coordination,
2. Vertically, the overall coordination and provincial implementation under the nominated provincial NEP implementation coordinators.
**Fig. 2: Organization – a matrix approach**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area of Intervention &amp; Reforms</th>
<th>Federal Ministry of Education</th>
<th>Punjab</th>
<th>Sindh</th>
<th>NWFP</th>
<th>Balochistan</th>
<th>Northern Areas</th>
<th>AJK</th>
<th>FATA</th>
<th>ICT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Policy Process and Sector Planning</td>
<td>Federal &amp; provincial coordinators</td>
<td>Provincial thematic focal person</td>
<td>development partner</td>
<td>stakeholders, expert consultants and advisory panels</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For Example</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>For Example</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Governance and Capacity</td>
<td></td>
<td>For Example</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality and Relevance</td>
<td></td>
<td>For Example</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Achieving National Education Targets</td>
<td></td>
<td>For Example</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Timeline**

- **2009**: Concept & plan of action agreed
- **2010**: Policy objective achieved
**Provincial participation, representation and coordination**

206. The symbol in the organizational matrix relates to federal and provincial/area coordinators. Each province/area nominates a relevant senior officer as the overall provincial coordinator for the reform and development processes in implementing the National Education Policy 2008. The coordinator’s office acts as the provincial/area secretariat for the Inter-Provincial Education Ministers’ (IPEM) Forum.

207. The coordinator respectively the secretariat shall be provided with adequate resources in terms of personnel and operational budget and facilities.

208. The symbol relates to provincial/area thematic focal persons. Each province/area shall nominate for each of the four main areas of reform and intervention one responsible senior officer as the focal person. (For the two areas of ‘Policy Process and Sector Planning’ and ‘Achieving National Education Targets’ the same person might initially be nominated.)

209. The offices of the focal persons shall be provided with adequate resources in terms of personnel and operational budget and facilities. The focal persons shall ensure involving stakeholders and mobilizing expertise as described in 7274598. They shall be at liberty to form advisory panels or constitute provincial committees as considered necessary.

**Federal – inter-provincial coordination and national advisory panel**

210. The Policy and Planning Wing of the Ministry of Education shall be the federal secretariat for the Inter-Provincial Education Ministers’ (IPEM) forum. The secretariat shall be provided with adequate resources in terms of personnel and operational budget and facilities.

211. The federal IPEM secretariat shall

1. facilitate all processes and assist Provinces/Areas in providing expertise and support where this is requested,
2. develop reporting formats, receive feedback and reports from the Provinces/Areas and prepare quarterly summary reports in consultation with the provincial/area IPEM secretariats.

212. The federal IPEM secretariat shall nominate - in consultation with the Provinces/Areas - thematic coordinators for each of the four main areas of reform and intervention (‘Governance and Capacity’, ‘Policy Process and Sector Planning’, ‘Quality and Relevance’, and ‘Achieving National Education Targets’). The thematic coordinators will ensure involving stakeholders and mobilizing expertise as described in 7274598. The thematic coordinators shall be supported by thematic national advisory panels. They will each constitute a federal – inter-provincial steering committee composed of the respective provincial/area thematic focal persons for the overall process coordination.

213. The federal IPEM secretariat shall set up and notify a NEP implementation coordination and steering committee composed of the provincial/area coordinators for the overall process coordination. The committee will be supported be a national
advisory panel. Representatives of major development partners may be co-opted into the coordination and steering committee or be invited for specific sessions.

214. The federal IPEM secretariat shall convene quarterly joint meetings of the coordination and steering committee and all major development partners, present summary reports and obtain feedback from the development partners.

Involving stakeholders and mobilizing national expertise

215. The symbol \( \text{\symbol{149}} \) in the organizational matrix Error! Reference source not found. relates to relevant institutional and societal stakeholders, wider national expertise, expert consultants, and advisory panels.

216. The provincial and federal coordinators and the thematic focal persons shall have a key responsibility to ensure the most comprehensive and broad participation and to mobilize and involve all relevant stakeholders for a particular reform area,

- e.g. for the policy reform and development of textbooks and learning materials: Curriculum Wing, National Book Foundation, provincial Textbook Boards, Pakistan Publishers and Booksellers Association, Publishers, Teacher Education Institutions, ....
- e.g. for language policy reform: University of Modern Languages, Teacher Education Institutions, national language bodies, private schools, teachers, students, the wider public, ...

217. The provincial and federal coordinators and the thematic focal persons shall furthermore identify and mobilize available national expertise and consultants for specific in depth studies, research and data compilation, and advisory functions as members of advisory panels and/or national committees for certain areas of reform.

Involvement of development partners

218. The symbol \( \text{\symbol{149}} \) in the organizational matrix Error! Reference source not found. indicates a possible participation and support to the federal – inter-provincial reform and development process by development partners.

219. There shall be two options for providing assistance in form of additional national and international expertise, consulting studies, workshops, and logistical and operational support:

1. ‘Horizontal’, i.e. support to a certain thematic area or sub-area at the national level and across the Provinces/Areas.
2. ‘Vertical’, i.e. supporting a particular Province/Area in all thematic fields to assist the Province/Area to fully participate in the process and achieve national targets.

220. This approach means that support for a certain thematic area in a particular Province comes from development partner 1. primarily with regard to the specific thematic expertise and from development partner 2. primarily with regard to logistical and operational support. The provincial/area coordinator shall coordinate as required.

221. It shall be understood that support in this national reform and development program shall not come in the nature of ‘projects’, but in the nature of a Technical Cooperation (TC) facility provided to the responsible government partner. The full and sole responsibility for all activities and all decisions about deployment of expertise or logistical support shall rest with the government partner. Expert personnel, consultants
or support staff (where temporarily deployed under development partner financing) shall work in an integrated manner with the relevant government partner institution.

222. The provincial/area ministries/departments shall consult with their current Technical Cooperation (TC) development partners. The federal ministry shall consult with its current development partners, and may approach other partners for cooperation as seen necessary and useful. Development partners may enter into co-financing agreements to avoid having too many single partners.

223. To coordinate the process, the Policy and Planning Wing of the Ministry of Education (as the federal IPEM secretariat) shall prepare a matrix as in Error! Reference source not found., but with a completed list of areas of reform and intervention and outputs to be achieved to map possible involvement of development partners based on the consultations at provincial/area and at federal level.

224. The Ministry of Education shall arrange for a joint session with development partners, after initial consultations at provincial and national level. Resulting recommendations shall be presented to the Inter-Provincial Education Ministers’ Conference.

IPEM – the decision making body

225. The forum of the Inter-Provincial Education Ministers’ (IPEM) Conference shall be the highest oversight body for guiding the process, decisions and approvals.

WORK PLAN

DRAFT WORK PLAN

226. A draft work plan (DWP) shall be developed on the basis of the National Education Policy 2008 and related federal initiatives. The draft work plan shows main areas of reform and intervention, intended outputs (= results to be achieved) and tentative timelines. Timelines relate to tasks and results to be achieved.
### Policy Process and Sector Planning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ID</th>
<th>Outline Number</th>
<th>Areas of Reform, Outputs, Tasks and Milestones</th>
<th>Current Issues</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td><strong>Federal - Inter-Provincial Coordination</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>1.1.1</td>
<td>Institutionalized IPM (Inter-Provincial Education Ministers conference)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.2</td>
<td></td>
<td>Effective IPM secretariat at Federal level (in P&amp;P Wing) with monitoring/coordinate/facilitating functions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.3</td>
<td></td>
<td>Functioning secretariats for IPM and NEP Implementation at Provincial/Area level</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>National Education Policy (NEP) - Review and Implementation</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.1</td>
<td></td>
<td>Approved National Education Policy NEP 2008 (basic document for coordinated policy reform process)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.2</td>
<td></td>
<td>Approved NEP Implementation Action Plan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.3</td>
<td></td>
<td>Nominated federal and provincial/area coordinators and focal persons</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.4</td>
<td></td>
<td>Notified Implementation Coordination and Steering Committee</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.5</td>
<td></td>
<td>Regular meetings of Implementation Coordination and Steering Committee</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.6</td>
<td></td>
<td>Continuous NEP implementation process incl. phase-wise review and updating of the NEP document</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Sector Planning - Scope, Format and Process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ID</th>
<th>Outline Number</th>
<th>Areas of Reform, Outputs, Tasks and Milestones</th>
<th>Current Issues</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Agreed core framework for sector plans at District, Provincial/Area, National level</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3.1</td>
<td></td>
<td>NIP policy actions reflected in Provincial/Area and District Sector Plans</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3.2</td>
<td></td>
<td>Effective education data system (EMS/GIS) - District &gt; Province &gt; National</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3.3</td>
<td></td>
<td>Agreed status of sector plans within PC rules &amp; procedures and annual budgetary process</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Monitoring the Achievement of National Education Targets

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ID</th>
<th>Outline Number</th>
<th>Areas of Reform, Outputs, Tasks and Milestones</th>
<th>Current Issues</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.4</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Annual cycle of planning, monitoring and reporting agreed upon and functioning (District, Provincial/Area, National)</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Governance and Capacity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ID</th>
<th>Outline Number</th>
<th>Areas of Reform, Outputs, Tasks and Milestones</th>
<th>Current Issues</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Inter-Tier Roles &amp; Responsibilities and Sector-Wide Coordination</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.1</td>
<td></td>
<td>Agreed mechanism for sector-wide HP development (school educ, higher educ, technical educ)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2</td>
<td></td>
<td>Mapped and clarified roles of Federal and Provincial governments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.3</td>
<td></td>
<td>Mapped and clarified roles of Provincial and District governments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.4</td>
<td></td>
<td>Agreed upon concepts and plan of action for building management and planning capacity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.5</td>
<td></td>
<td>Adequate institutional setup, processes and capacity at Federal level (M&amp;E/HEC/FADEIC)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.6</td>
<td></td>
<td>Adequate institutional setup, processes and capacity at Provincial/Area level</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.7</td>
<td></td>
<td>Adequate institutional setup, processes and capacity at District level</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.8</td>
<td></td>
<td>Strengthened school management and participation of local bodies (Tehsil, Union, Community)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Harmonizing Parallel Systems of Education (Government, Private, Religious)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ID</th>
<th>Outline Number</th>
<th>Areas of Reform, Outputs, Tasks and Milestones</th>
<th>Current Issues</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Effective regulatory system for private sector school development</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1</td>
<td></td>
<td>Agreed concept and framework for access to private schools under government financing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2</td>
<td></td>
<td>Expanded access to private schools under government financing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3</td>
<td></td>
<td>Agreed concept and framework for aligned, recognized and competitive religious school education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Fig 4. Draft Work Plan (Page 2)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ID</th>
<th>Outline Number</th>
<th>Areas of Reform, Outputs, Tasks and Milestones</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>332</td>
<td>2.2.5</td>
<td>Aligned, recognized and competitive religious school education</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>340</td>
<td>3</td>
<td><strong>Quality and Relevance</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>341</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td><strong>System of Quality Assurance (Schools, District, Province/Area, National)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>342</td>
<td>3.1.1</td>
<td>Effective examination system (revised academic standards, exam processes and institutional set-up)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>343</td>
<td>3.1.2</td>
<td>Institutionalized system of continuous classroom assessment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>346</td>
<td>3.1.3</td>
<td>Institutionalized and effective National/Provincial Education Assessment System (NEAS / PEAS)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>346</td>
<td>3.1.4</td>
<td>Institutionalized quality cycle management (elements of quality &amp; assessment interlinked in regular feedback cycle)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>347</td>
<td>3.1.5</td>
<td>Restructured and strengthened MoE Curriculum Wing for expanded tasks in quality assurance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>349</td>
<td>3.1.6</td>
<td>Reviewed and strengthened institutional set-up of quality related provincial institutions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>406</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td><strong>Curriculum Reform</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407</td>
<td>3.2.1</td>
<td>Scheme of studies (Kach to grade 12) revised and notified (curriculum reform 2006-2009)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>408</td>
<td>3.2.2</td>
<td>Curriculum for 11 core subjects (Kach to grade 12) revised and notified (curriculum reform 2006-2009)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>408</td>
<td>3.2.3</td>
<td>Curriculum for all subjects (Kach to grade 12) revised and notified (curriculum reform 2006-2009)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>409</td>
<td>3.2.4</td>
<td>Curriculum and reading &amp; learning materials reflect socio-economic needs and relevance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>410</td>
<td>3.2.5</td>
<td>Revised curriculum physically and conceptually disseminated to all stakeholders and feedback obtained</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>411</td>
<td>3.2.6</td>
<td>Revised curriculum implemented and regular curriculum review institutionalized</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>413</td>
<td>3.2.7</td>
<td>Alternative education opportunities established for matching with labor market (different streams of education)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>464</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td><strong>School Language Policy</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>465</td>
<td>3.3.1</td>
<td>Use of regional/local languages in schools - realistic strategies and targets set</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>466</td>
<td>3.3.2</td>
<td>Use of regional/local languages - curriculum, textbooks and reading materials available</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>466</td>
<td>3.3.3</td>
<td>Use of regional/local languages - teachers available for regional/local languages as per targets set</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>476</td>
<td>3.3.4</td>
<td>English language in schools - realistic strategies and targets set</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>477</td>
<td>3.3.5</td>
<td>English language in schools - curriculum, textbooks reading and learning materials available</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>478</td>
<td>3.3.6</td>
<td>English language - teachers available for English language as per targets set</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>494</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td><strong>Textbooks and Reading &amp; Learning Materials</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>495</td>
<td>3.4.1</td>
<td>Approved and notified National Textbook &amp; Learning Materials Policy and Plan of Action</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
<td>3.4.1.1</td>
<td>National Textbook &amp; Learning Materials Policy and Plan of Action effectively implemented and monitored</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
<td>3.4.1.1</td>
<td>Increased provincial/area investments in school libraries and learning materials</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>686</td>
<td>3.4.1.1</td>
<td>Provincial/Area Textbook Boards (TDBs) reformed and working as per TDB&amp;LNetPil &amp; Plan of Action</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>687</td>
<td>3.4.1.1</td>
<td>National Book Foundation (NBF) effectively promoting book-writing and publishing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>687</td>
<td>3.4.1.1</td>
<td>Textbook and learning materials writing, design and use introduced as a subject in B.Ed&amp;M.Ed. teacher education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>688</td>
<td>3.4.1.1</td>
<td>Qualified and competitive Pakistan education publishing industry</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>689</td>
<td>3.4.1.1</td>
<td>Potential of E-learning and ICT in education explored and deployed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Fig 4. Draft Work Plan (Page 3)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ID</th>
<th>Outline Number</th>
<th>Areas of Reform, Outputs, Tasks and Milestones</th>
<th>Current Issues</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>760</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td><strong>Teacher Education, Qualification and Effective Deployment</strong></td>
<td>Q1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>761</td>
<td>3.5.1</td>
<td>Teacher qualification levels defined and realistic transition plan agreed upon</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>762</td>
<td>3.5.2</td>
<td>Teacher education curriculum reformed &amp; adjusted to needs of school curriculum</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>763</td>
<td>3.5.3</td>
<td>Teacher education (pre-service) provision and accreditation matching demand in quality and quantity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>764</td>
<td>3.5.4</td>
<td>Institutionalized regular and continuous teacher professional development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>765</td>
<td>3.5.5</td>
<td>Adequate and motivating employment and working conditions for teachers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>766</td>
<td>4</td>
<td><strong>Achieving National Education Targets</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>767</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td><strong>Education Financing and Finance Management - Strategies, Standards and Targets</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>768</td>
<td>4.1.1</td>
<td>Education financing - realistic strategies &amp; targets set and achievements monitored</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>769</td>
<td>4.1.2</td>
<td>Finance management - responsibilities, policies and procedures reviewed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>770</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td><strong>Access and Equity - Strategies, Standards and Targets</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>771</td>
<td>4.2.1</td>
<td>Access and enrollment - realistic strategies &amp; targets set</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>772</td>
<td>4.2.2</td>
<td>Basic infrastructure facilities ('learning environment') - realistic strategies, standards &amp; targets set</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>773</td>
<td>4.2.3</td>
<td>&gt; ??? Federal project on missing facilities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>774</td>
<td>4.2.4</td>
<td>Equity, overcoming gender, social &amp; regional disparities - realistic strategies, standards &amp; targets set</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>775</td>
<td>4.2.5</td>
<td>&gt; ???</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>776</td>
<td>4.2.6</td>
<td>Early childhood education (ECE) - realistic strategies, standards &amp; targets set</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>777</td>
<td>4.2.7</td>
<td>Literacy &amp; Non-formal education - realistic strategies, standards &amp; targets set</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>778</td>
<td>4.2.8</td>
<td>&gt; ???</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>779</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td><strong>Quality ('Learning Outcome') - Strategies, Standards and Targets</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>780</td>
<td>4.3.1</td>
<td>Educational quality ('learning outcome') - realistic strategies, standards &amp; targets set</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**AGREED FEDERAL – INTER-PROVINCIAL WORK PLAN**

227. The final work plan shall be developed on the basis of the draft work plan by the MoE Policy and Planning Wing (with institutionalized function as federal IPEM secretariat) in close consultation and cooperation with the provincial/area coordinators and focal persons to be nominated by the responsible provincial bodies. The resulting agreed federal – inter-provincial work plan shall serve as main tool for planning, monitoring and reporting. The work plan (and its regular updates) shall be placed on the MoE’s web page, open to the general public, creating transparency on Government plans, actions, bottlenecks and achievements. Comments, contributions and participation will be invited.

228. The work plan shall show sub-levels of activities, responsible focal persons for each main activity, timelines and milestones to be achieved. Activities shall be grouped in phases, with a first phase to agree on concept and plan of action for implementation of a particular policy, and a second phase to achieve the policy objective.

229. The Policy and Planning Wing of the Ministry of Education shall prepare a detailed synopsis of the reforms and policy actions outlined in the National Education Policy (NEP) 2008 against each main area of reform and intervention and each intended output under the work plan to ensure full implementation of the NEP 2008.

**SETTING PRIORITIES**

230. The federal and provincial NEP implementation coordinators together with the development partners who subscribe to supporting the NEP reform process may propose to the Inter-Provincial Education Ministers Conference to set priorities and adjust timelines accordingly where professional expertise and resources are not immediately and sufficiently available.

**IMMEDIATE STEPS**

231. The National Education Policy and the Implementation Action Plan need to be approved by the Inter-Provincial Education Ministers’ Conference (IPEM). In case of observations or reservations from a Province/Area regarding a particular policy recommendation in the National Education Policy, a corrective dialogue shall be undertaken. Where such dialogue will require a longer period of time to be resolved, a respective clause may be entered into the Policy document, to allow the overall follow-up implementation process to go ahead without undue delay.

232. Following the approval of the National Education Policy and the Implementation Action Plan by the Inter-Provincial Education Ministers’ Conference, the following immediate steps will be undertaken:

1. Nomination of provincial/area coordinators
2. Notification of a steering, coordination and monitoring committee composed of the provincial/area coordinators
3. Nomination of provincial/area thematic focal persons
4. Formation of advisory panels
5. Coordinated involvement of development partners
6. Institutionalization of the Inter-Provincial Education Ministers’ (IPEM) Conference
7. Strengthening of the Policy and Planning Wing of the Ministry of Education to function as federal secretariat for the Inter-Provincial Education Ministers’ Conference and NEP implementation
8. Setting up secretariats for IPEM and NEP implementation at Provincial/Area level

**MONITORING AND REPORTING**

233. Progress will be monitored at all levels. Inter-tier joint reviews are arranged and external independent reviews may be commissioned where problems and issues are coming up. Regular feedback will provide information upwards from the schools through the lower organs to the Province/Area and further upwards to the Inter-Provincial Education Ministers Conference (IPEM). The Policy and Planning Wing of the Ministry of Education as the federal IPEM secretariat prepares **quarterly reports** in consultation with the provincial/area IPEM secretariats. Reporting formats will be developed by the federal IPEM secretariat for that matter.

234. Two kind of quarterly reports are prepared, presented to the NEP implementation coordination and steering committee, and - after endorsement by the committee - presented to the Inter-Provincial Education Ministers’ (IPEM) Conference for information, guidance and decisions:

1. **Recommendations for any adjustment of plans** as considered necessary during the course of implementation.

2. **Summary report on progress, achievements and constraints** at federal level and in the Provinces/Areas in table form (Fig 4), based on the NEP Implementation Work Plan (see earlier section 7274598 ).
Fig. 4: Summary report in Table Form

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area of Reform</th>
<th>Fed. MoE</th>
<th>Punjab</th>
<th>Sindh</th>
<th>NWFP</th>
<th>Balochistan</th>
<th>NA</th>
<th>AJK</th>
<th>FATA</th>
<th>ICT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Policy Process and Sector</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Federal - Inter-Provincial Coordination</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• xxx</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• National Education Policy (NEP) - Review and Implementation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• xxx</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Sector Planning – Scope, Format and Process</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• xxx</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Monitoring the Achievement of National Education Targets (District - Province - National)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• xxx</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Governance and Capacity</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Inter-Tier Roles &amp; Responsibilities and Sector-Wide Coordination</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• xxx</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Harmonizing Parallel Systems of Education (Government, Private, Religious)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• xxx</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Quality and Relevance</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• System of Quality Assurance (Schools, District, Province/Area, National)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• xxx</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Curriculum Reform</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• xxx</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• School Language Policy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• xxx</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Textbooks and Reading &amp; Learning Materials</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• xxx</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Teacher Education, Qualification and Effective Deployment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• xxx</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Achieving National Education</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Education Financing and Finance Management – Strategies, Standards and Targets</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• xxx</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Access and Equity – Strategies, Standards and Targets</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• xxx</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Quality ('Learning Outcome') – Strategies, Standards and Targets</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• xxx</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
235. In addition to the quarterly reports and reviews during the regular Inter-Provincial Education Ministers’ Conference the NEP review team in cooperation with the Provincial/Area coordinators and focal persons prepares and organizes an Annual National Education Conference as a public forum to account for progress of the education sector reform program and achievements of national education targets, and to review plan projections.

* * * * *